


BRIEFING – MR SWINNEY MEETING WITH JAMES WESTHEAD (TEACH FIRST) AND PETER DUNCAN

Date and Time of Engagement	10 January 2017, 14:30 – 15:15
Where	The Scottish Parliament
Who	<p>James Westhead – Executive Director, External Relations Peter Duncan – Managing Director, Message Matters (Edinburgh based PR firm employed by Teach First. Peter has been supporting Teach First to understand the education landscape in Scotland for the purpose of developing a bespoke Teach for Scotland programme)</p> <p>Prof Lesley Sawers – Equality and Human Rights Commissioner for Scotland is now advising Teach First and gives her apologies for this meeting.</p>
What	A meeting to hear more about the work of Teach First and whether the organisation could play a role in the context of Scottish Education.
Why	Teach First have long held ambitions of exporting their model of Initial Teacher Education to Scotland and so previous Cabinet Secretaries for Education have met with them to discuss their approach. <u>This meeting follows a recent meeting that the First Minister had with Paul Drechsler, CBE, Chair of Board of Trustees of Teach First which was on 21 September 2016.</u>
Key Purpose / Message	<p>We are supporting the development of a package of new and innovative routes into initial teacher education to boost recruitment in hard to fill subjects and in some parts of the country where recruitment is more difficult. These new routes will be in place by August 2017.</p> <p>We are also committed to bringing forward a further new route to teaching designed to attract the most talented graduates to the profession.</p>
Top Facts / Figures	We are establishing 11 new routes to teaching, recruiting over 200 students supported by over £1M of SG investment.
Sensitivities	None – although note Teach First's recruitment of a Scottish PR firm and engagement of Lesley Sawers.
Media Handling	None
Official Support	Stuart Robb Office: 0131 2441662 - Mob: 

<i>Annexes</i>	Annex A – Background - Teach First Annex B – Proposal from Teach First Annex C – Scottish Challenges in Teacher Recruitment Annex D – Impact of Teach First
-----------------------	--

BACKGROUND - TEACH FIRST

1. Teach First is an independent educational charity founded in 2002 and its stated vision is that no child's educational success should be limited by his or her socio-economic background. Teach First recruits graduates (2.1 degree or above), who are then known as 'participants', to teach full-time in low-performing schools in the most impoverished communities. The programme consists of participants undertaking a two-year Leadership Development Programme (LDP) within which they achieve a PGCE with Qualified Teacher Status (QTS) (at the end of the first year) and wider skills in leadership.
2. The major focus of the programme is on developing the leadership potential and abilities of its graduates with the intention of making them stand out in their future careers; whether that career is in teaching or in management and/or other roles in business and/or the community. Graduates receive tutoring in learning to praise and leading with authority with the intention of being able to utilise these skills both in the classroom and in business.
3. When a graduate is recruited, they are asked to commit to working towards and gaining a PGCE (in the first year) and then the wider requirements of the LDP for the following and subsequent years. Following completion of the two-year LDP, participants are referred to as ambassadors and may choose to remain in teaching (often going onto leadership positions) or to go on to tackle similar problems in the wider education system, Government or the third sector. Around two-thirds of participants stay in teaching for a third year, and over half have remained in teaching for the long term since 2003.

Teach First in Scotland

4. Ministers, officials and the General Teaching Council for Scotland have consistently indicated that we are happy to discuss the potential for the involvement of Teach First in Scotland as long as teacher quality is maintained and the proposed model meets Scottish needs. In 'Delivering Excellence and Equity in Scottish Education – a Delivery Plan for Scotland' (and now in the 2017 NIF) we state that we will develop a new route to teaching which is focused on getting high-quality graduates "*the brightest and the best*" into priority subjects and areas.
5. This will be taken forward separately to the package of proposals from the Scottish Council of Deans announced on 30 November **and we will tender for a new programme in the first quarter of 2017**. We are not ready to issue this and separate advice will follow. It is likely any new route would require to contain both a challenging academic qualification, possibly at masters level, with high quality school experiences that will provide the student with a particularly rich experience of ITE. This is of clear interest to Teach First who may be in a position to bid for this work particularly if they find a Scottish university partner and this was the main topic of discussion when they met FM in September. Challenges that need to be addressed:

- Teach First was developed to address the problem of recruiting teachers to schools in deprived, inner-city schools. We do not experience the same difficulty.
- England has pay scales and terms and conditions for unqualified teachers (which Teach First teachers are until gaining a PGCE qualification at the end of their first year). In effect, their students are receiving a salary whilst studying towards a PGCE qualification. Similar arrangements would be difficult to be applied in Scotland although arguably we have moved some way towards this by indicating support for the accelerated routes to teaching to be offered by Strathclyde and Dundee through which students will earn a wage much earlier than previously possible in Scotland.
- If Teach First do succeed in devising a model that addresses Scottish circumstances then there is the question of affordability and value for money in terms of retention and teacher effectiveness.
- Relations across the sector – in addition to the reference, above, to the GTCS, there is likely to be continued resistance to Teach First from the teacher unions (concerned about salary and quality of graduates) and the universities (who would see Teach First as a competitor). Many of the institutional barriers that Teach First face in respect of entering the Scottish market would be overcome if they could agree a partnership approach with a Scottish university – **they do not appear to have achieved this as yet.**

PROPOSAL FROM TEACH FIRST

In advance of this meeting Teach First have sent a proposal (follows below) for a new route to teaching in Scotland. Although clearly a first draft Teach First's proposal (Teach for Scotland) retains some key elements of their traditional model of teacher education including a focus on disadvantaged schools, a two year school based training programme with leadership development at its core. They are clearly attempting to cover a number of policy priorities in their approach including closing the attainment gap and are also considering how their programme could help with teacher shortages. Unsurprisingly there is no indication of what it would cost to establish this programme or the per-head student cost which is traditionally high in teach first models.

It is suggested this is an opportunity to hear more about their Teach First proposal while keeping in mind our public commitment to go to tender on the '*brightest and best*' route early in 2017. In discussing this with Teach First it may be worth asking about:

- Costs – how much per student?
- Retention – will they prevent graduates of the programme from moving out of teaching?
- Relations with Scottish universities/GTCS/Unions/employers – have they had discussions with them?
- Numbers – how many students would they need for a cohort to be viable?

LINES TO TAKE

- **We are committed to maintaining teaching in Scotland as a graduate profession and we will ensure schools in Scotland are staffed by committed and high quality teachers.**
- **This will however not stifle our ambition and we are open to fresh approaches to help deliver excellence and equity in Scottish Education. Happy to hear more about the proposal that was sent in advance of this meeting.**
- **We are currently considering a new route to teaching in Scotland designed to be attractive to the very best graduates and are open to an approach from Teach First. We will shortly set out the tendering process and will keep Teach First involved.**

Teach for Scotland

Working together

A bespoke programme for Scotland

About Teach for Scotland

Scotland is renowned for its world-class education system, but like many other countries around the world, rich and poor, it faces significant challenges in overcoming educational inequality in attainment.

Teach for All is a global network, across 40 countries including Germany, Sweden, and Denmark, with the aim of expanding educational opportunity. Teach for All network partners are independent organisations that share a common mission and a commitment to shared core values when working together across borders.

The key mission throughout our country-bespoke models across the globe is to tackle educational inequality in schools and across society. Each model trains and supports people with leadership potential to become inspirational teachers in the primary and secondary schools facing the greatest challenges and helping them become leaders who continue to make a difference across schools, education and wider society. These teachers work with, and learn from, existing staff to increase the attainment and aspirations of pupils from low income backgrounds, improving their ability to access further and higher education or employment.

The Scottish Government has placed tackling inequity in educational outcomes at the heart of its policy programme, introducing new initiatives including the National Improvement Framework, the Scottish Attainment Challenge, and the national Delivery Plan for Scottish education. As part of this, the Scottish Government has committed to introducing a range of new routes into teaching.

Scotland's education system is high quality and has the ambition to be world-class, sustained by the commitment of teachers across Scotland to get it right for every child, and the resolution of the Scottish Government and Scottish Parliament to raise attainment for all. However, a growing gap in educational attainment between those from low incomes and their wealthier peers, a shortage of teachers particularly in rural areas and specifically in STEM subjects, and heavy workloads for teachers all pose significant challenges to success.

Working together with Scotland's teachers, local authorities, professional teaching bodies, colleges and universities and the Scottish Government, we believe we can help. That is why we are proposing a bespoke Teach for Scotland programme, designed specifically in Scotland, for Scotland, rolling out from summer 2018.

A bespoke programme for Scotland

Like other Teach for All programmes across the world, our proposed programme for Scotland is bespoke, offering a framework to help address challenges specific to Scotland and in line with the character and pedigree of the Scottish education system. The purpose of the programme is to complement, not compete with, existing initiatives and provide an additional route into teaching to coincide with the Scottish Government's desire to explore new and innovative provision in this regard, in particular developing leadership pipelines and capacity.

We are proposing a two-year qualification - a Postgraduate Diploma in Education (PGDE). Working closely with a university partner(s) it will aim to create a rigorous research literate cohort of teachers specifically focused on improving outcomes for pupils in low income areas. At its heart, will be leadership within teaching and learning and a focus on developing leaders in schools and wider system.

We want to offer a truly world class programme, befitting of Scottish education, by attracting the highest calibre of applicants who actively want to tackle educational inequality in schools where they are most needed and demonstrating a commitment to the ethos of Scottish education.

Our programme will provide the Scottish Government, the Chief Attainment Advisor, local authorities, local attainment advisors and schools with a flexible framework to target areas with the greatest need. We feel we can make the most impact in areas facing the greatest challenge in deprivation and attainment such as Challenge Authorities. This could be supplemented with a weighted eligibility framework which also included the following criteria:

- Areas of geographic isolation
- Areas facing a shortage of teachers in STEM subjects
- Areas facing general teacher shortages

To provide advice and support the delivery of a Teach for Scotland programme, we would propose establishing an advisory group comprising the Scottish Government, Education Scotland, university partners, the GTCS, Attainment Advisors and teachers. Participants will work towards General Teaching Council Scotland accreditation in their first year, and play a full role in ensuring the highest possible standards are maintained.

The Training

The Teach for Scotland programme curriculum, designed for Scotland in partnership between Teach for Scotland, Education Scotland, the partner university and the Chief Attainment Advisor, combines an intensive and extensive Scottish Summer Institute, school based on-the-job learning which will provide a flow of talented and motivated people into those Scottish classrooms with the greatest need, and continued high-quality training and support. Throughout the programme, participants will experience a phased increase of responsibility and leadership in the classroom across their first three terms. They would take on increasing accountability, supported by an experienced teacher and mentor to maintain the highest possible standards.

The Scottish Summer Institute would be focused on providing Teach for Scotland participants with a strong grounding in the key areas of classroom management, assessment and planning, as well as the core tenets of Scottish education including the Curriculum for Excellence and the National Improvement Framework. While we absolutely do not suggest these elements alone are sufficient for great teaching, the experience of our programmes around the world and leading systems such as Singapore and Ontario shows the importance of sequencing curriculum and training and that great teaching is less likely without these crucial elements in place.

The training provided at the Scottish Summer Institute provides extensive opportunities for participants to practise and receive feedback, as well as learn from, and observe, experienced Scottish teachers. This component of the institute would be overseen by the partner university, school, the GTCS and our Teach for Scotland experts.

Support

Ensuring the highest possible standards in teaching are achieved is of paramount importance for our programmes across the globe, as only through high quality teaching and leadership can we meaningfully improve educational attainment for the most disadvantaged. Therefore, each participant will have a comprehensive support structure around them. An expert figure - a Participant Development Lead (PDL) - will orchestrate the highest quality support from University subject tutors, an in-school mentor and providing their own training on teaching skills, techniques, leadership and pedagogy.

Key requirements for our Teach for Scotland programme

To receive a Teach for Scotland participant, a school must confirm that they can meet the following requirements:

- Employ participants as members of staff at the school for the period of their placement, subject to the same statutory employment regulations as all other members of staff.
- Participants are paid in accordance with their level of responsibility, which is increased to full pay by the end of the programme.
- Appoint/select an experienced teacher to act as a mentor for the participant, liaising with the participants Participant Development Lead to oversee their progress in a classroom setting.
- Participants must be provided with a significant leadership opportunity in their first year, rising to an opportunity to act as the lead class teacher by the end of their first year.

SCOTTISH CHALLENGES IN TEACHER RECRUITMENT

- Teach First was established to address the specific problem of recruitment of teachers to schools in inner-city areas of deprivation in England. The situation in Scotland is different and we currently face teacher recruitment challenges in rural areas and priority subjects in secondary schools including with Chemistry, Physics, Maths, Home Economics, Technological Education, Business Education and Computing.

How we are tackling these challenges

- Increasing student teacher intake targets for the fifth year in a row and are setting targets to train teachers in the subjects where they are needed most.
- Over £2 million funding is being made available to train an extra 260 teachers in 2016-17 and the 2017-18 target is 3,861, a 10% increase on 16-17.
- Delivering a successful recruitment campaign with an initial focus on STEM subjects, and we will build on this with a refreshed campaign due to commence in February 2017.
- Working with COSLA we have improved our teacher workforce planning arrangements including how to make best use of local intelligence.
- We have committed £400,000 from the Transition Training Fund to be used to enable 20 oil and gas workers to bring their skills and expertise into STEM teaching in the Aberdeen area.
- Supporting distance learning teacher education programmes, which allow council employees to retrain as teachers while staying in work.
- We are also supporting the development of 11 new routes to teaching with backed by £1M of funding drawn from the Scottish Attainment challenge. It is expected over 200 teachers will be recruited into the new routes from August 2017.

New Routes Into Teaching

- On 6 July you wrote to the Scottish Teacher Education Committee (STEC), now the Scottish Council of Deans of Education (SCDE), to request that they work together to develop new and innovative routes to teaching that focused on addressing the regional and subject shortages faced by Scotland's schools. The package of new routes was announced on 30 November.
- Teach First have had sight of your initial letter and approached the University of Strathclyde to ask whether they would enter into a partnership with them. We understand this was declined and the universities that form the Scottish Council of Deans of Education and indeed the GTCS do not favour the Teach First approach.

Performance

In 2010 Teach First (TF) commissioned the University of Manchester to explore the impact of TF teachers in their classrooms and schools. The study considered their impact on classroom practice, leadership and pupil achievement. The University used a mixture of methods including analysing data and conducting interviews in 87 TF schools and 87 comparable secondary schools and with 848 teachers across England.

The report found overall that whilst no single element of the study demonstrated conclusively that TF teachers have a positive impact in classrooms, taking all the elements of analysis together the evidence was compelling. The University found:

- Quantitative analysis shows positive pupil outcomes in TF schools compared to comparator schools;
- Quantitative analysis shows that having a larger number of TF teachers in the school is related to more positive outcomes;
- Classroom observation data shows that TF teachers are effective classroom practitioners
- Survey data shows that TF teachers believe that they can make a difference to pupils and head teacher surveys support this;
- Survey data indicate that TF teachers are leaders in and outside their classrooms.

Retention of teachers

In July 2016 the National College for Teaching and Leadership published a report which gives some initial estimates of teacher retention in the state-funded teaching workforce in England by teacher training route, as a proportion of all those first registering on a ITE course. The report illustrates how this varies by region and teacher characteristics. The data gives lower and upper bound retention rate estimates, reflecting uncertainty inherent in the data.

The report drew out five key findings and concluded that dropout rates of new teachers vary by ITE route.

For the Teach First route, the study said it has very high two year retention rates but thereafter their retention is poorer than other graduate routes. Table 1 (below) of the report provides these lower bound estimates by route and expected Qualified Teacher year for full-time trainees only.

Table 1: Lower bound estimates of retention for Teach First

Year	Cohort	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3
2010	502	82%	55%	46%
2011	568	84%	57%	48%
2012	765	80%	57%	43%
2013	1001	83%	55%	
2014	1274	73%		

Teach First and Global network

In 2007, Teach First collaborated with Teach for America and created Teach for All. Teach for All is a global network of independent social enterprises that work to expand educational opportunity in their nations. The network of countries involved is:

- Argentina
- Armenia
- Australia
- Austria
- Bangladesh
- Belgium
- Brazil
- Bulgaria
- Chile
- China
- Colombia
- Denmark
- Ecuador
- Estonia
- France
- Germany
- Ghana
- Haiti
- India
- Lebanon
- Malaysia
- Mexico
- New Zealand
- Panama
- Peru
- Philippines
- Qatar
- Romania
- Slovakia (Slovak Republic)
- Spain
- Sweden
- Thailand
- United Kingdom
- United States

