

- The minutes from the meeting held between Humza Yousaf MSP and Martin Dorchester on 29 March 2017.
- All correspondence before and after this meeting relating to the meeting.

From: Martin Dorchester [mailto:martin.dorchester@]
Sent: 21 February 2017 11:46
To: Hadfield RD (Richard); Nicholls J (John) (TRANS); Laidlaw GM (Graham) TS Officials
Subject: Minister

Chaps

Just FYI I have a meeting with Mr Yousaf on Thursday.

[.....

.....]

Kind regards

Martin

Sent from my iPhone



David MacBrayne

Serving Scotland's Islands

From: Nicholls J (John) (TRANS)
Sent: Tuesday, 21 February 2017 14:48
To: Hadfield RD (Richard); Laidlaw GM (Graham)
Subject: RE: Minister

Graham, Richard

News to me. Any idea what this is about?

John

From: Hadfield RD (Richard)
Sent: 22 February 2017 08:49
To: Nicholls J (John) (TRANS); Laidlaw GM (Graham)
Subject: Re: Minister

I contacted Martin - Mr Y is buying him lunch! According to Martin, Minister wants to talk about CMAL, rail bids, TS and Martin's discussions with Keith Brown (which are not about ferries.

Richard

Sent from my BlackBerry 10 smartphone.

On 14 Mar 2017, at 16:52, transportminister@[REDACTED] wrote:

Good afternoon Mr Dorchester

Due to Parliamentary business, Mr Yousaf is unable to meet with you on Tuesday 21 March. Please accept my apologies for any inconvenience this may cause.

I can however offer Wednesday 29th March 14:00- 15:00

Feel free to suggest an alternative if the above date isn't suitable.

Thanks

[REDACTED]
Deputy Private Secretary to the Cabinet Secretary for Rural Economy and Connectivity

From: Martin Dorchester [mailto:martin.dorchester@[REDACTED]]

Sent: 14 March 2017 18:50

To: Minister for Transport and the Islands

Subject: Re: Meeting on 21 March

Mariella

29th works for me as I am in Edinburgh. I chair an organisation called Firstport which provides funding to social entrepreneurs and enterprises. Our Edinburgh office is nearby if the minister fancies coming sling to see what we do and have a sandwich? Happy to come to Holyrood otherwise.

Martin

Sent from my iPhone

From: Hadfield RD (Richard)

Sent: 17 March 2017 14:07

To: Minister for Transport and the Islands; Laidlaw GM (Graham); Nicholls J (John) (TRANS)

Subject: Meeting with Martin Dorchester, CalMac

Hi Mariella

I note briefing due next Wednesday. So we can give Mr Yousaf what he needs for this meeting and ensure appropriate official support, could you let us know what the meeting is about please?

Thanks
Richard

From: Nicholls J (John) (TRANS)
Sent: Friday, 17 March 2017 14:26
To: Hadfield RD (Richard); Laidlaw GM (Graham)

Subject: RE: Meeting with Martin Dorchester, CalMac

Thanks Richard, I was about to ask the same question. For info, I am due to meet Martin on 31 March, at his request, for a 1:1.

From: Hadfield RD (Richard)
Sent: 17 March 2017 15:00
To: Nicholls J (John) (TRANS); Laidlaw GM (Graham)

Subject: Re: Meeting with Martin Dorchester, CalMac

I know I could have asked Martin directly, and will do so, but that's not really the point!

Richard

Sent from my BlackBerry 10 smartphone.

From: [REDACTED] **On Behalf Of** Minister for Transport and the Islands
Sent: 17 March 2017 17:24
To: Hadfield RD (Richard); Minister for Transport and the Islands; Laidlaw GM (Graham); Nicholls J (John) (TRANS)

Subject: RE: Meeting with Martin Dorchester, CalMac

It was originally scheduled for 21st March, I'm not clear if it's a regular catch up or whether it was to be private. I'll ask Mr Yousaf on Monday when I see him.

Thanks

[REDACTED]
 Deputy Private Secretary to the Cabinet Secretary for Rural Economy and Connectivity

From: Hadfield RD (Richard)
Sent: 21 March 2017 09:25
To: Minister for Transport and the Islands; Laidlaw GM (Graham); Nicholls J (John) (TRANS)

Subject: RE: Meeting with Martin Dorchester, CalMac

Hi Mariella

Were you able to ask Mr Yousaf about this yesterday?

Thanks
 Richard

From: [REDACTED] **On Behalf Of** Minister for Transport and the Islands
Sent: 21 March 2017 16:28
To: Hadfield RD (Richard); Minister for Transport and the Islands; Laidlaw GM (Graham); Nicholls J (John) (TRANS)

Subject: RE: Meeting with Martin Dorchester, CalMac

Richard

This is to be a private catch up. Mr Yousaf comments that he would find it helpful to know the view of David McBrayne group regarding the policy review, do we have that?

Grateful if you could provide a short briefing if appropriate.

Thanks

[REDACTED]
 Deputy Private Secretary to the Cabinet Secretary for Rural Economy and Connectivity

From: Hadfield RD (Richard)
Sent: 21 March 2017 18:28
To: Minister for Transport and the Islands; Laidlaw GM (Graham); Nicholls J (John) (TRANS)

Subject: RE: Meeting with Martin Dorchester, CalMac

Mariella

Thanks, that is a helpful steer. I will do a quick note for you tomorrow.

Regards
 Richard

From: Hadfield RD (Richard)
Sent: 22 March 2017 16:08
To: Nicholls J (John) (TRANS); Laidlaw GM (Graham)
Cc: Malone A (Alan)
Subject: FW: Meeting with Martin Dorchester, CalMac
Importance: High

John
 Graham

Apologies for forwarding this late on – if you have any quick comments but are broadly content then I will put this up tonight (I am here until 1730/45).

Otherwise I am sure I can get away with putting it up tomorrow!

Richard

From: Laidlaw GM (Graham)
Sent: 22 March 2017 16:22
To: Hadfield RD (Richard); Nicholls J (John) (TRANS)
Cc: Malone A (Alan)
Subject: Re: Meeting with Martin Dorchester, CalMac

Richard

Very comprehensive!

[.....

.....]

Other than that no further comments.

Thanks
 Graham

Sent from my BlackBerry 10 smartphone.

From: Nicholls J (John) (TRANS)
Sent: 22 March 2017 16:28
To: Laidlaw GM (Graham); Hadfield RD (Richard)
Cc: Malone A (Alan)
Subject: RE: Meeting with Martin Dorchester, CalMac

Fine thanks. Have we told DML they won't be on the Project Board?

From: Hadfield RD (Richard)
Sent: 22 March 2017 16:50
To: Nicholls J (John) (TRANS); Laidlaw GM (Graham)
Cc: Malone A (Alan)
Subject: RE: Meeting with Martin Dorchester, CalMac

If I haven't already told Martin then I will do so when I see him tomorrow. And I am seeing David McGibbon on Tuesday so will tell him too.

Flipside of that is that I will repeat previous question about how & how often they want us to engage with them.

Richard

From: Hadfield RD (Richard)
Sent: 22 March 2017 17:11
To: Minister for Transport and the Islands
Cc: Laidlaw GM (Graham); Nicholls J (John) (TRANS); Malone A (Alan)
Subject: RE: Meeting with Martin Dorchester, CalMac

Mariella

Please see attached note as requested.

Regards
 Richard

----- Attachment -----

Ferries Procurement Policy Review

Views of / input from David MacBrayne Ltd (DML)

Summary

TS officials have had a number of meetings with the DML Board and executives regarding the review including a specially convened session on 10 February 2017 attended by John Nicholls, Alan Malone and Richard Hadfield.

The key points coming out of those exchanges are:

- The desire of DML Board members and execs to be involved in the review
- [.....]
-]

Role of DML in the review

DML have offered to provide a member of the TS Project Board and also project support. We have considered this but had to turn it down because:

(a) we are still in a live procurement for Gourock-Dunoon and CalMac are one of the bidders;

(b) the review's outcome is unknown and may result in future procurements for Northern Isles and CHFS.

Therefore DML/CalMac would have a conflict of interest and, in the case of the Gourock-Dunoon exercise, this would be reasonable grounds for a valid complaint.

[.....
.....]

Terms of Reference

[.....]. His comments were:

- [.....]
-]

We will continue to engage with DML as the review progresses; none of these comments strike us as revealing unexpected difficulties for the review.

Continuity of service

You have stated the importance of maintaining ferry services during the review.

- We are working with DML on a contract extension for Argyll Ferries' Gourock-Dunoon contract (we have agreed the principles of a financial basecase for the further 9 months but await a detailed proposal);
- [.

.]

From: Martin Dorchester [mailto:martin.dorchester@]
Sent: 29 March 2017 09:50
To: Hadfield RD (Richard)
Cc: David McGibbon; Robbie Drummond
Subject: Re: Minister at REC Committee this AM

Richard
 I would appreciate any heads up before I see him at 2.
 Martin

Sent from my iPhone

On 29 Mar 2017, at 09:35, Richard.Hadfield@ wrote:

David

I mentioned that Mr Yousaf was due to give evidence to the Rural Economy and Connectivity Committee on ferries, focusing on the policy review (though potentially picking up some of the lines of questioning from their session with Martin and Robbie). What I hadn't realised is that the session is this morning, I don't know what time he is due on as there is quite a busy agenda. I will be trying to listen in.

Regards
 Richard

Sent from my BlackBerry 10 smartphone.

REASONS FOR NOT PROVIDING INFORMATION

Exemptions apply, subject to the public interest tests.

Section 30(b)(ii)

The Section 30(b)(ii) exemptions applies to some of the information because the release of certain exchanges of views between Transport Scotland officials. This includes but not exclusive to the process of the Ferries Procurement Review which is curently on-going.

Public interest test

We recognise that there is a public interest in disclosing information as part of open and transparent government. We believe that it is important to allow free and frank exchange of views to take without being put off if sensitive information / comments were released.

We consider, therefore, on balance, that the public interest in release is outweighed by that in favour of upholding the exemption. In respect of the Ferries Procurement Review, this is expected to complete Autumn 2018 after which the outcome will be made clear in due course.