

CABINET SECRETARY FOR ECONOMY, JOBS AND FAIR WORK
Meeting with North, South and East Ayrshire Councils

<i>Date and Time of Engagement</i>	Date: Wednesday, 8 March 2017 Time: 11:15-12:00
<i>Where</i>	Scottish Parliament, Room M1.22
<i>Key Message</i>	The Scottish Government is committed to supporting regional economies to thrive in Scotland.
<i>Who</i>	South Ayrshire Council: Cllr Bill McIntosh, Eileen Howat Chief Executive & Lesley Bloomer, Executive Director North Ayrshire Council: Cllr Joe Cullinane, Elma Murray Chief Executive & Karen Yeomans Executive Director East Ayrshire Council: Cllr Elena Whitham, Alex McPhee, Depute Chief Executive & Chief Financial Officer Patrick Wiggins Ayrshire Growth Deal Project Lead
<i>Why</i>	You met with North, South and East Ayrshire Councils on 30 November 2016 to hear about the developing Ayrshire Growth deal. At this meeting you invited the three councils to be involved in Phase 2 of the Enterprise & Skills review. This meeting was organised in response to your letter of 16 December 2016 when you suggested you meet again in the New Year to hear an update on their progress.
<i>Official Support Required</i>	Oonagh Gil , DD Enterprise & Cities, Mobile; [REDACTED], Morag Watt , Region and City Partnerships Team, Tel: [REDACTED] [REDACTED] Mobile: [REDACTED] Jim Reid , Communications and Networks Director, Scottish Enterprise and Gordon McGuiness , Director of Industries & Enterprise Networks at Skills Development Scotland will also be in attendance.
<i>Briefing contents</i>	Annex A: Summary Page and agenda Annex B: Biographies Annex C: Regional Partnership Plans: Ayrshire Growth Deal Annex D: Enterprise & Skills Review Phase 2: Ayrshire Pathfinder Annex E: North Ayrshire Inclusive Growth Pilot Annex F: Ayrshire Economic Profile: March 2017 Annex G: Possible Call for Enterprise Area for Hunterston Annex H: Transport (Transport Summit/ Regional Transport Appraisal/Ardrossan Harbour) Annex I: Industrial Strategy in Scotland

On 30 November 2016 you met with North, South and East Ayrshire Councils to hear about the developing Ayrshire Growth deal. At this meeting you extended an invitation to the Ayrshires to engage in the Enterprise & Skills Review Phase 2. In your letter of 16 December 2016 you offered to meet again in the New Year to discuss progress.

Agenda

There is no formal agenda but running order is suggested as below:

11:15 Cabinet Secretary welcomes guests

11:20 Progress on the Pathfinder (E&S Review Phase 2) (Annex D)

You will invite the group to provide an update on this work

11:40 UKG Industrial Strategy (Annex I)

The group are disappointed that the Ayrshire Growth Deal has not yet been mentioned in the UKG budget announcements. They have written to both the Chancellor and the Secretary of State for Scotland expressing their disappointment and lobbying for a commitment to be made in the March 2017 Budget Announcement.

The Ayrshires are also writing to Greg Clark, Secretary of State for Business, Energy and Industrial Strategy to offer their services as a possible 'pathfinder' to progress the UKG Industrial Strategy. No further information on this has been provided but they have indicated they wish to use this time to share with you their initial ideas.

You may wish to advise the group that on [Monday] 23 January 2017 (the day the green paper was published) you wrote to Greg Clark to emphasise that SG are willing to play a positive and constructive role in improving our competitiveness and productivity, but that we need to see proposals for much stronger engagement on the developing strategy.

11:50 Ayrshire Transport Summit & Development of Regional Transport Appraisal (Annex H)

Transport Summit

The group may look to you for support on ministerial attendance at a proposed Transport Summit.

If asked you may wish to:

- Acknowledge that Transport Scotland have written to Stewart Turner of the Ayrshire Roads Alliance setting out agreement to support an Ayrshire Transport Summit, with the timing format and content to be agreed.
- State that the intention - at this time - is that this will be held at official level with no SG ministerial attendance – [to note: this approach was agreed with the Minister for Transport and Islands particularly given the sensitivities around the Arran ferry considerations.]
- Transport Scotland await feedback from the Ayrshire Roads Alliance and stand ready to provide support when requested.

Regional Transport Appraisal

The group may seek support for a Regional Transport Appraisal.

If asked you may wish to:

- Acknowledge that you are aware that Transport Scotland have held very preliminary discussions with the Ayrshire Growth Deal team on this concept which is generally supported
- Acknowledge that Transport Scotland look forward to working with them as they develop the scope and extent of any work and that we would expect that it will form an important role in any discussions around transport within an Ayrshire Growth Deal.

Ardrossan Harbour

This is not expected to be raised at this meeting. However, if pressed lines to take are as follows:

The report from our consultants was received on 28 February and Ministers (Mr Yousaf leading) will take their decision as soon as possible after that has been considered. Cab Sec will be aware that this was raised at Cabinet earlier this week. It would not be appropriate to comment any further on this at this meeting.

12:00 Meeting closes

South Ayrshire Council



Cllr Bill McIntosh was elected leader of South Ayrshire Council's Conservative and Unionist Group on Monday 25 January 2010 and Leader of South Ayrshire Council at a special Council meeting in February 2010.



Eileen Howat Chief Executive is head of the Council's paid – or operational – service with overall responsibility for the effective and efficient management of the organisation, working to make sure that our aims and policy objectives are successfully achieved.



Lesley Bloomer, Executive Director Economy, Neighbourhood & Environment for South Ayrshire council.

North Ayrshire Council



Cllr Joe Cullinane was elected as a Labour representative for Kilwinning at the May 2012 local government elections and was appointed Leader of North Ayrshire Council on 30 August 2016.



Elma Murray, Chief Executive since 2009 and is also the Director of the Improvement Service and a member of the Public Service Reform Board.



Karen Yeomans Exec Director (for Elma Murray) joined North Ayrshire Council in June 2012 and has been the Executive Director Economy and Communities at North Ayrshire Council since August 2014.

East Ayrshire Council



Councillor Elena Whitham is the SNP Councillor for the Irvine Valley, East Ayrshire Council (since October 2015). She attended Concordia University and has a BA in Journalism and Communications.



Alex McPhee, Depute Chief Executive & Chief Financial Officer for East Ayrshire council

Ayrshire Growth Deal Project Lead



Patrick Wiggins is the Chief Executive of Irvine Bay and the Ayrshire Growth Deal Project Lead

TOP LINE: Addressing regional economic inequalities so that all of Scotland's regions and communities can prosper is essential to increasing inclusive growth. The Scottish Government is committed to working in partnership across the public sector to boost economic growth outside the traditional growth areas of Scotland.

Background

1. The Ayrshire Economic Partnership (AEP) have developed an Ayrshire Regional Partnership Plan which they are calling an "Ayrshire Growth Deal" (AGD). The North, South and East Ayrshire local authorities are working in partnership with Scottish Enterprise, academia, the Ayrshire Chamber of Commerce, Scottish Futures Trust and Scottish Government to develop partnership plan proposals.
2. The plan aims to create a growing, innovative, smart, more productive and inclusive economy by developing Ayrshire's core strengths, particularly those of science, engineering and manufacturing and by ensuring communities benefit from economic growth.
3. Proposals focus on:
 - Space and Aerospace – Spaceport, National Aerospace Supply Chain Centre – at Prestwick
 - Pharma – working with GSK to secure the UK Medicines Manufacturing Innovation Centre
 - Manufacturing – building on their historical expertise and industrial land supply
 - Coastal Corridor – improving the tourism offer
4. A high level draft AGD proposal was submitted to both SG and the UKG [7 March 2016]. On 22 March 2017, the then Cabinet Secretary for Infrastructure, Investment and Cities responded positively. As the AGD has not yet been mentioned in any UKG budget announcements the partnership have written to both the Chancellor and the SoS for Scotland expressing their disappointment and lobbying for a commitment to be made in the March 2017 announcement.
5. SG continues to engage with the Ayrshire partners to discuss the on-going development of their proposals.
6. **No detailed discussions have taken place on the costs of these proposals nor has any financial commitment been made by either SG or UKG.**

Sensitivities

7. The Ayrshire leadership were disappointed that they did not get a mention in the UKG Autumn Statement, however, at his meeting with the three Ayrshire Leaders on 30 November, the Cabinet Secretary for Economy, Jobs and Fair Work committed to working with them to develop a more tailored approach for the region as a pilot/pathfinder for Phase 2 of the Enterprise and Skills Review.
8. We have been clear from the outset that there is no guarantee that the proposals developed will be funded by SG and we would encourage the Local Authorities to look to innovative funding mechanisms such as the Growth Accelerator Model and private sector partnerships to fund their aspirations. Scottish Futures Trust are fully engaged in the process to support the local authorities as their plans develop.

Cathy McIsaac, Region and City Partnerships Team, Tel: [REDACTED] | Mob: [REDACTED], 3 March 2017

Phase 1 of the Enterprise and Skills review recognised the different development challenges facing regions and committed to working with COSLA and local government to build on emerging opportunities to harness regional strengths and drive inclusive growth. The Phase 2 regional partnership project is exploring how, by tapping into local assets and opportunities along with national strengths and experience, we can effectively drive additional economic growth for Scotland.

We are working closely with North, South and East Ayrshire to develop an Ayrshire pathfinder as part of the Regional Partnership project. Deliverables from the regional partnership project will be:

- i. Reporting on outputs of the Ayrshires Inclusive Growth diagnostic, which systematically investigates the constraints to growth and inclusion in the region and identifies priority areas for unlocking regional inclusive growth.
- ii. Build understanding of the characteristics and lessons from emerging approaches to regional partnerships in Scotland, including the benefits and challenges associated with different approaches and options for engaging private sector perspectives.
- iii. Set-out options and considerations for refreshed and / or enhanced national agency engagement with regional partnerships.

A workshop involving the agencies, Ayrshire local authorities, COSLA and the Improvement Service was held on 31 January. This produced a common understanding on the project focus and agreement on realistic deliverables, taking into account local authority elections. Follow-up engagement is being scheduled including two workshops on 14 March, one to develop the inclusive growth tool and one to discuss work the Improvement Service have been commissioned by the local authorities to undertake in exploring options for structuring an Ayrshire Regional Partnership.

Work to develop proposals for an Ayrshire Growth Deal continues with the local authorities and other partners in parallel to the pathfinder work which is part of the Enterprise and Skills review phase 2 programme.

Karl Reilly
Strategic Engagement and Coordination
Tel. [REDACTED] | Blackberry [REDACTED]
March 2017

Inclusive growth is one of the 4 strategic priorities underpinning Scotland's Economic Strategy. It is about achieving sustainable economic growth that creates opportunities for all and distributes the dividends of increased prosperity fairly. North Ayrshire's (NA) aims and ambitions for economic and community development are strongly aligned with the Scottish Government's approach.

The Scottish Government has undertaken an 'inclusive growth pilot' in conjunction with North Ayrshire Council to assess what is holding back long-term sustainable inclusivity and growth in the Local Authority. This approach emphasises the need for a holistic view of growth, inclusion and sustainability drivers, combined with a local understanding of community challenges (i.e. a bottom-up approach), in order to unlock local inclusive growth.

This pilot is an assessment of *long-term prospects for transformational change* in NA - it looks at the legacy effects of industry decline from a social and economic perspective, and also potential areas for 'inclusive' growth in the region.

An initial list of constraints to local inclusive growth has been agreed with the Council. NA have also undertaken engagement with a range of groups to identify community and stakeholder priorities¹.

The next stage of this work will be prioritising constraints for action, based on the evidence from the diagnostic, stakeholder engagement and other factors (e.g. feasibility, time dimension), which NA intend to use to inform their Fair for All strategy, a community planning partnership strategy to address inequality.

The project forms part of wider analysis undertaken by the Office of the Chief Economic Adviser to assess inclusive growth prospects and opportunities for Scotland as a whole. In addition, the NA pilot is being upscaled to include the three Ayrshires as part of the regional partnership work.

Natalie Hemmings
Office of the Chief Economic Adviser
Ext [REDACTED]
March 2017

¹ Stakeholder groups consulted include Community Associations, Criminal Justice partners, Employability and Skills partners and clients, and North Ayrshire Network Tenants' Inspection Panel and Service Improvement Groups.

Population

Ayrshire's population was 370,600 in 2015, around 7 per cent of Scotland's population.

Labour Market (Oct 2015-Sept 2016)

	Ayrshire	Scotland	UK
Claimant count rate ³ (Jan 2017)	3.4%	2.3%	1.9%
Unemployment rate (16+)	8.0%	4.9%	5.0%
Youth Unemployment rate (16-24)	16.7%	13.4%	14.0%
Employment rate (16-64)	67.8%	72.8%	73.7%

Source: Claimant Count and Annual Population Survey

Earnings

Local Authority	Median weekly pay – Gross (£) Full-time employee jobs (Resident analysis) 2016
East Ayrshire	549.9
North Ayrshire	522.7
South Ayrshire	538.5
Scotland	536.6

Source: ASHE 2016

In addition, a higher proportion of *all* employees (18+), who work in the three Ayrshire earned below the Living Wage⁴ in 2016 (25.4 per cent in East Ayrshire, 27.7 per cent in North Ayrshire and 28.2 per cent in South Ayrshire, compared to 20.1 per cent in Scotland as a whole).

Employment by sector⁵

Manufacturing, Retail and Health sectors accounted for a higher proportion of employment in Ayrshire than in Scotland as a whole in 2015. Information & Communication, Financial & Insurance, Professional, Scientific & Technical and Business Administration & Support Services sectors accounted for a lower proportion of employment in Ayrshire than in Scotland as a whole.

Employment by sector 2016 (%)	Ayrshire	Scotland
Agriculture, forestry & fishing (A)	0.3%	0.4%
Mining, quarrying & utilities (B,D and E)	1.8%	2.8%
Manufacturing (C)	9.7%	7.3%
Construction (F)	5.0%	5.5%
Motor trades (Part G)	2.3%	1.8%
Wholesale (Part G)	3.0%	3.2%
Retail (Part G)	12.5%	9.9%
Transport & storage (inc postal) (H)	4.5%	4.2%
Accommodation & food services (I)	9.3%	8.3%
Information & communication (J)	0.8%	2.6%
Financial & insurance (K)	1.1%	3.5%
Property (L)	1.0%	1.4%
Professional, scientific & technical (M)	4.0%	6.7%
Business administration & support services (N)	5.7%	7.5%
Public administration & defence (O)	5.4%	6.1%
Education (P)	6.9%	7.8%
Health (Q)	22.1%	16.7%
Arts, entertainment, recreation & other services (R,S,T and U)	4.7%	4.3%

² Where possible, the Economic Profile for Ayrshire combines data of North Ayrshire, East Ayrshire and South Ayrshire Local Authorities.

³ The denominator used for the claimant count rate is the resident population aged 16-64. From 2015, universal credit (UC) has been available in some areas, replacing job seekers allowance (JSA) for some unemployed people. To derive the claimant count rate, JSA claimants are added to UC claimants not in employment. This will slightly overestimate unemployment, as some out of work UC claimants may be inactive.

⁴ The Living Wage is £8.45 outside London. This is different to the UK Government's National Living Wage of £7.20.

⁵ Figures exclude farm agriculture (SIC subclass 01000).

Qualifications

In 2015, a lower proportion of people in Ayrshire than in Scotland as a whole held a degree level qualification (19.7 per cent vs. 27.8 per cent). A higher proportion of people also held no qualifications (12.7 per cent vs. 9.2 per cent in Scotland as a whole).

GVA⁶

GVA data is produced for NUTS 3 regions, which are not aligned with Ayrshire's boundaries. However, GVA in East Ayrshire & North Ayrshire Mainland was £3,834 million in 2015, 3.0 per cent of total GVA in Scotland. GVA per head in the region was £15,200, lower than the average across Scotland (£23,685). GVA in South Ayrshire was £2,464 million, 1.9 per cent of total GVA in Scotland. GVA per head was £21,918, lower than the Scottish average.

Deprivation

According to the Scottish Index of Multiple Deprivation 2016, 21 per cent of the 502 Ayrshire's datazones were found in the 15 per cent most deprived datazones in Scotland. However, the level of deprivation varies considerably amongst the three Ayrshire:

- 22.1 per cent of East Ayrshire's 163 datazones were found in the 15 per cent most deprived datazones in Scotland.
- 27.4 per cent of North Ayrshire's 186 datazones were found in the 15 per cent most deprived datazones in Scotland.
- 12.4 per cent of South Ayrshire's 153 datazones were found in the 15 per cent most deprived datazones in Scotland.

Business performance

In 2015, the business start-up rates⁷ for 10,000 resident adults, at around 39 in Ayrshire, was lower than the rate in Scotland as a whole, at 49.

Small businesses⁸

In March 2016, small enterprises accounted for 44 per cent of employment in Ayrshire. This is higher than the proportion of employment in small businesses in Scotland as a whole, at 36 per cent.

Contact: Lisa Magnani, OCEA, [REDACTED]

⁶ GVA data for 2015 is provisional. GVA data is available at NUTS 3 level that not always matches the Local Authority boundaries.

⁷ Source: Business Demography 2015

⁸ Source: Businesses in Scotland 2016

Issue: Peel Ports Group has committed to a strategy of investment in Hunterston to diversify the port's offer in light of the loss of the coal contract as a result of the closure of Longannet power station and resultant job losses. One area of support the company is seeking, and which may be raised by North Ayrshire Council, is for an Enterprise Area (EA) at Hunterston to support the company's vision for a Hunterston PARC (Port and Resourcing Centre).

Background: Hunterston PARC (Port and Resourcing Centre) is a proposal for a multi-modal centre for exporting, importing, processing, recycling and distributing resources that support the economic growth of Scotland through: bulk handling cargoes; power generation; decommissioning oil & gas structures; recycling; and manufacturing through the use of heat and power generated on site. All recent calls for the creation of EAs, such as to support Machrihanish's bid to become the UK's first space port have been rejected, primarily due to EAs being only one strand of support available. EA status for the 4 designated sites is due to end in 2020 so any further designations would have a limited, short-term impact.

Top Lines – creation of another EA

- When EAs were established in 2012, all sites considered in detail were assessed against a range of criteria including local economic need, any development challenges which could constrain early benefit realisation and the opportunity to deliver jobs and support growth within the policy's then five year timeframe. (extended to 2020)
- There are no plans to establish an Enterprise Area at Hunterston, as the focus is on a small number of locations which, unlike the PARC's proposed spread of multi-sector businesses, have clear sectoral definitions that determine eligibility for support in areas such as rates relief and streamlined planning.
- When establishing EAs consideration was given to the need to ensure a reasonable geographic spread of sites and to make the most effective use of public sector resources by not significantly overlapping sites with other initiatives like TIF.
- North Ayrshire already benefits from an EA at Irvine (Life Science). The i3 Strategic Investment Campus Gateway Development at Irvine will support new industrial business space, road and utility expansion and will benefit from £1.675m from the £10m of capital resources from SG to support the delivery of capital projects for local economic development.
- Not immediately obvious how the multi-use proposal for a Hunterston PARC fits with any of the four EA sites: Life Sciences; Low Carbon / Renewables North & East; General Manufacturing / Growth Sectors.
- Of the 2 new sites designated since 2012, the West Lothian site was part of the response to mitigating the impact of the closure of the Halls of Broxburn (1,700 job losses on site with further losses in the supply chain), while BioCity in North Lanarkshire complemented other initiatives underway at the site including the MediCity Scotland initiative.

Top lines – wider business support

- Locations, such as Hunterston, are able to benefit, as appropriate, from existing forms of public sector support. EAs are only one part of our overall approach to economic growth and job creation.
- The Scottish Government is committed to helping all types of businesses to grow and is working to ensure Scotland is the best place to do business.
- Our support includes publicly funded business support, support for exporting, reducing the burden of taxation and regulation, improving access to finance, and strengthening innovation and entrepreneurship.
- We are delivering the most competitive business tax environment anywhere in the UK with a business rates relief package worth an estimated £573 million in 2016-17.

Contact: Walter McConnachie

Ext: 

Transport Summit

Transport Scotland have written to Stewart Turner of the Ayrshire Roads Alliance setting out agreement to support an Ayrshire Transport Summit, with the timing format and content to be agreed. The intention is this will be held at official level with no SG ministerial attendance – an approach that was agreed with the Minister for Transport and Islands particularly given the sensitivities around the Arran ferry considerations. Transport Scotland await feedback from the Ayrshire Roads Alliance and stand ready to provide support when requested.

Alison Irvine Transport Scotland Tel 0141 272 7590 | Blackberry 07799 047700

Regional Transport Appraisal

Transport Scotland have held very preliminary discussions with the Ayrshire Growth Deal team on this concept, which is generally supported and look forward to working with them as they develop the scope and extent of any work. We would expect that it will form an important role in any discussions around transport within an Ayrshire Growth Deal.

Alison Irvine Transport Scotland Tel 0141 272 7590 | Blackberry 07799 047700

Ardrossan Harbour

Line to Take: The report from our consultants was received on 28 February and Ministers (Mr Yousaf leading) will take their decision as soon as possible after that has been considered. Cab Sec will be aware that this was raised at Cabinet earlier this week. It would not be appropriate to comment any further on this at this meeting.

Peel Ports owns and operates the ferry terminal currently used as the mainland port for the lifeline services to Arran.

Ministers had set up a task force to take forward the development of the terminal to accommodate the new vessel being constructed at Fergusons on the Clyde and generally improve the passenger experience in line with the £30m improvements being undertaken by CMAL at Brodick.

Associated British Ports, the owners of Troon Port, approached Ministers speculatively with an alternative proposal to use their Ro-Ro facility. Ministers announced in November 2016 that they would undertake an impartial study looking at the merits of the two options. Peel are working with North Ayrshire Council on a joint proposal for Ardrossan and have heavily stressed the socio-economic case for retaining the port at this location.

The report was received on 28 February and Mr Yousaf has mentioned privately to Arran representatives that he is keen to make an announcement by mid-march or sooner if possible.

Val Ferguson, Ports Policy Adviser, [REDACTED]

INDUSTRIAL STRATEGY IN SCOTLAND

Top Lines

- We have a clear strategic approach to industrial policy in Scotland, including the overarching framework provided by our Economic Strategy, the reforms and actions within our Manufacturing Action Plan and our comprehensive review programme in Scotland in support of our ambitions for a sustainable and inclusive economy.
- This framework has the flexibility to deal with specific issues as they arise, as evidenced by our willingness to intervene in key strategic sectors such as steel and a viable future for the Lochaber aluminium plant.
- We also have forward-looking industrial strategies for sectors that help deliver the priorities identified within Scotland's Economic Strategy, developed and delivered by the business-led Industry Leadership Groups
- We are developing proposals for the National Manufacturing Institute for Scotland (NMIS), which has the potential to support step-changes in the efficiency and productivity of Scotland's manufacturing sector. Decisions on its establishment and location(s) will depend on the business case, which will be published later this year. Wherever the constituent parts of the Institute are located we are determined it will be for the benefit for the whole of Scotland.

Background

In Scotland, we have an overarching framework for inclusive, and sustainable, economic development in the Scottish Economic Strategy, supported by the suite of reforms within our manufacturing action plan, trade & investment strategy, CAN DO strategy and reviews of innovation support and enterprise and skills agencies. This suite of work together comprise our industrial strategy, and provides a cohesive, and credible framework for action: our approach has been generally well-received.

In addition, we have sectoral strategies that are developed and delivered by the Industry Leadership Groups (ILGs – groups comprised of leading business figures and senior representatives from the public sector and key stakeholders). These are forward-looking industrial strategies for their sectors that help deliver the priorities identified within Scotland's Economic Strategy. ILGs also play a key part in enabling us to develop consensus and partnership around our strategic approach to support for industry.

In contrast, the UK has lacked a clear strategic direction for quite some time. On 23 January 2017 the UK Government published the consultation document 'Building our Industrial Strategy' as part of the process of developing a new UK industrial strategy. The consultation is open to all to respond until 17 April 2017.

The consultation is grouped around ten 'pillars': investing in science, research & innovation; upgrading infrastructure; improving procurement; delivering affordable energy & clean growth; driving growth across the whole country; developing skills; supporting businesses to start & grow; encouraging trade & inward investment; cultivating world-leading sectors; and creating the right local institutions. The ten 'pillars' in the paper resonate closely with existing Scottish Government priorities and action. We are liaising with policy interests across Government on different aspects of the strategy and will provide advice on this in due course.

There was a lack of consultation from the UK government in the development of the paper, although page 23 of the document contains a proposal to establish a Ministerial Forum on Industrial Strategy with each of the devolved administrations to ensure synergies between devolved and reserved areas. We will also provide advice to Ministers on this in due course. Without genuine engagement from the UK Government and recognition that the Scottish Government is not just another consultee we will not be able to realise maximum economic benefit for Scotland and the UK.

The Cabinet Secretary for Economy, Jobs & Fair Work wrote to Greg Clark, Secretary of State for Business, Energy and Industrial Strategy, on Monday 23 January (the day the green paper was published) to emphasise that we are willing to play a positive and constructive role in improving our competitiveness and productivity, but that we need to see proposals for much stronger engagement on the developing strategy.

Elisabeth Stark, Manufacturing & Construction team, February 2017