

Equally Safe – Consultation on a Draft Delivery Plan 2017-21

Analysis of responses

November 2017

Contents

Executive Summary	3
Introduction.....	8
Recurring themes raised throughout the consultation	10
Priority 1 - Scottish society embraces equality and mutual respect, and rejects all forms of violence against women and girls	20
Priority 2: Women and girls thrive as equal citizens: socially, culturally, economically and politically	33
Priority 3: Interventions are early and effective, preventing violence and maximising the safety and wellbeing of women, children and young people	45
Priority 4: Men desist from all forms of violence against women and girls and perpetrators of such violence receive a robust and effective response	59
Cross Cutting Actions.....	67
Performance Framework	78
How organisations can contribute.....	83
How the experiences and views of the women, children and young people were included in organisations' consultation responses	88
Annex 1 – Tables	91
Annex 2 – List of organisations who responded.....	109

Executive Summary

Introduction

The Scottish Government Consultation on the draft Delivery Plan for 'Equally Safe: Scotland's strategy for preventing and eradicating violence against women and girls' ran from 23 March 2017 to 30 June 2017. There were 89 responses: 77 from organisations and 12 from individuals. This summarises the analysis of responses.

Recurring themes

Most respondents were generally supportive of the Delivery Plan and what it was trying to achieve (between 59% and 67% agreed with the actions listed). However respondents suggested a number of ways to improve the Delivery Plan. When asked what was missing, many of the same themes recurred:

- Who it should cover – More emphasis on intersectionality / additional vulnerabilities faced by women with certain protected characteristics; greater emphasis on children, and clarity that both boys and girls are covered by the plan.
- What it should cover – Criticism that the plan focussed too much on domestic abuse, rather than the full spectrum of violence against women. In particular it was felt that stronger actions were required around commercial sexual exploitation (CSE), whilst childhood sexual abuse and stalking were not mentioned at all.
- Greater need for engagement and partnership working. Too often the SG alone was listed in the “who” column for taking actions forward.
- Delivery of the plan – Need: management of the delivery plan and ensuring that action happens at a local level; sustained funding and resources; linking the delivery plan to other SG policies, strategies and UN conventions; monitoring and evaluation.
- Wording of the plan – actions could be stronger and clearer, and more medium and long term actions could be included.

Priority 1 - Scottish society embraces equality and mutual respect, and rejects all forms of violence against women and girls

Nearly two-thirds (65%) of respondents agreed that the actions listed under priority one were the right ones, 12% disagreed and around a quarter (23%) neither agreed nor disagreed.

The most agreed with action was developing a holistic approach towards addressing gender stereotypes and norms in schools. Respondents felt it was important to address gender stereotypes early in life, and recognised the key role of schools in supporting this.

The most disagreed with action was the 'Mentors in Violence Prevention Programme' (MVP). Respondents were generally supportive of its aims, but did not believe it should be singled out when there were other similar programmes available.

Suggestions for what was missing from Priority 1:

- Importance of Relationships, Sexual Health and Parenthood Education (RSHPE)
- Say more on prevention/ include wider prevention programmes beyond MVP, and roll MVP out further / fund for longer
- Higher education institutions need to do more to tackle Violence Against Women (VAW)
- The role of the media, including social media, online and advertising

Priority 2: Women and girls thrive as equal citizens: socially, culturally, economically and politically

Around two-thirds (67%) of respondents agreed that the actions listed under priority two were the right ones, 14% disagreed and one-fifth (20%) said that they neither agreed nor disagreed.

The proposal for delivering split payments under Universal Credit was the most supported action, as it was noted that financial abuse and control can be part of the domestic abuse women experience, and that lack of access to finances can act as a barrier to women leaving abusive relationships.

The main criticisms were that the actions were not specific enough, didn't go far enough to meet the objectives, or didn't link directly to tackling violence against women. It was suggested that a number of the actions would sit better within a "Gender Equality Strategy" rather than a "Violence Against Women Delivery Plan".

Suggestions for what was missing from Priority 2:

- Change work place culture, attitudes and challenge stereotypes - under-representation of either gender in work force, value traditionally female roles and encourage men into traditionally female roles
- Wider structural changes - Improve wages, promote living wage, improve terms and conditions job security, increase women's purchasing power
- The Gender Equality in Sport fund to address the barriers to women's participation should be extended to include culture, the arts, media and politics too, as well as suggestions that it should start earlier and focus on girls and young women
- Actions to keep women safe, including in public spaces
- Cultural shift in attitudes

Priority 3: Interventions are early and effective, preventing violence and maximising the safety and wellbeing of women, children and young people

Two-thirds (66%) of respondents agreed that the actions listed under priority three were the right ones, 10% disagreed and around a quarter (24%) neither agreed nor disagreed.

Respondents were particularly supportive of improving the experience of vulnerable witnesses, and of initiating an independent review of the commissioning of specialist services for women and children experiencing gender based violence. It was felt that high quality services are essential, as is consistency of service provision across Scotland. Respondents were also particularly supportive of the action around sharing lessons from the “safe and together” model of child protection, and some wanted this model rolled out more widely across Scotland.

In some cases, where respondents disagreed with an action, it was because they felt it did not go far enough rather than because they fundamentally disagreed with it. It was questioned why the “Medics Against Violence” programme was singled out.

Suggestions for what was missing from Priority 3:

- Training for professionals around violence against women
- Include all forms of VAW (including honour based violence, FGM, forced marriage, rape, child sexual abuse, human trafficking and CSE) - It was felt that too many actions specially referenced domestic abuse, rather than encompassing all forms of VAW.
- An action to fund and support Multi-Agency Risk Assessment Conferences (MARACs) consistently across Scotland.

Priority 4: Men desist from all forms of violence against women and girls and perpetrators of such violence receive a robust and effective response

Over half (59%) of respondents agreed that the actions listed under priority four were the right ones, 16% disagreed and a quarter (25%) neither agreed nor disagreed.

The action to look at perpetrator programmes was the most widely supported. However, a number felt this should be strengthened, that provision of such programmes was inconsistent, and that there was a need for earlier intervention through voluntary programmes.

There was support for the actions to “introduce a Domestic Abuse Bill to Parliament which seeks to criminalise coercive control”, and to provide training for justice professionals around this new Bill. The criminalisation of coercive control was seen as positive.

Disagreement was most commonly expressed as a feeling that actions needed to be more detailed or go further, rather than disagreeing with the intention of the action.

Suggestions for what was missing from Priority 4:

- Increase provision of and funding of perpetrator programmes and extend beyond those that are court mandated
- Training for professionals should be wider than the Domestic Abuse Bill
- Support for different types of perpetrators, including children, women and those with complex needs

Cross cutting actions

Around two thirds (67%) of respondents agreed that the cross-cutting actions were the right ones, 12% disagreed and a fifth (20%) neither agreed nor disagreed.

Respondents were generally supportive of taking a human rights based approach to all forms of violence against women and children. There was support for recognising that certain groups of women might be particularly vulnerable due to a range of other protected characteristics.

Respondents were unlikely to disagree with any of the specific cross cutting actions. The most common criticism was that it was unhelpful and disjointed to have cross cutting actions separate from the priority actions. In particular there was a strong feeling that “all forms” of violence needed to be better integrated into the priorities.

Suggestions for what was missing from the cross cutting actions:

- The need for stronger actions relating to tackling commercial sexual exploitation (CSE)
- The need to align Equally Safe with other SG policies and relevant UN conventions
- Concern around the potential impact of Brexit on human rights and the need to mitigate against this

Performance framework

More than half (56%) of respondents agreed that the draft performance framework is right to help ensure that we understand the progress we are making, 16% disagreed, and 28% neither agreed nor disagreed.

There was general support for the performance framework and the logic modelling approach it took. Respondents highlighted the benefits of national level data than can be broken down to LA level, so LAs can see how they are doing compared to the national picture and other LAs.

Suggestions for what was missing from the performance framework:

- Additional indicators under “society”, “perpetrators” and “women and children affected by violence”
- More detailed definitions of the indicators
- Detail about evidence sources, who will gather the data, where and when the data will be reported, and what the baseline will be
- A clearer link between the actions in the delivery plan and the outcomes/indicators in the performance framework – including what outcomes could reasonably be expected in the 5 year timeframe of the action plan.

How organisations can contribute

Respondents identified a number of ways in which they could contribute to Equally Safe. These ranged from the direct provision of services to those affected by VAW, to being willing to engage with the SG, to providing training, or contributing to the knowledge base around VAW, to raising awareness and promoting key messages from Equally Safe. For a number co-ordinating/ contributing to work on VAW at a local level is a key part of what they do .

How the experiences and views of the women, children and young people were included in organisations’ consultation responses

Frequently organisation’s responses were based on their expertise in the field and reflected the views of those they worked with, including service users, service providers, workers and partnership organisations. Others had used research, evaluation, case studies, information on evidence based practice, and professional learning to inform their answers. A small number mentioned that the work of their equalities committee had informed their response.

Introduction

Background

This report presents the analysis of responses from the Scottish Government Consultation on the draft Delivery Plan for Equally Safe: Scotland's strategy for preventing and eradicating violence against women and girls.

Equally Safe, Scotland's Strategy for preventing and eradicating violence against women and girls, was published in 2014 and updated in 2016. It sets out a vision of a strong and flourishing Scotland where all individuals are equally safe and protected, and where women and girls live free from all forms of violence and abuse – and the attitudes that help perpetuate them. The definition of violence against women and girls adopted explicitly includes children of all genders as subject to harm through violence. The plan aims to improve the lives and experiences of all children affected by violence and the ways of thinking that maintain it.

The draft Delivery Plan consulted on covers the period from 2017- 2021.

The consultation process

The consultation on was launched on 23 March 2017 and closed on 30 June 2017.

The consultation asked respondents about the four priorities identified in the plan, the cross cutting actions set out in the plan, and the draft performance framework and indicators to measure progress against Equally Safe. In addition respondents were asked how they could contribute to Equally Safe, and how they had incorporated the voices of women and children in their consultation response. There was also a question asking for any additional comments.

Respondents were asked to say which actions in the plan they were particularly supportive of, any that they disagreed with, and if there were any that they felt were missing.

Who responded

In total there were 89 responses. Most of the responses (77) were from organisations and 12 were from individuals.

Organisational respondents were not asked to identify what type of organisation they belonged to, but were allocated an organisation type during the analysis process. As table 1, below shows, the highest number of organisational responses came from the third sector (40), followed by Violence Against Women/Gender Based Violence Partnerships (15).

Table 1: Distribution of responses by category of respondent

Category	No. of respondents	% of all respondents
Academic/research	3	3%
Local Authority	3	3%
Other Public Body, including Executive Agencies, NDPBs, NHS etc.	8	9%
Representative Body for Professionals/Trade Union	7	8%
Third Sector	40	45%
Violence Against Women / Gender Based Violence Partnership	15	17%
Other	1	1%
Total Organisations	77	87%
Individuals	12	13%
Grand Total	89	100%

Totals may not sum due to rounding

This report

This report provides an analysis of all the questions asked. Responses to the final question asking for any other comments have been analysed and included in the relevant themes of the other questions rather than being presented separately.

Where closed (yes, no, don't know) questions were asked the results have been reported as percentages. For the open questions common themes were identified and have been reported on.

Recurring themes raised throughout the consultation

Most respondents who responded to the consultation were generally supportive of the Equally Safe Delivery Plan and what it was trying to achieve (between 59% and 67% agreed with the actions listed under the 4 priorities and the cross cutting actions).

However respondents could see a number of ways to improve the Equally Safe Delivery Plan. When asked what was missing, what could be added, many of the same themes recurred. These themes related to:

- Who it should cover – more emphasis is required around intersectionality and the additional vulnerabilities faced by women with certain protected characteristics.
- There needs to be a greater emphasis on children, and more clarity that both boys and girls are covered by the plan.
- What it should cover – there was a repeated criticism that the plan focussed too much on domestic abuse, rather than covering the full spectrum of violence against women. In particular it was felt that stronger actions were required around commercial sexual exploitation (CSE), whilst childhood sexual abuse and stalking were not mentioned at all.
- There is a greater need for engagement and partnership working, too often the SG alone was listed in the “who” column for taking actions forward.
- There were a number of comments relating to the delivery of the plan, including the need for sustained funding and resources, the need to link the delivery plan to other SG policies and strategies and UN conventions, and the need for monitoring and evaluation.
- A number of comments were made about the wording of the plan – often it was commented that actions needed to be stronger and go further, and that more detail and clarity was required, along with comments that more medium and long term actions were required.
- There were comments relating to the management of the delivery plan and ensuring that action happens at a local level.

Some of the recurring themes relating to who it should cover (all women, all children) and what it should cover (all forms) are discussed in more detail in the cross cutting section of the analysis report.

Generally supportive of Equally Safe

A number of respondents commented that they were supportive of the Equally Safe delivery plan and what it aimed to achieve.

“We believe that Scotland has in many ways led the way internationally in addressing violence against women and girls. We should be ambitious in our vision for Scotland and what we can achieve. We consider that the draft delivery plan forms a base to build on to realise this vision.”

- Third Sector

“Overall, the Equally Safe strategy is an extremely positive move by the SG and demonstrates the commitment to tackle and eradicate violence against women and girls (VAWG).”

- Third Sector

Who it should cover – all women

Some respondents felt that more needed to be said in relation to the intersection between gender and other protected characteristics. Women might be more likely to experience violence or abuse as a result of these characteristics, to face additional barriers and therefore require additional support. It was also mentioned that different interventions might be required across a woman’s life course from girls/young woman up to older age.

Particular groups of women where it was felt more focus was required included:

- Those who identify as lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender or intersex(LGBTI)
- Those who have a disability or learning disability
- Those from black and ethnic minority (BME) communities
- Those with no recourse to public funds (NRPF) due to their migration status
- Those with English as a second language
- Women in poverty
- Those who have been looked after
- Those affected by commercial sexual exploitation (CSE)
- Those with caring responsibilities

“Additionally, the injustices experienced by women socially, culturally, economically and politically are inextricably linked to their experiences of race, disability, gender identity and sexuality; this should be kept in mind throughout the strategy and considered with every action detailed.”

- Third Sector

“[Our organisation] sees a clear understanding of intersectionality as central to developing actions which fully address the needs of women and girls with learning disabilities, who face multiple barriers as a result of both their gender and learning disability.”

- Third Sector

It was suggested that the priority 3 actions should be more inclusive of LGBTI people, minority ethnic women and women with learning disabilities as these groups can face additional barriers to accessing support.

“There are many barriers to accessing services for anyone when experiencing abuse, but for LBT women there are often double barriers. Many LBT women experiencing abuse are apprehensive about approaching a specialist women's only domestic abuse service for support, as they presume the service will only offer support to heterosexual women, and/or fear they will be met with homophobia, biphobia or transphobia and that staff may not understand LBT specific abuse. Fear of being 'outed' and confidentiality issues can also be barriers for LBT women accessing support for abuse.”

- Third Sector

“This is underpinned by the recognition that women and girls with learning disabilities experience particular barriers in reporting and escaping violence, and the lack of targeted, accessible information means they are rarely aware of support services available to victims of gender based violence.”

- Academic/Research

Who it should cover – all children

As discussed under cross cutting actions, it was felt that children were not integrated enough into the delivery plan. It was also suggested that the language used could make it clearer that children of both genders are included throughout the plan.

At priority 3 it was felt that there should be a stronger focus on children and young people affected by violence and abuse and supporting and protecting them.

“Although children and young people are identified as a priority group in this section there is a lack of actions that relate to providing support for them whether that be through public services or third sector support. If not mentioned specifically there is the potential that the focus may be lost.”

- Violence Against Women / Gender Based Violence Partnership

What it should cover – all forms of violence

A recurring criticism was that the delivery plan focussed too much on domestic abuse, and did not mention other forms of violence against women enough, this was particularly the case at priority 4.

“[Our organisation] welcomes the inclusion of actions that will help tackle perpetration of domestic abuse in this section of the Delivery Plan, but we believe that identifying and holding perpetrators to account in relation to other forms of VAWG should be strengthened in this section.”

- Violence Against Women / Gender Based Violence Partnership

Some respondents felt that reference to specific forms of violence were missing and called for the inclusion of Commercial Sexual Exploitation (CSE) (including prostitution and internet pornography), honour based violence, childhood sexual abuse, and stalking. In addition it was noted that gender based violence can be directed at men within a GBT relationship, as well as acknowledging that men can be victims and women perpetrators of violence.

“[Our] members suggested that there are currently actions missing which relate to: - Addressing specific forms of violence - e.g. honour based violence, sexual exploitation, child sexual abuse.”
- Third Sector

“Given that one of the objectives for Priority 1 is ‘Individuals and communities recognise and challenge violent and abusive behaviour’ there could be more specific actions in relation to the different forms of violence against women and girls. For example, the delivery plan would benefit from actions which seek to improve community responses to FGM and other forms of honour-based violence... Specific actions for specific forms of violence against women are necessary to ensure that the delivery plan is effective and meaningful.”

- Third Sector

Engagement and partnership working

One of the criticisms of the Delivery Plan was that often the Scottish Government alone is listed in the “Who” column for taking actions forward. A number of respondents stressed the need for collaboration and wider engagement and partnership working in order to successfully achieve the aims of Equally Safe. It was felt that it was important to say how the work of wider partners fits with the Delivery Plan and make it clearer that it is not for the SG alone to drive the Delivery Plan forward.

Groups that respondents felt should be included, and be more involved with Delivery Plan included:

- The wider public sector, including;
 - Local Authorities
 - Health Boards
 - Community Planning Partnerships
 - Health and Social Care Partnerships
 - Police Scotland
 - Scottish Prison Service
 - Scottish Courts Service
 - Education Scotland
 - Skills Development Scotland
 - Scottish Funding Council
 - Colleges
 - Higher Education Institutions

- Scottish Children’s Reporter Administration (SCRA)
- COSLA, Scottish Social Services Council
- Scottish Qualifications Authority (SQA)
- The Care Commission
- Child Protection Committees
- The Family Courts
- The Judiciary
- Crown Office
- Violence Against Women partnerships
- The third sector
- Parents, families and the wider community
- Employers, including those in the private sector
- Trade unions and representative bodies
- Schools and teachers
- Young people
- Faith groups
- The voices of women and children with lived experience of violence
- Other Equally Safe work streams sometimes need to be identified and included in the work of other priorities.

“Priority 1 contains a comprehensive list of achievable and worthwhile actions. It is noted, however, that the overwhelming majority of objectives are to be achieved by Scottish Government. This may lead some organisations to underestimate their own role in driving this agenda forward. Consideration may wish to be given to identifying other relevant bodies to include within the ‘Who’ column”

- Other Public Body, including Executive Agencies, NDPBs, NHS etc.

“recognise the significant contribution VAWPs make to this priority [priority 1] and support their endeavours by working in closer partnership with them”

- Violence Against Women / Gender Based Violence Partnership

“Approaches to prevention work are multi-faceted; there is no one size fits all. Working in partnership is the only way forward with all partners equally committed and working to their strengths.”

- Violence Against Women / Gender Based Violence Partnership

“the importance of public sector agencies, communities, and individuals is diluted and largely absent. We consider that detailing more specifically their contribution would strengthen the delivery plan, and clarify the ways in which we all have to own this issue.”

- Other Public Body, including Executive Agencies, NDPBs, NHS etc.

“It is critical that all key partners and stakeholder organisations are engaged in the delivery of the action plan if it is to be successful. Not only because the delivery plan requires engagement with broad range of expertise to succeed, but also because resource allocation and accountability for Equally Safe needs to be visible beyond Scottish Government.”

- Third Sector

It was felt that parents, families and the wider community have a role to play in influencing the attitudes of children and young people.

“there is no specific action around Childhood linked to parental awareness raising. The impact of actions in the educational setting will be limited if the home environment remains unchanged.”

- Third Sector

“Children and young people have many influences on their lives which shape their understanding of safe, healthy and positive relationships. Although the education system has a pivotal role, we believe that this section would be improved by widening its focus to consider the role of families and communities.”

- Other Public Body, including Executive Agencies, NDPBs, NHS etc.

In relation to priority 3 it was felt that the third sector have a wealth of experience in supporting women and children affected by VAW, and that this should be utilised, for example when training staff in the public sector on recognising potential signs of abuse.

Local level activity will be required to successfully deliver Equally Safe.

“VAW partnerships coordinate prevention activity, service provision, resources, training, policy and commitment at a local level. As the delivery plan stands at the moment, local areas are not required to do very much. This is a huge missed opportunity.”

- Violence Against Women / Gender Based Violence Partnership

Delivery

It was felt that long term sustainable funding and resources, including staff, would be required to effectively deliver Equally Safe. There were concerns of additional pressures caused by public sector spending cuts.

“It is important that VAW continues to be resourced at a time of funding constraints across statutory and 3rd sector organisations. VAW needs early intervention, partnership working and service user involvement. There is the potential to make an enormous difference to women and children’s lives if we deliver services better at an earlier stage.”

- Violence Against Women / Gender Based Violence Partnership

“To do any plan justice it needs to have resource attached to it. Failure to do this, results in fragmented services that lack cohesion and good outcomes that make a difference to affected women and girls.”

- Violence Against Women / Gender Based Violence Partnership

Areas where it was felt that funding was required included: to support actions taking place in schools and colleges and in the community; the rolling out of the “Safe and Together” model; supporting Multi-Agency Risk Assessment Conferences (MARACs); appropriately supporting and funding organisations and workforces involved in early intervention and prevention work; providing funding for projects across Scotland so that access to services is not a “postcode lottery”; to increase participation; and providing and funding specialist services to support women exiting prostitution.

“It is essential that actions to ensure early and effective interventions recognise the necessity of having the right workforce in the right place, with the right skills at the right time. The provision of adequate sustainable funding for these services should also be reflected within the actions.”

- Representative Body for Professionals/Trade Union

“There are currently 11 local authority areas delivering CEDAR across Scotland, funded primarily through the Big Lottery Fund. While this investment is very welcome, there is a need to ensure that these services are embedded and sustained in the longer term. Moreover, there is a need to address the postcode lottery that currently exists in Scotland by ensuring that all children are able to access specialist domestic abuse support through CEDAR regardless of the local authority area that they live in.”

- Other

“Concern about the impact of public spending cuts, particularly at local authority level, placing undue pressure on support workers and public services - making it much harder to deliver successfully on cross cutting initiatives.”

- Representative Body for Professionals/Trade Union

It was seen as important that the Delivery Plan learned from and drew upon existing strategies, rather than being delivered in isolation. Therefore relevant existing strategies and how they could link with Equally Safe should be referenced in the Delivery Plan. Existing strategies that respondents felt linked with Equally Safe included:

- The United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child (UNCRC)
- Getting it Right for Every Child (GIRFEC)
- Scottish Government Race Equality Framework for Scotland 2015-2030
- The National Framework for the Prevention of Child Sexual Abuse
- The Sexual Health Framework
- The Community Empowerment Act
- UN Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination
- Requirements of the Public Sector Equality Duty

- Fair Work Framework
- The Pregnancy and Parenthood in Young People strategy
- The Employability strategy
- The NHS Sexual Health and Blood Borne Virus Framework
- The National Mental Health Strategy
- Learning Disabilities Strategies
- A Fairer Scotland for Disabled People
- The Child Poverty Bill
- The Social Security Bill
- NHS Education for Scotland (NES) Transforming Trauma Knowledge and Skills Framework
- The Child Protection Improvement Programme

“It was noted that there are already a lot of strategies in place for engaging with/ supporting different groups of people and we should be learning from and utilising these rather than developing new plans.”

- Violence Against Women / Gender Based Violence Partnership

“All too often valuable equalities work is done in isolation minimising its impact and often duplicating effort. In particular, we would implore the Scottish Government to ensure that Equally Safe is implemented in line with the commitments and policies set out in the Race Equality Framework for Scotland 2016-2030”

- Third Sector

It was seen as important that action on the Delivery Plan is co-ordinated across government, relevant organisations and VAW partnerships, rather than operating in “silos”.

There were suggestions that more evidence, research and data were needed, to look at evidence gaps around preventing violence against women, and service provision, to better understand the risks faced by certain groups, such as women with learning disabilities, and to understand “what works” for women at different stages in their life.

It was felt that there was a need to monitor and evaluate the actions in Equally Safe, so that their impact could be monitored and reported on. It was felt that measurement would be required at both a local and a national level. It was also noted that some actions were considered “vague” which would make it hard to monitor their impact.

“More focus is needed on ensuring that actions are sustainable and are achieving their intended impact. There is a need to ensure that progress in implementing the delivery plan and monitoring the impact actions are having at a local and national level is measured and reported back to VAW Partnerships, CPPs and the Scot Gov.”

- Violence Against Women / Gender Based Violence Partnership

Wording of the Delivery Plan

There were a number of comments around the wording of the plan – a number of which called for more detail and clarity around certain actions. There was a feeling that the Delivery Plan should be more ambitious, and that some actions should be strengthened and go further. There was a desire for more medium and long term objectives, many of the actions referenced were short term and did not go beyond 2019. There was also a call for the actions to be more outcomes focussed rather than process focussed and for them to be SMART (specific, measurable, achievable, results-focused, and time-bound). It was commented in the cross cutting section, that the delivery plan did not make it clear how the SG would meet international obligations under UN conventions.

“The 'actions' included within this section of the plan are a little vague and are not very 'action oriented'. It is not made clear how progress will be made, by when and how it will be measured... The actions included appear to be less about a 'delivery plan' and more about what currently takes place. The focus tends to be on 'considering', 'discussing', and 'looking at' rather than acting. In terms of the timescales - there are very few medium or long-term actions - most of the actions are for 2017-18.”

- Violence Against Women / Gender Based Violence Partnership

“We believe that there is a need for the delivery plan to be much more ambitious than it currently is. Equally Safe sets out a long-term vision for preventing and eradicating VAWG so it is disappointing to see that the majority of actions in the delivery plan are either pieces of work that are currently on going or will be completed over the coming 12 months.”

- Violence Against Women / Gender Based Violence Partnership

“We support the Government’s commitment to holding events, engaging with stakeholders, taking forward programmes and commissioning research, however we are concerned that these are insufficient to affect the required change and - though worthwhile - they are not a commitment to tackle the form of gender based violence they relate to.”

- Third Sector

The scope of the plan was questioned by some, who felt that priority 2, which focussed on wider gender inequality, would sit better in a separate strategy. It was felt that the focus and the actions in priority 2 were too broad, and would not, in the short term, tackle the violence against women that women are experiencing now. It was commented that there might be a need to prioritise certain actions.

“By overemphasising the bigger picture of women’s equality this priority becomes too broad and the strategy fails to create and develop achievable and measurable objectives that address violence against women and improve women and girls safety in Scotland today.”

- Third Sector

There was also a request for a broader definition of gender based violence to be used that would better include all children and young people, as well as acknowledging the gender based violence that young gay, bisexual or transgender men face. There were calls for better consistency of language to make it clear that children are included.

“We have commented in other answers that we are not always clear whether actions in individual priority areas apply across all forms of gender based violence and include consideration of children. This concern is sometimes exacerbated by inconsistent use of language – in places the delivery plan refers to women, in places to women and girls and in places to women and children and it is not always clear whether these differences are deliberate choices due to the focus of a particular action. While the delivery plan does state at the beginning that the definition of violence against women and girls does include children or all genders, it would still perhaps be clearer to use “women and children” as the default form throughout the delivery plan unless actions are specifically focused on a particular group within this.”

- Third Sector

Management and accountability

There was a feeling that there needed to be some sort of mechanism in place for ensuring that high level actions were delivered locally, and that partners were held accountable. It was felt that guidance of what was expected at a local level was required. It was felt that local partners should be required to report annually on their progress.

“We would caution that this plan does not get lost in its implementation. To facilitate this we would recommend all publicly funded organisations receive directives from key public sector agencies and/or Ministers that highlights how they are expected to implement Equally Safe and that this be built into the Performance Monitoring framework.”

- Third Sector

“From a public health perspective we support Equally Safe at all levels, and particularly in relation to promoting equality and prevention. However, although we recognize that this is a strategy, which is rightly tackling these issues at a governmental level, we would appreciate guidance on how the actions can be supported and/or delivered at a local level.”

- Other Public Body, including Executive Agencies, NDPBs, NHS etc.

Priority 1 - Scottish society embraces equality and mutual respect, and rejects all forms of violence against women and girls

PRIORITY 1: Scottish society embraces equality and mutual respect, and rejects all forms of violence against women and girls

Objectives

- Positive gender roles are promoted
- People enjoy healthy, positive relationships
- Children and young people develop an understanding of safe, healthy and positive relationships from an early age
- Individuals and communities recognise and challenge violent and abusive behaviour

Contributing workstreams: Primary Prevention, Capability and Capacity

Priority 1 listed 10 actions, under the 3 headings of “Raising awareness and changing attitudes”, “Childhood” and “Workplace”.

Respondents were asked if they agreed that these were the right actions, if there were any that they were particularly supportive of, any that they didn’t agree with, and if there were any missing/anything additional that should be added.

Q1. Do you agree or disagree that the actions listed under priority 1 are the right actions to help meet the objectives of priority 1?

Sixty-six respondents answered Q1. Of those nearly two-thirds (65%) agreed, 12% disagreed and around a quarter (23%) neither agreed nor disagreed (see table 2 below).

Table 2: Q1. Do you agree or disagree that the actions listed under priority 1 are the right actions to help meet the objectives of priority 1?

	%	No.
Agree	65%	43
Disagree	12%	8
Neither Agree nor Disagree	23%	15
		N
		=
		66

Support for Priority 1 Actions

Q2 Please tell us about any of the priority 1 actions that you are particularly supportive of.

Table A1 in Annex 1, lists all of the priority 1 actions, and shows how many respondents said that they were particularly supportive of those actions, as well as indicating the numbers of other comments provided at question 2.

Around a third of those who answered this question stated that they were supportive of all the priority 1 actions listed.

Of actions that were singled out by respondents as being ones that they were particularly supportive of, the most popular actions were:

- Work with the education system and key stakeholders to develop a holistic approach towards addressing gender stereotypes and norms in schools and education settings (17)
- Support initiatives to raise awareness amongst the wider population of violence against women and girls, including what causes it and how to challenge it (16)
- Through the Mentors in Violence Prevention programme, ensure that boys and men understand about positive healthy respectful relationships, are encouraged to stand up to violence, challenge attitudes and behaviours and tackle toxic masculinity (11)

Supportive of all actions

A number of respondents were generally supportive of all the actions listed under priority 1. Amongst those respondents, the following comments were made:

“[Our organisation] agrees that the thematic headings under which the actions are located are important in shaping a society in which equality, mutual respect and rejection of violence against women and girls are fundamental. The rationale for inclusion of the specific actions is clear from the preceding narrative and the commitment to ensuring that the wider societal attitudes are addressed. We welcome this focus.”

- Other Public Body, including Executive Agencies, NDPBs, NHS etc.

“We are fully supportive of the aims outlined in Priority One. As the leading charity for girls and young women in Scotland we are committed to working towards a more equal future for all girls and young women. We strongly believe education and early prevention are key to ensuring all girls and young women can live free from violence and achieve their full potential and are committed to empowering our young members to speak out on the issues that affect their lives.”

- Third Sector

“We support all priority 1 actions, but they do not go far enough.”

- Third Sector

“[Our organisation] is broadly supportive of all actions identified within priority 1. [Our organisation] welcomes the Scottish Government’s commitment to raising awareness and changing attitudes to both gender based violence and the promotion of equality for women and girls.

- Other Public Body, including Executive Agencies, NDPBs, NHS etc.

Raising awareness and changing attitudes

The most widely supported action under raising awareness and changing attitudes was “Support initiatives to raise awareness amongst the wider population of violence against women and girls, including what causes it and how to challenge it”. Respondents acknowledged that raising awareness of and challenging attitudes to violence against women was vital to tackle it. It was felt that this would require a concerted and well-funded marketing approach. It was noted that the NHS already carry out work to address this agenda, through White Ribbon, and 16 Days of Action, as well as through their routine work. There was a call for this work to be recognised and legitimised by including reference to it in the action plan.

“Whilst there are a number of reasons for this violence to occur, all of these stem back to fundamental and deep rooted gender inequalities. Reconstructing the way this should be tackled is clearly at the heart of the Equally Safe programme. Women are supportive of the holistic approach being undertaken in Scotland around VAWG.”

- Third Sector

The Mentors in Violence Prevention Programme was also supported by respondents. There were comments that this should be rolled out further and expanded upon, although some respondents also commented on other programmes with similar aims, which should also be supported (see Q3 for more details).

“The Mentors in Violence Prevention Programme is a particularly important project to help young people understand what a healthy relationship looks like and how to challenge abusive behaviour. This programme could be further developed and rolled out in more settings.”

- Third Sector

Only a few respondents specifically said that they were particularly supportive of engagement with the newly established Advisory Council on women and girls.

“We applaud the creation of the Advisory Council on women and girls and would appreciate an opportunity to contribute directly to its work.”

- Third Sector

Childhood

“Work with the education system and key stakeholders to develop a holistic approach towards addressing gender stereotypes and norms in schools and education settings” was the most supported of the childhood actions. Respondents felt that it was important that gender stereotypes were addressed early in life and recognised the key role of schools in supporting this. It was felt that there was still more work to be done in this area to educate both boys and girls about unacceptable behaviour, with one respondent quoting research from Napier University and Glasgow University which found that young people justified a lot of violence against women in terms of what the woman had or hadn’t done to trigger it, and that violence was seen as being linked to masculine identity. There was a suggestion that the role of delivery partners, such as Education Scotland needed to be more explicit, and that linking the action to Public Sector Equality Duty might be a useful lever for improving practice in this area. Again, work already being done by the NHS was highlighted – addressing gender stereotypes as part of their work around the NHS Sexual Health and Blood Borne Virus Framework in education settings, and there was a feeling that this should be acknowledged within the delivery plan.

“We believe schools have an essential role to play in championing equality and ensuring young people are informed on issues including gender equality, sexism, sexual harassment, consent, and healthy relationships.”

- Third Sector

“Women have emphasised the need to change gendered attitudes from early on in life. Not only will this strengthened approach allow both young men and women to understand VAWG, it will also change societal assumptions concerning what is held to be permitted.”

- Third Sector

“We welcome renewed focus on tackling gender stereotypes and norms, as these can have dangerous consequences for children and young people, and also for female staff, who are underrepresented in senior management posts in education. In the ‘Get it Right for Girls’ report we encourage a whole-school approach to addressing these issues, so the proposal to develop a holistic approach aligns with our recommendation.”

- Representative Body for Professionals/Trade Union

The action to “publish a refreshed approach to addressing bullying in schools, including bullying based on sexism and gender” also received support from respondents. Some highlighted that pupils with certain protected characteristics, such as those who are from Black and Minority Ethnic (BME) communities, or who identify as lesbian, gay, bisexual or transgender (LGBT) might be more likely to experience bullying than other pupils, and that a new approach to bullying should take these intersections into account. It was noted that the issue of bullying in schools is a significant part of mental health and wellbeing programmes, and that the delivery plan needs to be cross-referenced to other relevant strategies.

Respondents were also supportive of the action to work with Further and Higher Education Institutions. It was suggested that this was a sector that had previously been “neglected” when addressing violence against women. It was suggested that FE and HE Institutions should have firm plans in place for what actions to take if a complaint of violence against women is made. There was also a suggestion that FE and HE Institutions have a dual role, both in terms of safeguarding their students from VAW and also as the educators of future professionals in the fields of health, social work, and law etc. and therefore thought should be given to what is taught about violence against women in those courses. There was support for Strathclyde’s Equally Safe in Higher Education (ESHE) Project.

Those who supported a Skills Investment Plan (SIP) for the early learning and childcare sector did so because they felt that attitudes are shaped at an early age and therefore it was important to support staff in this sector.

“Attitudes to gender stereotypes begin to form at an early age. Developing skills within the early years workforce to help tackle this issue is therefore welcomed.”

- Third Sector

Those who were supportive of “providing more support for teachers on equality issues” felt that teachers have an important role to play in delivering education around equality, and also in dealing with any gender-based bullying or harassment that might occur within a school setting, and it was important that pupils feel able to report such incidents to staff. A teaching union cited results from one of their member’s surveys around equalities training, and barriers to accessing it, and called on Local Authorities to provide support to enable teachers to participate in this type of training.

“We welcome further support and training for teachers on equality issues and believe this must focus an increasing understanding of unacceptable behaviour and how this can be addressed.”

- Third Sector

“We are strongly supportive of the proposal to provide more support for teachers on equality issues. An EIS member survey on equalities training for teachers and lecturers, conducted in 2017, told us that 42% of respondents had not had any equalities training during their teaching career; fewer than half of respondents had had training on the Equality Act 2010 (40%); and the most common barrier to accessing training is workload, with 70% of respondents citing this as a barrier.”

- Representative Body for Professionals/Trade Union

Other comments around “Childhood” included comments that were generally supportive of tackling gender inequality and attitudes at an early age in educational settings. A number of respondents stressed the need for a co-ordinated approach drawing on the expertise of organisations who have experience of developing prevention programmes. Some respondents also stressed the need to work with parents and family, as they play a key part in shaping their child’s attitudes.

“Targeted VAW/gender work at key development stages for children and young people (early years, primary and secondary schools) also makes strategic sense as this will contribute in a tangible way to the long term plan to end VAW.”

- Violence Against Women / Gender Based Violence Partnership

“Whilst we also welcome the fact that the delivery plan includes actions on VAWG work within school settings and with education professionals, we feel it is important that a more coordinated, joined up approach is taken when considering how these will be delivered. This should take account of the knowledge and expertise of specialist VAWG services and ensure that both children and teachers are receiving consistent messages about causes, consequences and appropriate responses to VAWG and what constitutes positive, healthy relationships.”

- Violence Against Women / Gender Based Violence Partnership

“Clearly, tackling the causes of violence against women and girls is the key to eradicating it. We would like to stress that this awareness raising needs to begin in the early years. The root cause of violence against women is gender inequality, and children begin to develop gender stereotypical perceptions from a very early age, based on what they see and hear all around them. This action must include work with parents (male and female) to support them to raise their children with positive gender beliefs.”

- Representative Body for Professionals/Trade Union

Workplace

Some respondents commented that they were generally pleased to see workplaces included in the strategy, although there were also comments that the actions could be strengthened. There were very few comments relating to the specific workplace actions.

“Workplaces are also a key area for unhelpful and damaging views about VAW to be expressed. We welcome the focus on workplaces as a key area for raising awareness of VAW and promoting prevention.”

- Violence Against Women / Gender Based Violence Partnership

“However, the action points on 'workplace' are weak, and do not reflect the Scottish Government's contribution through other Forums, and the ongoing work by other stakeholders, including the trade unions.”

- Representative Body for Professionals/Trade Union

“I particularly agree with the point on gathering examples of best practice and developing guidance and incentives for employers. This work should also include the STUC and the CBI in Scotland to ensure strategic drivers for change.”

- Third Sector

Priority 1 actions that aren't supported

Q3. Please tell us about any priority 1 actions that you don't agree with

A number of respondents said that there were no priority 1 actions that they disagreed with/they agreed with them all. Table A2 in Annex 1, shows the actions and areas that respondents disagreed with, and the numbers of comments given.

Raising awareness and changing attitudes

The most disagreed with action was the "Mentors in Violence Prevention Programme". On the whole respondents were supportive of the aims of the Mentors in Violence Programme, however they felt that there was a need to look at other similar programmes, especially ones which had been evaluated and shown to be effective. They questioned why Mentors in Violence Prevention had been specifically singled out over and above these other programmes. One respondent felt that the scope of Mentors in Violence (focusing on boys and men) was too limited, and that such interventions should be targeted at all young people.

Other programmes mentioned which respondents felt should be included in this action were:

- An Education toolkit developed by the University of the West of England which ESHE (Equally Safe in Higher Education at Strathclyde University) intend to pilot.
- Sexual assault prevention work carried out by Rape Crisis Centres across the country
- Fathers Network Scotland
- The ManKind Project
- Prevention activities by Zero Tolerance
- Prevention activities by White Ribbon

"We felt that the action around MVP was too narrow and conflated 'what' with 'how'. MVP, although well received in our authority, is not the only model for undertaking prevention work with children and young people in schools and an integrated whole-school approach is needed that draws on the expertise of specialist services. A range of school-based interventions are needed that align with the priorities set out in GIRFEC and Children's Services Plans."

- Violence Against Women / Gender Based Violence Partnership

"We would stress that any investment in programmes designed to change unhealthy masculinity should be based on robust evidence of effectiveness."

- Representative Body for Professionals/Trade Union

"While the MVP programme undertakes important work in raising awareness of VAWG and helping to change attitudes, [our organisation] believes it is important to note that there is a wide range of prevention activities and resources being delivered across Scotland beyond the MVP programme, including those being developed/ delivered by Rape Crisis, Zero Tolerance and White Ribbon."

- Violence Against Women / Gender Based Violence Partnership

Some respondents were unsure about the value of an Advisory Council on Women and Girls and wondered what impact it would have. It was deemed important that it should include women with a range of protected characteristics, such as BME women or those with a disability from the start, in order to be meaningful.

Childhood

There was some criticism of the Skills Investment Plan for the Early Learning and Childcare sector, as it was felt that it did not do enough to address gender issues, and did not mention the undervaluation of “women’s work” such as care. It was also felt that Skills Development Scotland, and not the SG should be listed as the “who” for this action.

“The Skills Investment Plan has been published, and gender is at best a marginal consideration. Gender stereotyping and occupational segregation are not mentioned at all.”

Third Sector

“Other childhood comments” were critical of the lack of partnership working involved in taking these actions forward, believing that the voluntary sector, school boards, education professionals, and Violence Against Women Partnerships should be involved in these in a more joined up way.

There was a comment relating to the action on bullying based on sexism and gender, which felt that the focus needed to be more on attitude, than behaviour.

“Addressing sexism should be the primary focus of Childhood (box 4), not bullying based on sexism; it is about culture and attitude, not just behaviour.”

- Violence Against Women / Gender Based Violence Partnership

Workforce

There was some criticism around gathering examples of best practice. It was felt that it would be challenging to identify and share examples of good practice, and scepticism that doing so would lead to real change for women.

Other respondents stated the importance of ensuring that any actions were embedded into existing workforce development strategies and competency frameworks, and that it was important that existing strategies were effectively implemented, rather than creating new strategies.

Actions that are missing/should be added to priority 1

Q4. Are there any actions that you think are missing under priority 1? - Do you have any suggestions for additional actions to focus on?

Some respondents said that they could not identify any gaps under priority 1. Others identified a range of actions that they thought were missing and suggestions for additional things to be added in under priority 1, as can be seen in table A3 in Annex 1. These ranged from suggested additional actions under each of the

priority 1 headings, and additional actions which did not directly fit under those headings, to wider issues, which are discussed in the “recurring themes” section of this report.

Raising awareness and changing attitudes

A number of comments were made around prevention and the action relating to Mentors in Violence Programme (MVP). As at question 3, a number of respondents highlighted the range of prevention programmes currently on offer in Scotland and felt that these should be acknowledged within the Delivery Plan. MVP alone was not seen as sufficient as a preventative action. Others were supportive of MVP, but highlighted that it is not available in all local authorities, that its inclusion in a school is dependent on the approval of the head teacher, and that they were uncertain of its long term funding. They therefore called for an integrated approach to prevention, which is consistent across Scotland and is adequately funded. Others felt it was important that such programmes were extended to include girls.

“Two objectives of this priority are about healthy and positive relationships, that people enjoy healthy and positive relationships and that children and young people develop an understanding of healthy and positive relationships from an early age. The only action however that seems specifically focussed on these objectives is the action to continue the Mentors in Violence Prevention (MVP) programme. While we support the inclusion of an action around MVP, we do not believe that this is enough to address the objectives of this priority relating to healthy relationships.”

- Third Sector

“Not all schools have MVP, it should be rolled out to all schools and higher education. It also has to be integrated with wider approaches for wider societal change.”

- Violence Against Women / Gender Based Violence Partnership

“It is vital that programmes aimed at increasing understanding of positive and healthy relationships and empowering people to challenge abusive or toxic attitudes and behaviours are not simply restricted to boys and men. Girls and young women should also have access to programmes which promote positive and healthy relationship models and should be empowered to challenge problematic attitudes and behaviours. This should include information about the law around consent and sexual violence as well as looking at domestic abuse.”

- Third Sector

Some respondents wanted more information about the role of the Advisory Council on Women and Girls, and what its focus would be.

Childhood

It was suggested that this heading be change from “childhood” to “children and young people” or “children and adolescents” “to reflect the inclusion of actions for schools, universities and colleges.” –Third Sector

A number of respondents strongly felt that actions relating to Relationships, Sexual Health and Parenthood Education (RSHPE) should be included within the Delivery Plan, as this was seen as being essential to achieving the objectives of “People enjoy healthy, positive relationships” and “Children and young people develop an understanding of safe, healthy and positive relationships from an early age”. It was suggested that the Equally Safe priorities should be included within the current review of Personal and Social Education (PSE), and that teaching around this should be consistent across Scotland, and be available to all young people, both boys and girls, and also those with Learning Disabilities. Respondents made suggestions about the type of learning they wanted included in RSHPE, including education about healthy relationships, consent, the variety of forms gender based violence can take (including online and within same sex relationships) parenting, and mental health and wellbeing.

“In particular, we believe consistent high quality personal and social education covering equality, consent, sexual harassment and abuse, online pornography and abuse, and healthy relationships, combined with a zero tolerance approach to sexual harassment and gender bullying will not only reduce the risk of future violence and abuse but tackle the currently unacceptable levels of harassment and gender-based bullying girls report facing at school, college and in other areas of their daily lives.”

- Third Sector

“[We] strongly feel that a specific commitment is needed in the Delivery Plan to ensure that all children and young people have access to high quality, age appropriate interventions on healthy, positive relationships and consent. Without this, it is unlikely that the intended objective of “children and young people develop an understanding of safe, healthy and positive relationships from an early age” will be achieved.”

- Violence Against Women / Gender Based Violence Partnership

Whilst respondents were generally supportive of the action around bullying, there were a number of suggestions made for how it could be strengthened and improved. It was noted that LGBTI young people are at greater risk of experiencing bullying and therefore the action should refer to this group specifically. It was also noted that much bullying will take place outside of school, and that the action could be amended to take this into account. The potential links between bullying and stalking were also raised. It was suggested that young people should be involved in designing a new approach to bullying and it was suggested that measures would be required at both a national and a local level, and that it was important that the approach taken was consistent across Scotland.

It was suggested that the focus on the early years could be strengthened, given the importance of the early years in a child’s development. Resources, including ones being developed by the Care Inspectorate, aimed at early years practitioners, to promote gender equality and avoid negative stereotyping, Close the Gap’s “Be What You Want” and Zero Tolerances’ guide “Just Like a child” were highlighted.

Some respondents commented that there was no mention of a “whole schools” approach to equality and gender, and felt that a whole schools approach was required. It was noted that there was no mention of the SG funded National Sexual Violence Prevention Programme, which was seen as “odd” as “this is one of the few evidence based approaches being used in Scotland to change young people’s knowledge and attitudes to sexual violence and consent.” – Third Sector

It was mentioned that a more “trauma-centred” approach should be taken, and that the impact of trauma and adverse childhood experiences should be taken into account within the Delivery Plan.

Some respondents felt that there should be more in the plan about the importance of positive male role models for young men.

It was suggested that gender should be mainstreamed within the Scottish Government’s Children and Young People Improvement Collaborative work.

Some respondents felt that Higher Education institutions should do more to tackle VAW, and wanted more clarity around the action relating to HE/FE and would like to see more specific and strengthened actions around this in the plan.

“[Our organisation] also welcomes the work with further and higher education institutions. As part of this, we would recommend that, as with employers, there be clear requirements with regard to the actions an institution are obliged to undertake should an allegation of violence be made. These might include immediate steps to protect the safety of the survivor lead by her needs, information on what investigations must be carried out, and critically the steps institutions should take to support the survivor, for instance moving accommodation, counselling and support and support with the survivor’s academic commitments.”

– Third Sector

“In terms of Higher Education Institutions (HEI), women have voiced concern over the lack of a role that these play in terms of tackling VAWG...This problem is particularly pressing as the majority of women attending HEI are young and often away from home and family support networks for the first time. Conversely, male students have grown up in an era in which porn culture and sexualisation has become increasingly tolerated.”

- Third Sector

In addition, it was felt that more should be said about the role of HE/FE institutions as trainers of future teachers, social workers etc., and how teaching around VAW and gender equality is incorporated within training.

Workforce

It was noted that the workforce actions needed to be widened out to include the private sector and a wider range of public sector bodies, such as NHS and Local Authorities.

“In terms of workplace activity, it is disappointing that the only organisations referenced are SG and COSLA. Local Authorities and NHS Boards are amongst the largest employers in Scotland so it would seem, sensible to include them as owners of this action.”

- Violence Against Women / Gender Based Violence Partnership

“The NHS is the biggest employer in Scotland and yet, nothing is asked of the NHS as an employer in this action plan. 80% of NHS staff are women. For example, the NHS has a well-developed employee policy for addressing GBV in the workplace. Other agencies and sectors could adopt it – that could easily be an action.”

- Other Public Body, including Executive Agencies, NDPBs, NHS etc.

“In terms of looking at workplaces it could be interpreted that the delivery plan is only focusing on the public sector. The delivery plan also needs to be clear about the role of private sector employers in challenging sexism in the workplace.”

- Violence Against Women / Gender Based Violence Partnership

There were a range of suggestions (mostly given by only one respondent each) about how the workforce actions could be strengthened. These included: clear actions for how an organisation should respond when a claim of sexual harassment in the workplace is made; saying more about what workplaces could do to support previous victims of abuse who are entering the workforce; the development of an “Equally Safe Kite mark” for employers; supporting employers, through training and awareness raising to help them to recognise the signs of domestic abuse in employees; and using the SG Workplace Equality Fund to support employers “seeking to improve workplace culture and practice, in better supporting women experiencing violence and harassment.”

Other

It was suggested that there should be an action relating to the media, and how the media, including social media and advertising portrays women, and how the perpetuation of “everyday sexism” in the media feeds into gender violence.

“the public’s stereotypical attitudes about gender roles are often perpetuated/reinforced by the media and this has to be addressed.”

- Representative Body for Professionals/Trade Union

“Young people are surrounded by images and videos on social media which are threatening, derogatory or demeaning to women with increasing numbers subjected to on-line bullying/stalking/trolling. The legislation around this form of abuse needs to be stricter.”

- Representative Body for Professionals/Trade Union

The role of social media and digital relationships was mentioned as something which could be a source of bullying and harassment for young people, but also provide a support mechanism, and as such it is important that young people are supported to access technology safely.

It was also noted that mention of consent was noticeably absent from the priority 1 objectives and actions. It was felt that including consent, and teaching young people about consent was vital to meeting the priority 1 objectives.

“Despite the one of the objectives of this section being that children and young people develop an understanding of safe, healthy and positive relationships from an early age, there is NO reference to work on consent in the related actions. This is a significant omission. There is a

need for a high level commitment to all young people having access to interventions on consent and healthy sexual relationships.”

- Third Sector

Priority 2: Women and girls thrive as equal citizens: socially, culturally, economically and politically

PRIORITY 2: Women and girls thrive as equal citizens: socially, culturally, economically and politically

Objectives

- Women and girls are safe, respected and equal in our communities
- Women and men have equal access to power and resources

Contributing workstreams: Primary Prevention

Priority 2 listed 18 actions, under the 4 headings of “Understanding gender”, “Parenting and childcare”, “Women’s economic inequality” and “Women’s civic and social inequality”.

Respondents were asked if they agreed that these were the right actions, if there were any that they were particularly supportive of, any that they didn’t agree with, and if there were any missing/anything additional that should be added.

Q5. Do you agree or disagree that the actions listed under priority 2 are the right actions to help meet the objectives of priority 2?

Sixty-six respondents answered this question. Around two-thirds (67%) agreed that these were the right actions under priority 2, 14% disagreed and one-fifth (20%) said that they neither agreed nor disagreed (see table 3 below).

Table 3: Q5. Do you agree or disagree that the actions listed under priority 2 are the right actions to help meet the objectives of priority 2?

	%	No.
Agree	67%	44
Disagree	14%	9
Neither Agree nor Disagree	20%	13

N = 66

Totals may not sum due to rounding

Support for Priority 2 Actions

Q6. Please tell us about any of the priority 2 actions that you are particularly supportive of

Table A4 in Annex 1, lists all of the priority 2 actions, and shows how many respondents said that they were particularly supportive of those actions, as well as indicating the numbers of other comments provided at question 6. A number of respondents explicitly stated that they supported all of the priority 2 actions.

Of actions that were singled out by respondents as being ones that they were particularly supportive of, the most popular actions were:

- Develop proposals for delivering split payments under Universal Credit, working with stakeholders to scope out timescales (14)
- Promote use of the Equality Impact Assessment tool at the national and local level to tackle inequality and discrimination across Scotland (10)
- Improve strategic consideration of equality implications of spend for gender and other protected characteristics within the annual Equality Budgeting process (8)
- Take forward a transformative programme to expand free Early Learning and Childcare entitlement to 1,140 hours per year by 2020, including piloting a deposit guarantee scheme for childcare places (8)

Supportive of all actions

A number of respondents were generally supportive of all the actions listed under priority 2. Some were particularly supportive of the recognition that wider gender inequality is a factor in violence against women.

“[Our organisation] welcomes the core understanding that gender inequality is a root cause of VAWG and the strong focus that the delivery plan places on tackling women’s social, cultural, economic and political inequality.”

- Violence Against Women / Gender Based Violence Partnership

Understanding gender

The action to promote the use of Equality Impact Assessments (EQIAs) was the most widely supported action under “understanding gender”. Although some respondents did call for this action to be strengthened and go further, by ensuring that all relevant organisations know how and when to carry out an EQIA, and suggesting that EQIAs could be used to promote equality, rather than just tackle inequality and discrimination.

“[Our organisation] is particularly supportive of the promotion of Equality Impact Assessment tools. When done right, an EIA can be a useful tool to expose inadvertent/indirect sex discrimination.”

- Representative Body for Professionals/Trade Union

There was also support for gender budgeting and for the actions to “improve strategic consideration of equality implications of spend for gender and other protected characteristics within the annual Equality Budgeting process” and “develop a programme of engagement with key parts of Government to improve understanding of gender in policy making”. Respondents were supportive of “gender mainstreaming” within government policy involving the third sector, and sharing their expertise.

“Locating VAWG within the context of gender inequality is essential and we welcome the unequivocal position of Equally Safe and the Delivery Plan in this regard. Accordingly, we support the intention to promote gender mainstreaming in key policy making.”

- Other Public Body, including Executive Agencies, NDPBs, NHS etc.

“We welcome actions to improve understanding of gender in policy making and the Scottish Government’s recognition to work with third sector women’s organisations to achieve this.”

- Third Sector

There was a suggestion that the actions around gender budgeting and promoting EQIAs could be strengthened by linking them to the Public Sector Equality Duty to “enhance accountability and enable more joined up policy making” – Third Sector

Parenting and childcare

The action around a transformative programme to expand free Early Learning and Childcare entitlement was the most supported of the parenting and childcare actions. Respondents were supportive of this action, as lack of access to appropriate childcare can act as a barrier to women who want to work. Respondents stressed that childcare must be flexible, to suit a range of working patterns, and be high quality. Some wanted to see certain children prioritised, such as those who are looked after, and the children of single parents who are returning to the labour market. It was also noted that those working in the child care sector (who are primarily women) should be paid appropriately, with a suggestion that they should be paid at least the Scottish Living Wage.

“we believe the limitations and inflexibility of the current system of free ELC provision can be restricting for families and acts as a disincentive to parents who may otherwise want to work. It is our experience that, in most circumstances, it is the mother who is expected to prioritise childcare over any desire or ambition to work, which simply reinforces the gender inequality experienced by women in such situations.”

- Third Sector

There was also support for the “returners” project for women who had had a career break, as it was noted that women who return to work might miss out on promotion opportunities. This action was seen as beneficial for those who had taken a career break to look after children and also for those who might have had to take a career break to look after themselves and their children following abuse.

“We are supportive of the proposal to develop a ‘returners’ project. It is acknowledged that women returners are often discriminated against, particularly in respect of promotional opportunities if they return part-time or have caring responsibilities. This will require a change in both manager and employers attitudes.”

- Violence Against Women / Gender Based Violence Partnership

“We strongly supported all the objectives noted. In particular: Establish a 'returners' project so that parents who have had a career break can get help updating skills and knowledge. This is vital for all women and for women who have had to take a break following abuse this could make a significant difference. This break is often to care for any children involved and recover from their trauma but unfortunately too often results in detrimental economic and employment status as a result of their abuse.”

- Third Sector

There was also support for the new Best Start Grant, as it was noted that child poverty can have a detrimental impact on a child's outcomes. The concept of joined up support through key transitions was welcomed.

“We also welcome the creation of the new Best Start Grant, as we have serious concerns about low parental incomes, and the impact this can have on children's early development, educational experiences, achievement and attainment.”

- Representative Body for Professionals/Trade Union

Women's Economic Inequality

Some respondents clearly saw a link between women's economic inequality and violence against women, as lack of access to resources can limit women's ability to leave violent relationships. One charity stated that 65% of requests to their Urgent Assistance Fund were related to the financial hardship of fleeing domestic abuse. More broadly another charity highlighted the links between poverty and domestic violence, and believed that reducing child poverty would support the delivery plan's ambitions around gender equality.

“Although not the primary reason, we believe that women's incomes contribute in no small part to the decisions women make about staying in or leaving a violent relationship. In light of this [our organisation] believes we should be challenging issues that perpetuate pay inequality within society including the gender pay gap, as well as promoting the real Living Wage across both public and private sector companies.”

- Representative Body for Professionals/Trade Union

The proposal for delivering split payments under Universal Credit was the most supported of the Women's Economic Inequality actions, as it was noted that financial abuse and control can be part of the domestic abuse women experience, and that lack of access to finances can act as a barrier to women leaving abusive relationships.

“We are particularly supportive of split payments under Universal Credit. Given the prevalence of financial abuse in abusive relationships it is critical that any financial support offered by the government as part of social security is done so with an awareness of the dynamics of domestic abuse and that these payments are provided separately.”

- Third Sector

“We welcome the Scottish Government’s commitment to offer individual payments of Universal Credit. Household payments in actuality mean that many women will have no independent income. It increases the likelihood of financial dependency and control, and places women and their children experiencing domestic abuse at increased risk.”

- Third Sector

“We are also particularly supportive of the proposal to deliver split payments of Universal Credit. We would urge the Scottish Government to ensure that the delivery system is responsive and able to adapt quickly to changes in circumstances to ensure that there are no additional financial barriers to leaving an abusive partner or situation.”

- Third Sector

There was support for challenging occupational segregation through the actions relating to “Developing the Young Workforce” and the development of a strategy to address gender stereotyping and improve gender balance in science, technology, engineering and maths (STEM).

There was support for reducing employment inequality for minority ethnic women, as the intersectionality between ethnicity and gender was seen as exacerbating issues of economic inequality for minority ethnic women.

“Our members’ view is that there may be a glass ceiling for women but for BME women there is a titanium ceiling. Thus, initiatives aimed at reducing the multiplying effect of sexism and racism in employment are welcome. We would caution however, that establishing a minority ethnic women’s network to explore this issue risks casting this as a problem which BME people can solve unilaterally. In fact, it is White employers who need to be challenged to do more to tackle racial and gendered inequalities in their systems.”

- Representative Body for Professionals/Trade Union

“In addition to having higher levels of unemployment than their white ethnic counterparts, non-white minority ethnic communities are also disproportionately represented in low-paid sectors, contributing to lower income levels and higher rates of deprivation, according to the Joseph Rowntree Foundation.”

- Third Sector

Women's civic and social inequality

There were generally low numbers of respondents saying that they were particularly supportive of the women’s civic and social inequality actions. The action around redressing gender imbalances and improving women’s representation on public boards in Scotland received the most support.

Amongst those who supported the fund to address barriers to women’s participation in sport, there were comments that this was particularly important for girls and young women, and also for those who identify as LGBTI.

Amongst those who supported the Women 50:50 campaign and the improvement of women's access to public office, the following comment was made.

"It is vital to have woman at the highest levels of politics but also equal representation in local politics and in backbenches."

- Third Sector

Priority 2 actions that aren't supported

Q7. Please tell us about any priority 2 actions that you don't agree with

Some respondents said that there were no priority 2 actions that they disagreed with/they agreed with them all. Table A5 in Annex 1, shows the actions and areas that respondents disagreed with, and the numbers of comments given.

The main criticisms levelled at the priority 2 actions were that they were not specific enough, they didn't go far enough and respondents were not sure they would meet the objectives, or that respondents did not see an immediate link between certain actions and tackling violence against women. It was suggested that a number of the actions would sit better within a "Gender Equality Strategy" rather than a "Violence Against Women Delivery Plan".

"We feel that many of the statements are so broad and generic that they lose meaning and specific progress will be difficult to define and measure."

- Violence Against Women / Gender Based Violence Partnership

"We do not disagree with any of the identified actions which are all worthy and potentially significant if realised. However, we would query whether they are sufficient to achieve the desired outcome of Priority 2."

- Other Public Body, including Executive Agencies, NDPBs, NHS etc.

Specific actions that were highlighted as not going far enough were:

- "Promote use of the Equality Impact Assessment tool at the national and local level to tackle inequality and discrimination across Scotland" (2)
- "Ensure the successful bidder(s) to deliver devolved employment services demonstrate clearly how they will deliver a service that is gendered in terms of understanding the needs of women seeking employment; and use levers at their disposal to encourage employers to consider flexible working approaches which enable more women to take up a broader range of opportunities"(1)
- "Identify and promote practice that works in reducing employment inequality for minority ethnic women, including in career paths, recruitment, progression and retention" (1)

A number of actions were disagreed with on the basis that respondents could not see a direct link between those actions and reducing violence against women.

“While we do not disagree that the inequalities women experience on a day to day basis in relation to parenting; childcare; economic and social status impact on women’s place in society, we are somewhat confused to see them included as an integral part of the Equally Safe delivery plan. These are cross cutting issues and it would be more appropriate to have them located as part of an introduction or indeed as part of a gender inequality strategy of which violence against women is a strand.”

- Violence Against Women / Gender Based Violence Partnership

“While supportive of the direction of this work, however, we believe that there is a disproportionate focus on women within the workplace which, although hugely important, appears to dominate the focus of this priority.”

- Other Public Body, including Executive Agencies, NDPBs, NHS etc.

“However, [Our organisation] questions the direct impact that some of the actions have on VAW&G (particularly in view of the short timescales) and suggest focusing on key actions rather than some of more tangential value. We are concerned this delivery plan is diluting the focus on VAW.”

- Violence Against Women / Gender Based Violence Partnership

Specific actions that were disagreed with on the basis that they would not directly impact on violence against women included:

- “Take forward a transformative programme to expand free Early Learning and Childcare entitlement to 1,140 hours per year by 2020, including piloting a deposit guarantee scheme for childcare places”
- “Establish a “Returners” project so that parents who have had a career break can get help updating skills and knowledge”
- “Through the development of a strategy, address gender stereotyping and improve gender balance in science, technology, engineering and maths (STEM) at school to ensure greater uptake of courses and apprenticeships by women and girls that are traditionally seen as male-dominated like engineering, construction and digital”
- “Establish an Equality in Sport and Physical Activity Forum and develop a £300K Gender Equality in Sport fund to address the barriers to women’s participation”
- “Champion our Partnership for Change campaign, encouraging private and third sector organisations to work towards gender balance on their boards by 2020”
- “Support the Women 50:50 campaign and the improvement of women’s access to public office by encouraging partnership working to break down barriers to participation”
- “Introduce legislation to redress gender imbalances and improve women’s representation on public boards in Scotland, using the new powers transferred to the Scottish Parliament through the Scotland Act”

Specific objections were made in relation to certain actions. There was disagreement with the action “Support the Women 50:50 campaign and the improvement of women’s access to public office by encouraging partnership working to break down barriers to participation”, as a respondent was concerned that as the Bill currently stands, a person’s gender might supersede other protected and under-represented characteristics, such as minority ethnic candidates or those with a disability. It was suggested that the £300k Equality in Sport Fund could more effectively be distributed through existing programmes rather than establishing a new forum, e.g. it was noted that the NHS and Local Authorities are already addressing the issue girls and women in sport through strategies such as “Local Active Living”. The action around a “returners project” was criticised on the grounds that it was based on a programme developed for women returning to the STEM sector, and it should be reviewed to ensure that it was appropriate for use in other sectors. In relation to the action around “successful bidders to deliver devolved employment services”, it was noted that it was unclear what levers would be available to encourage employers to consider flexible working and it was suggested that other causes of women’s inequality at work, such as occupational segregation should also be considered within this.

Actions that are missing/should be added to priority 2

Q8 Are there any actions that you think are missing under priority 2? - Do you have any suggestions for additional actions to focus on?

Table A6, in Annex 1, shows the range of actions/areas that respondents felt were missing from priority 2. A lot of the gaps identified were in the “women’s economic inequality” section.

Understanding gender

It was suggested that the action around promoting equality impact assessments needed to go further than just “promote” their use.

Parenting and childcare

It was noted that there was no mention of the role of fathers. Respondents felt that in order for women’s equality to be fully achieved men need to take a fair share of childcare and other domestic tasks, as currently women do the bulk of unpaid care. It was also mentioned that gender stereotypes exist, and that there can be stigma attached to being a working mother or a stay at home father. It was noted that there is no mention of other caring responsibilities, which again tend to be carried out by women and can impact on training and employment opportunities.

“Under 'Parenting and Childcare' specific mention of dads is notably absent. Women's economic, social and political equality will not be realised until dads share more of women's unpaid labour. This includes childcare, but also other caring responsibilities and housework. We would suggest actions should be included focused on enhancing take up of shared parental leave as well as developing flexible working for all, regardless of gender, sector, profession and grade.”

- Third Sector

“The promotion of fathers being more involved in child-care and parenting rather than placing the burden of change on women. This would also help challenge gender stereo-types that can restrict and limit opportunities for women to participate in civic society at a community level”.

- Third Sector and Representative Body for Professionals/Trade Union

Additional comments under parenting and childcare related to the “Returners” project, and querying what this meant for those in low-paid occupations. There was also a suggestion that there should be actions relating to pregnancy, e.g. encouraging young mothers to remain in school where possible.

Women's economic inequality

The most common suggestion here was that there should be an action relating to the under-representation of either gender in a particular sector, which would include encouraging men into traditionally female sectors, and appropriately valuing and rewarding those who work in these sectors (regardless of their gender). Childcare, primary teaching and nursing were given as examples of typically female-dominated professions.

“In addition, [our] members argued that the draft action plan should not just be encouraging women to move in to roles traditionally undertaken by men. There is also a need to place a greater value on roles women have traditionally done (e.g. childcare, primary teaching) and to also encourage men to enter employment in these sectors in order to improve the gender balance.”

– Third Sector

There were suggestions that there was a need to implement wider structural changes, such as improving wages, promoting the living wage, improving terms and conditions and job security, and increasing women's purchasing power as a means of making society fairer and tackling gender inequality.

“There is insufficient recognition of the impact of the changing labour market, with the increase in casual labour, lack of contracts and employment protections, and job insecurity. These multiple factors, often then added to with disability or race discrimination, will require the development of specific targeted resources to support women.”

- Representative Body for Professionals/Trade Union

“Improving women’s purchasing power and reducing economic inequality is an opportunity to improve people’s ability to keep themselves safe (e.g. having an escape fund, reducing their risk of exploitation). In addition to the actions around Universal credit, we would therefore like to see more actions aimed at strengthening people’s economic stability (e.g. Living Wage).”

- Third Sector

There were suggestions that the Department of Work and Pensions (DWP) two child cap on child benefits, also sometimes known as the “rape clause” should be abolished in Scotland and that the Scottish Government should say more about what it would do to mitigate against this clause.

There were suggestions that the action around tackling pregnancy and maternity discrimination could be strengthened and could go further, including a suggestion about working with health professionals to support vulnerable pregnant women. One trade union called for more support for women throughout their pregnancy and up until their child starts school and for “more robust penalties for employers who seek to by-pass legislation that is there to protect pregnant women and those on maternity leave”. They quoted a TUC report which found that “77 per cent of pregnant women and new mothers in the UK reported having suffered some form of discrimination in the workplace.”

It was felt that flexible working should be provided for workers of any gender, and that shared parental leave should be promoted, as it was felt that its uptake had been quite low to date.

“The UK Government’s introduction of Shared Parental Leave (SPL) has had insignificant uptake. When issuing guidance around maternity best practice, policies around paternal leave should also be included.”

- Third Sector

It was suggested that there should be actions aimed at tackling sexual harassment in the workplace, and it was noted that experiencing domestic abuse could have a significant impact on a woman’s ability to engage with the labour market and that that should be taken into account.

“Experiencing domestic abuse has a profound impact on women’s capacity to work, career choices and ability to enter and progress in the paid labour market. Therefore, all actions under ‘Women’s economic inequality’ need to consider this impact”

- Third Sector

It was suggested that more should be said around Modern Apprenticeships, and reducing occupational segregation within Modern Apprenticeships by encouraging young women to undertake apprenticeships in “non-traditional roles”.

In addition to the action to reduce employment inequality for ethnic minority women, it was felt that something similar should be included for disabled women.

The importance of dignity at work policies, aimed at preventing and tackling all forms of harassment, discrimination and bullying, were also highlighted.

One trade union expressed a desire to follow the Australian example of the right to paid leave for women escaping domestic abuse,

Women's civic and social inequality

There was a feeling that actions under this heading were too narrow and should be broadened out. For example it was suggested that the action to “establish an Equality in Sport and Physical Activity Forum and develop a £300K Gender Equality in Sport fund to address the barriers to women’s participation” should be extended to include actions on culture, the arts, media and politics too, as well as suggestions that it should start earlier and focus on girls and young women.

It was also suggested that involvement in charity and community boards and participation in volunteering be included within this section too. It was suggested that more actions were required to tackle the barriers that women face in relation to public and political involvement, such as the need for family-friendly working practices in these areas.

“The action on sport is welcome within the ‘Women’s civic and social inequality’ section. It would also be beneficial to look at the arts and culture as ultimately it’s about creating opportunities for girls, as well as positively influencing boys and challenging gender stereotypes, whether in sport or the arts.”

- Violence Against Women / Gender Based Violence Partnership

“In relation to women engaged in cultural and civic life, there is a very limited focus on sport and a narrow definition of representation, confined as it is to Board representation and public office. Expanding this to include the media, the arts and other cultural spaces and institutions would be helpful in seeking to achieve this objective.”

- Other Public Body, including Executive Agencies, NDPBs, NHS etc.

“We feel that the strategy would benefit from a greater focus on cultural and political actions that could be taken to address violence against women and the attitudes that enable it. In terms of cultural actions, this should include finding innovative means to highlight and celebrate the diverse and vital roles women have in the arts, media and society more generally, championing role models for young girls and women to aspire to. This should work in tandem with challenging and working to eliminate abusive and objectifying representations of women in mainstream society, including within pornography”.

- Third Sector

Other suggestions of actions to include

It was felt that specific actions were needed around keeping women safe, particularly in public spaces, and on transport.

“One of the objectives in this section includes the word ‘safe’, however there are no explicit actions around increasing women’s safety as part of ensuring women are equal citizens. We would suggest that actions to tackle sexual harassment and misogyny in public spaces be included in this section.”

- Violence Against Women / Gender Based Violence Partnership

“Areas such as transport, the Place Standard, housing etc. are not mentioned in this section. Women’s experiences of public space and their safety are important and should be included in the design and planning of their lived environment.”

- Other Public Body, including Executive Agencies, NDPBs, NHS etc.

There were also suggestions relating to a cultural shift in attitudes, including changing men’s attitudes, promoting women’s aspirations and self-esteem and challenging the “everyday sexism” that women face.

“There needs to be an inclusion of specific activities that challenge the everyday sexism that women and girls experience in the home, the workplace and in their communities. We need

activity that contributes to reducing the tolerance and acceptability of sexual harassment and misogyny in public spaces.”

- Violence Against Women / Gender Based Violence Partnership

As in priority 1, the role of the media, and how it represents women was mentioned.

“We believe that there should be action (s) to address the negative gender roles portrayed by the media and in advertising. From infancy children are exposed to often very subtle images that portray women and girls as unequal to men and boys, and we believe that for gender equality to be realised, this needs to be tackled at a government level.”

- Representative Body for Professionals/Trade Union

Other suggestions for actions which were felt to be missing from this section included the right to safe, accessible housing, and suggestions of legislation change so that sex/gender identity would be covered by hate crime legislation, and to embed the UN Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women within Scottish law. There was a suggestion that “consideration should be given to examining the impact on levels of violence against women and girls in areas where misogyny has been included within the definition of hate crime - to date by Nottinghamshire Police and North Yorkshire Police” – Local Authority.

Priority 3: Interventions are early and effective, preventing violence and maximising the safety and wellbeing of women, children and young people

Priority 3: Interventions are early and effective, preventing violence and maximising the safety and wellbeing of women, children and young people

Objectives

- Justice responses are robust, swift, consistent and coordinated
- Women, children and young people access relevant, effective and integrated services
- Service providers competently identify violence against women and girls, and respond effectively to women, children and young people affected

Contributing workstreams: Capability and Capacity, Justice

Priority 3 listed 21 actions, under the 3 headings of “Public Services”, “Specialist Services” and “Integrated Services”

Respondents were asked if they agreed that these were the right actions, if there were any that they were particularly supportive of, any that they didn’t agree with, and if there were any missing/anything additional that should be added.

Q9. Do you agree or disagree that the actions listed under priority 3 are the right actions to help meet the objectives of priority 3?

Sixty-seven respondents answered this question. Two-thirds (66%) agreed that these were the right actions, 10% disagreed and around a quarter (24%) neither agreed nor disagreed (see table 4 below).

Table 4: Q9. Do you agree or disagree that the actions listed under priority 3 are the right actions to help meet the objectives of priority 3?

	%	No.
Agree	66%	44
Disagree	10%	7
Neither Agree nor Disagree	24%	16

N = 67

Support for Priority 3 Actions

Q10 Please tell us about any of the priority 3 actions that you are particularly supportive of.

Table A7 in Annex 1, lists all of the priority 3 actions, and shows how many respondents said that they were particularly supportive of those actions, as well as indicating the numbers of other comments provided at question 6. Some respondents explicitly stated that they supported all of the priority 3 actions.

Of actions that were singled out by respondents as being ones that they were particularly supportive of, the most popular actions were:

- Improve the experience of vulnerable witnesses, initially focusing on child complainers and witnesses through the greater use of pre-recorded evidence (15)
- Initiate an independent review of how national and local specialist services for women and children experiencing gender based violence are commissioned, and how we can ensure quality and sustainability of service (14)
- Share lessons from the “Safe and Together” model of child protection in a domestic abuse setting, encouraging a common understanding that perpetrators of abuse should be assessed and held accountable on their parenting choices which includes the perpetration of domestic abuse (13)

Public Services

Of the actions listed under “public services”, the most supported action was “Improve the experience of vulnerable witnesses, initially focusing on child complainers and witnesses through the greater use of pre-recorded evidence”. Respondents were supportive of improving the experience of vulnerable witnesses. Children were specifically mentioned in the action, and some respondents felt that the action should go further than just greater use of pre-recorded evidence. Some also mentioned other groups that they classed as being particularly vulnerable, which included victims with learning disabilities, those with mental health problems and those who identify as LBGTI.

“We welcome the commitment to improve the experience of vulnerable witnesses. However we are concerned that action around this should not stop short at greater use of pre-recorded evidence but go farther to address the holistic needs of child witnesses in the criminal justice system.”

- Third Sector

There was also support for the other actions relating to the Courts, “Ensure court waiting times for domestic abuse cases and sexual offences cases in solemn proceedings are in line with agreed targets” and “Agree with the Scottish Courts and Tribunals Service opportunities for managing how domestic abuse cases are progressed within Scotland, including the consideration of Domestic Abuse courts and case management solutions where a Domestic Abuse Court is not considered appropriate”.

“Court waiting times are in line with targets’ - any action which can be taken to reduce waiting times and the stress which this can place on family and victims is welcome”

- Third Sector and Representative Body for Professionals/Trade Union

“We believe that there needs to be increased awareness amongst those working in the legal system of the impact of domestic abuse on women and children. Although there has been some progress, we still need to move right away from a culture where women are criticised or judged for their behaviour or "choices" when in a domestic abuse situation.”

- Representative Body for Professionals/Trade Union

Respondents were also particularly supportive of the action around sharing lessons from the “safe and together” model of child protection. A number of them spoke of having used it effectively, and wanted the action strengthened beyond “sharing lessons” to rolling the programme out more widely across Scotland.

“The action on Safe & together is welcome. However - S&T is evidenced-based and there is now enough experience of it in Scotland to know it works and provide a key element of the response to ensure children and families are safe. So 'sharing lessons' is no longer good enough - the action should be strengthened to indicate support for the national implementation of S&T and indicate how the Government plan to support this.”

- Violence Against Women / Gender Based Violence Partnership

There was support for the action “Consider how learning from the National Trauma Training Framework can be incorporated to better inform the development of services, and identify leadership in the justice system to take this forward”. It was felt that a better understanding of trauma was vital, across all services and sectors that work with women affected by violence. It was felt that it was important to improve links to trauma specific services in mental health and in the third sector. It was felt that the NHS Education Scotland (NES) Transforming Trauma Knowledge and Skills Framework was “a useful evidence based starting point for considering staff and service development.” - Other Public Body. And that it could support a number of other priority 3 actions. E.g. “medics against violence” by ensuring that all staff are able to recognise and respond effectively to people affected by trauma; the actions around forensic examination, and improving the experience of vulnerable witnesses to reduce the risk of re-traumatisation of those who have experienced sexual violence and vulnerable witnesses.

“Recognition of trauma and how it manifests is crucial for any service working in the violence against women sector.”

- Third Sector

In relation to forensic examination services:

“Individuals accessing this service will, by definition, have recently experienced sexual violence, and are likely to be vulnerable to re-traumatisation... It is well recognised that the way in which both physical and verbal evidence is taken from victims at this sensitive stage has the capacity to significantly affect the longer term outcomes in terms of psychological wellbeing. These principles of trauma informed practice should be adopted in so far as possible into every aspect of the victim’s experience of the examination process.”

Other Public Body, including Executive Agencies, NDPBs, NHS etc.

There was also support for the action to “Ensure that commissioned training resources of local authority housing and homelessness hubs incorporate domestic abuse competence”, as it was noted that women and children experiencing domestic abuse will come into contact with a range of services, including housing, and it is important that their cases are handled appropriately.

“[Our] members were particularly supportive of: “Ensure that commissioned training resources of local authority housing and homelessness hubs incorporate domestic abuse competence” – [our] members were encouraged to see this action in the plan, given the potentially important role that other services, such as housing, can play in identifying underlying domestic abuse issues and linking women in to relevant support services. There may be benefit in expanding this action further, to include other services e.g. substance misuse services, mental health services.”

- Third Sector

Specialist Services

Under specialist services, there was particular support for the action to “Initiate an independent review of how national and local specialist services for women and children experiencing gender based violence are commissioned, and how we can ensure quality and sustainability of service”, as it was felt that high quality services are essential, as is consistency of service provision across Scotland.

“We particularly support this action as we are aware that services for women and children are not uniform across local authority areas in Scotland. There should be access to prevention, support and recovery services in every local authority area, for every woman and child who needs it. We cannot over emphasise the importance of effective support to recover from domestic abuse as a key factor in preventing it's recurrence.”

- Representative Body for Professionals/Trade Union

“A good quality strategic approach to commissioning can bring benefits to both service providers and service users since it ensures that people have access to the right support at the right time in the right place. This approach also presents an opportunity for collaborative working across social work and social care and the third sector.”

- Third Sector and Representative Body for Professionals/Trade Union

There was also support for the action to “Commission the development of a sustainable model of training around gender based violence for public and third sector services”. Respondents supported the idea of sustainable training, that would promote collaboration across the public and third sector. It was also suggested that the training should include the key messages from the Safe and Together model.

“[We] are particularly pleased to see the commissioning of a sustainable model of training around GBV for public and third sector services and would hope that the Government will utilise the skills and knowledge of specialist services in the development and delivery of this as a long term investment at a local level.”

- Third Sector

“‘Commission the development of a sustainable model of training around gender based violence for public and third sector services’ – [Our organisation] is keen to support the development of the model of training and to promote collaborative working and training across sectors in order to enhance integrated services.”

- Third Sector

There was also support for the action “Consider the findings from the National Advocacy Scoping Exercise commissioned to help understand the provision of services in this area with the aim to determine where the provision of services could be extended and improved”, as advocacy services were seen as important. It was mentioned that there is a gap in provision of advocacy services, particularly for children and young people who have experienced domestic abuse, and that specialist services for children and young people are required. “Soft advocacy” which combines emotional and practical support with advocacy was also highlighted as important.

“[We] are pleased that the finding from the National Advocacy Scoping Exercise will be considered in order to identify where services could be extended and improved. This project has significantly improved the experience that survivors navigating the justice system have and has strengthened the communication between local services.”

- Third Sector

There was also support for "Develop the Scottish Women’s Rights Centre as a model for legal services, consider the currently unmet need for victims of gender based violence and the appropriate model of support for women, children and young people experiencing violence" as “the establishment of the centre has provided a valuable resource for both practitioners and for women who access the service.” – Third Sector

Integrated services

There was support for the two actions included under integrated services, as multi-agency working and consistency across Scotland were seen as important for supporting women affected by violence against women.

“Support local VAWP in their improvement journey – [We] recognise that the structure and position of VAWPs vary across Scotland. We would support any action which supports all VAWPs to have a strong and representative voice within their local communities.”

- Third Sector

Other

Of the “other” comments made in relation to priority 3, the most frequently mentioned was the importance of early identification and intervention, in order to protect women and children. It was felt that all agencies had an important role to play in this.

“Early identification and intervention is essential to eliminating violence and its negative consequences in women and children’s lives. It is vital that services that come into daily contact with women, children and young people are able to identify those at risk and offer an appropriate, safe and consistent response. Professionals within Early Learning and Childcare can contribute towards this action, but would need appropriate support and training in recognising and dealing with such concerns.”

- Representative Body for Professionals/Trade Union

“The focus on improving identification and responses to women and children affected by all forms of VAWG is very welcome. However - this cannot be something that sits with specialist services alone - this is something that all services (public and voluntary agencies) must be part of. The aim needs to be 'VAWG is everyone's responsibility'.”

- Violence Against Women / Gender Based Violence Partnership

Priority 3 actions that aren’t supported

Q11 Please tell us about any priority 3 actions that you don’t agree with.

Some respondents said that there were no priority 3 actions that they disagreed with/they agreed with them all. Table A8 in Annex 1, shows the actions and areas that respondents disagreed with, and the numbers of comments given.

In some cases, where respondents disagreed with an action, it was because they felt that it did not go far enough and because they felt that it should be strengthened, rather than because they fundamentally disagreed with the action.

“There are several key actions in the delivery plan whereby it is noted you will ‘share the learning’ (Safe and Together P24), ‘continue to look at’ (Perpetrator Programmes P26) ‘consult on how to embed’ (Multi-agency structures to support high risk victims of domestic abuse P25), ‘consider the findings’ of (National Advocacy Scoping Exercise p24). We would welcome a stronger commitment and emphasis on implementation at a national level to drive forward improvement and to ensure that these areas are adequately resourced.”

Actions which were specifically highlighted as not going far enough/needing to be strengthened included:

- Share lessons from the “Safe and Together” model of child protection in a domestic abuse setting, encouraging a common understanding that perpetrators of abuse should be assessed and held accountable on their parenting choices which includes the perpetration of domestic abuse
- Ensure that commissioned training resources of local authority housing and homelessness hubs incorporate domestic abuse competence
- Develop the Scottish Women’s Rights Centre as a model for legal services, consider the currently unmet need for victims of gender based violence and the appropriate model of support for women, children and young people experiencing violence
- Consider the findings from the National Advocacy Scoping Exercise commissioned to help understand the provision of services in this area with the aim to determine where the provision of services could be extended and improved
- Consult on how to embed consistent and effective operation of multi-agency structures to support high risk victims of domestic abuse

Public Services

Respondents who disagreed with the action around “Medics Against Violence” questioned why this particular programme had been singled out, when it was one amongst many, and it was suggested that reference to the NHS Violence Against Women Strategy, and reference to the wide range of training undertaken within the NHS would be more helpful.

“Although it is clearly the case that Medics Against Violence do important work, it should also be acknowledged they are not the only ones and their work should be linked to the NHS VAW strategy”

Amongst those who disagreed with the action to “Develop the health service response to preventing and tackling violence against women using the World Health Organisation’s resolution on gender based violence as a framework”, there was an ask that children were explicitly mentioned in the action, and a request that any such response include “gendered analysis and is trauma informed”.

The National Trauma Framework was criticised for using a medical model rather than a social model, and it was suggested that a social model was more appropriate and effective for survivors of domestic or sexual abuse.

It was suggested that the action around strengthening the social work response to domestic abuse should be widened out to include all agencies and a wide range of professionals, for example health visitors, early learning and childcare staff and teachers.

Specialist Services

There was some disagreement around the action to “Commission the development of a sustainable model of training around gender based violence for public and third sector services”, and the fact that it sat under the specialist services heading. It was suggested that it would be better sitting under “public services”, as it was noted that public services have a duty to ensure that staff are highly trained and able to respond to all forms of violence against women, and that this was not being properly acknowledged by locating this action within “specialist services”.

“We are unclear as to why the training focus in the document is included in the specialist services section. Public services have a duty to ensure staff are highly trained and able to respond to all forms of VAW... We believe that a focus on training should be located within the public sector part of the framework, acknowledging that specialist services have a key role to play in identifying areas of training need based on survivor views and experiences.”

- Violence Against Women / Gender Based Violence Partnership

Actions that are missing/should be added to priority 3

Q12 Are there any actions that you think are missing under priority 3?

Some respondents said that they could not identify any gaps under priority 3. Others identified a range of actions that they thought were missing and suggestions for additional things to be added in under priority 3, as can be seen in table A9 in Annex 1. Some of the gaps related to identified actions, but where respondents felt that these actions could go further or that more clarity was required around them. One of the most commonly mentioned gaps was the need for violence against women training for professionals.

Public Services

A number of the “public services” gaps related to actions which respondents felt should go further. In some cases it was felt that where domestic abuse was referenced in an action, this should be widened out to include all forms of violence against women and girls. For example it was felt that the action around strengthening social work’s response to domestic abuse, needed to include all forms of violence against women and girls, and also childhood sexual abuse.

Similarly the action “Ensure that commissioned training resources of local authority housing and homelessness hubs incorporate domestic abuse competence” was supported but some respondents wanted that training extended to include all forms of violence against women. In addition there was a specific ask for it to include LGBT awareness training, to better support and meet the needs of LGBT people, with one LGBT charity reflecting on research they had carried out with young people and professionals in this area.

“Commissioned training resources of local authority and housing and homelessness hubs incorporate domestic abuse competence - they should also include competence on other areas such as sexual violence, HBV [Honour Based Violence], forced marriage and FGM [Female Genital Mutilation].”

- Third Sector

“The activity on commissioned training for housing and homelessness services must include LGBT domestic abuse and LGBT awareness training... Professionals across the housing and homelessness sector rated their confidence to support LGBT people in their service as very low. Those who scored themselves higher had received LGBT training.”

- Third Sector

Respondents also wanted the action to “Develop options for funding supported housing, including domestic abuse refuge providers, to ensure that they continue to receive appropriate resources for their work” to go further, to ensure that women have access to accommodation that appropriately meets their needs. It was noted that generic homelessness services would come into contact with women who had experienced gender based violence and that they needed to be able to appropriately support these women.

“We would support the development of funding options that enable all women who have experienced abuse and violence to access appropriate and safe supported accommodation (when appropriate) that is tailored to their needs. Refuge provision, although vital, is only one part of this picture.”

- Third Sector

There was a comment relating to the action to “Share lessons from the ‘Safe and Together’ model of child protection, that there should be more focus on the perpetrator’s accountability for their choices and actions when it comes to arranging child contact, and that more consideration should be given to the quality of such contact. There was a suggestion that parental rights for contact with their child sometimes supersede the rights of the child and that this must be addressed.

In relation to the action concerned with improving the experience of vulnerable witnesses, specific reference was made to people with learning disabilities and the need to support them appropriately to enable them to give evidence in court.

“In response to improving the experiences of vulnerable witnesses, [our organisation] suggests further investment into appropriate adults that have specific training and experience in supporting people with learning disabilities in the criminal justice system to make sure that their accounts are represented accurately and sensitively.”

- Academic/research

There were a number of other justice related suggestions for actions respondents felt were missing. These included women as offenders, as it was noted that women with histories of violence and abuse are over-represented in the prison system, and are both victims as well as offenders. As such actions were suggested including:

“An action around developing training which promotes a gender-informed approach to working with women in the criminal justice system... An action around provision of suitable accommodation - The Angiolini Commission on Women Offenders (2012, p30) noted “One of the key issues highlighted to the Commission by practitioners and women offenders was the lack of suitable accommodation, especially on release from prison. Significant concerns were raised about the appropriateness of hostels and many women talked about the difficulty of managing in the chaotic environment of hostels and the high levels of drug abuse and violence.””

- Third Sector

Concern was raised about the use of “floating trials” (where the trial could start on any day in a given week rather than on a specific date) in rape cases and the additional distress that this can cause victims, and it was suggested that there should be an action to tackle this.

“the use of floating trials in rape cases is now routine, and is causing significant distress for complainers. This should be addressed to give complainers more certainty about when and where their trial will be.”

- Third Sector

Justice related actions requested included:

- A feedback system for victims who have experienced the criminal justice system.
- Piloting the recording of rape complainers’ statement to the police, to be used as evidence in chief during any subsequent trial.
- Introducing protections within the civil justice system e.g. a bar on direct cross examination in rape / stalking / domestic abuse cases and a guarantee of anonymity.
- More unification between civil and criminal justice systems – “Were there less of a gulf between the systems, a woman who has reported her ex-partner for domestic abuse may also have her child contact case heard by the same Sheriff. This would bridge the gap between these systems, ease their trauma and ensure the Sheriff hearing the case would have more information with which to make their decision.” – Third Sector
- Emphasise protection of privacy for victims in court in relation to e.g. sexual history, and sexual orientation
- Provision of advocacy support for children, particularly in child contact cases.
- Specialist risk assessment in civil courts where there are disputes over contact and concerns about domestic abuse.
- The impact of direct cross examination on victims of GBV should be examined and protective measures should be put in place.

There were some missing actions highlighted around health as well. It was felt that the NHS response to violence against women needed to be strengthened. It was noted that there was no mention of routine enquiry within this priority. It was felt that all NHS staff needed to know that there was a clear pathway of referral if they felt that someone was at risk. Cultural competence was also mentioned in relation to improving care for minority ethnic groups.

“The actions related to the NHS require substantial expansion. The NHS has had considerable investment in its sensitive enquiry programme and this needs to be developed further. We would like to see more detail about how the health service and health board’s will further develop its response to preventing and tackling VAW, how this will be implemented and when.”

- Academic/research

It was also noted that the NHS is much more than a clinical environment, providing healthcare to individuals, and that more needs to be said about the prevention role played by the NHS and Health and Social Care Partnerships (HSCPs), particularly the work undertaken by health improvement and public health staff.

In relation to the actions around forensic examination services, it was suggested that the impact of rationalisation of the distribution of locations where forensic examinations services are available on victims of sexual assault should be examined.

Other public services comments included that there was a need for public services to be better at spotting women at risk of violence against women, and intervening appropriately. In particular, it was mentioned that it would be helpful to have an action aimed at extending awareness in the Early Learning and Childcare sector to support early identification and early intervention for women and children.

In response to the action to “develop draft violence against women quality standards for public services responding to victims and survivors, it was suggested that the recently published Health and Social Care Standards could be useful in informing specific actions and avoiding duplication.

There was also a comment that services should not be split into public services and specialist services, as it was pointed out that public services such as the NHS do provide specialist services for women affected by violence against women. E.g. NHS psychologists trained in addressing trauma and abuse and midwives trained to deal with the impacts of FGM.

“There was a concern that the distinction between ‘specialist services’ and ‘public services’ in the plan made it read as if public services were not specialist services. It was felt that it is important to highlight that it is not just third sector organisations that deliver specialist services but that the NHS and other public services also deliver specialist services for people affected by VAWG and the plan should hold them to account for doing so.”

- Violence Against Women / Gender Based Violence Partnership

Specialist Services

The importance of advocacy provision for women and children and young people affected by violence was highlighted, including for women who have learning disabilities.

It was felt that more information was needed around the action to “Initiate an independent review of how national and local specialist services for women and children experiencing gender based violence are commissioned, and how we can ensure quality and sustainability of service.” It was also suggested that funding and resourcing needed to be looked at as part of this.

Integrated services

Under integrated services, it was felt that an action should have been included to fund and support Multi-Agency Risk Assessment Conferences (MARACs) consistently across Scotland. It was also noted that multi-agency working ought to be improved in relation to forms of VAW that are wider than domestic abuse.

“There is a need to strengthen the action around ‘consulting’ on how to ensure high quality MARACs are operating across Scotland. Specifically, we would welcome a commitment in the Delivery Plan to ensure that all MARACs have the resources they need to operate in a high quality way. This is likely to include funding for MARAC coordinators/ administrators in every area.”

- Violence Against Women / Gender Based Violence Partnership

“Scottish Government has supported the roll out and development of the Multi-Agency Risk Assessment (Marac) model, recognising its central role in bridging the siloes between agencies to make victims and their children safer, sooner. Embedding this process in England and Wales over the last decade has reduced the time it takes victims at highest risk of murder to get help from 5 years to 2.5. Given the evidence and support for this model, we feel it is important to reference it here given that WholeLives highlighted that it currently takes 4 years in Scotland for victims at highest risk to get help”

- Third Sector

“They [our members] also highlighted the importance of multi-agency working in relation to support for victims of other forms of abuse and are keen to see better integration of services, so that a more holistic approach to support provision is taken.”

- Third Sector

It was suggested that there should be a specific action around the supporting community planning partnerships (CPPs) to deliver appropriate approaches to violence against women and girls to improve their outcomes. The importance of collaborative and effective leadership amongst locally elected representatives and leaders of CPPs was highlighted.

Other Suggestions

It was felt that this priority (and the Delivery Plan more generally) should include all forms of VAW, including honour based violence (HBV), Female Genital Mutilation (FGM), forced marriage, rape, child sexual abuse, human trafficking and commercial sexual exploitation (CSE), stalking and harassment. It was felt that too many actions specially referenced domestic abuse, rather than encompassing all forms of VAW.

“There is a need to move away from this silo approach to violence against women. There is a danger of conflating VAWG with domestic abuse to the exclusion of rape; sexual violence; sexual abuse; FGM; CSE; Forced and child marriage; prostitution, trafficking and other forms of commercial sexual exploitation; stalking and harassment.”

- Violence Against Women / Gender Based Violence Partnership

“The majority of the actions pointed within this priority are focussed on domestic abuse. Sexual crimes are addressed exclusively through forensic medical examinations and there is no mention of stalking, human trafficking, commercial sexual exploitation and honour based violence, all of which require an improved and robust response. The spectrum of violence against women is not represented.”

- Third Sector

The need to train professionals across the public sector about responding to VAW was highlighted. It was felt that training needed to be wider than domestic abuse and include the full spectrum of VAW, including honour based violence and women who are affected by prostitution. Training in relation to the “Safe and Together Model “ was mentioned, as was the need for more training around LGBT issues and learning disability awareness. Professions who ought to have access to VAW training were mentioned and included: social workers, health workers, staff in homelessness hubs (beyond domestic abuse), teachers, sheriffs, judges and court reporters.

“The ‘Public Services’ actions that focus on training should not be restricted to domestic abuse competence or just housing, but to competence in all forms of gender based violence through mandatory training provision for all key services.”

- Violence Against Women / Gender Based Violence Partnership

There were some comments relating to the role that education could play in this priority, these included ensuring that VAWG messages are embedded into Curriculum for Excellence (CfE), schools taking a zero-tolerance approach to gender-based bullying, and the role of teachers in supporting children who have experienced abuse.

“We will be interested to see the VAW quality standards for public services responding to victims and survivors, as teachers often support children who have experienced abuse, and teachers can sometimes be the first person to whom this has been disclosed.”

- Representative Body for Professionals/Trade Union

The importance of the relationship between a professional and a women or child was mentioned. It was noted that in order to competently identify violence against women and children professionals need to be approachable, trustworthy, who listen believe and respond. These skills need to be fostered across all professionals in all sectors. When working with children, children need to feel empowered and supported in order to disclose information.

There were also requests for an action relating to stalking, as it was felt that this was missing from the Delivery plan.

Priority 4: Men desist from all forms of violence against women and girls and perpetrators of such violence receive a robust and effective response

Priority 4: Men desist from all forms of violence against women and girls and perpetrators of such violence receive a robust and effective response

Objectives

- Justice responses are robust, swift, consistent and coordinated
- Men who carry out violence against women and girls are identified early and held to account by the criminal and civil justice system.
- Relevant links are made between the experience of women, children and young people in the criminal and civil system

Contributing workstreams: Justice

Priority 4 listed 7 actions, under the heading of “Tackling Perpetrators”.

Respondents were asked if they agreed that these were the right actions, if there were any that they were particularly supportive of, any that they didn’t agree with, and if there were any missing/anything additional that should be added.

Q13. Do you agree or disagree that the actions listed under priority 4 are the right actions to help meet the objectives of priority 4?

Sixty-four respondents answered this question. Over half (59%) agreed that these were the right actions, 16% disagreed and a quarter (25%) neither agreed nor disagreed (see table 5 below).

Table 5: Q13. Do you agree or disagree that the actions listed under priority 4 are the right actions to help meet the objectives of priority 4?

	%	No.
Agree	59%	38
Disagree	16%	10
Neither Agree nor Disagree	25%	16

N = 64

Support for Priority 4 Actions

Q14. Please tell us about any of the priority 4 actions that you are particularly supportive of.

Table A10 in Annex 1 lists all of the priority 4 actions, and shows how many respondents said that they were particularly supportive of those actions.. Some respondents stated that they were supportive off all the priority 4 actions listed.

Of actions that were singled out by respondents as being ones that they were particularly supportive of, the most popular actions were:

- Continue to look at perpetrator programmes and consider where further efforts are required to identify and tackle behaviour with a view to rehabilitation and change (13)
- Review training provided for all professionals within the Justice System to ensure that there is an understanding of the new offence for those investigating domestic abuse cases including trauma informed practice for all people who work with women and children (12)
- Introduce a Domestic Abuse Bill to Parliament which seeks to criminalise coercive control (11)

Tackling Perpetrators

The action that was most widely supported was the action to “continue to look at perpetrator programmes and consider where further efforts are required to identify and tackle behaviour with a view to rehabilitation and change”. However, amongst those that supported this action, a number felt that the action needed to be strengthened and go further. In particular it was noted that provision of such programmes was inconsistent across Scotland and that there was a need for earlier intervention through voluntary programmes, rather than only on court-mandated ones.

“Although it is important to consider the most effective approaches to working with perpetrators - the action 'continue to look at perpetrator programmes' needs to be much stronger with a clear commitment to how the Government would support local areas to introduce and embed such programmes. At the moment we still have a situation where in some areas there are no programmes for working with perpetrators - and more generally there are very few (if any) programmes that are not linked to the criminal justice process, that engage with and challenge perpetrator at an early stage (e.g. voluntary programmes).”

- Violence Against Women / Gender Based Violence Partnership

There was also support for the actions to “introduce a Domestic Abuse Bill to Parliament which seeks to criminalise coercive control”, to “commence the Abusive Behaviour and Sexual Harm (Scotland) Act” and to “review training provided for all professionals within the Justice System to ensure that there is an understanding of the new offence for those investigating domestic abuse cases including trauma informed practice for all people who work with women and children”.

The criminalisation of coercive control was seen as positive.

“[We] welcome the introduction of the Domestic Abuse Bill as an opportunity to bridge the gulf between women’s experiences of domestic abuse and coercive control and the tools the Scottish Criminal Justice System has to deal with it.”

- Third Sector

An additional comment was made that women needed to be protected from coercive control committed by anyone in their household, e.g. in cases where women live within a wider family unit coercive control might be perpetrated by other family members, such as parents-in-law.

It was felt that training professionals involved with it, was required to ensure the success of the implementation of the Domestic Abuse Bill. The trauma informed approach was also praised by some respondents.

“The success of the new offence will be determined by how it is implemented and interpreted. Training is crucial in equipping police, prosecutors and the judiciary with the necessary knowledge of how coercive control manifests, particularly in relation to diverse identities e.g. LGBT people.”

- Third Sector

There was also support for the action “work with the Scottish Civil Justice Council on case management in family actions, including in relation to child welfare hearings - recognising that these types of hearings and contact cases require careful consideration to ensure that victims of domestic abuse are protected from further abuse”. It was felt that within this action, it was essential that a children’s rights approach was taken and that the child’s voice was heard. It was also noted that this should link with Safe and Together principles.

“We welcome the intention to work with the Scottish Civic Justice Council [sic] on case management in family action. It is noted that careful consideration is required to ensure victims are protected from further abuse, and as part of this we would strongly suggest that all children and young people who are involved are aware of their rights and that their rights are respected throughout such cases as part of this protection.”

- Third Sector

There was support for the action “Encourage victims of gender based violence to report it to the Police”. Although it was noted that women might need to support to identify and be aware that what they are experiencing is violence, e.g. in cases of coercive control, and that certain groups, such as those with learning disabilities or who are LGBTI might face additional barriers to reporting, and be unable or unwilling to report violence. It was also felt that there should be an exploration of alternative ways of reporting violence, e.g. the use of third party reporting, as used in reporting hate crime, or reporting through other services such as health services, which might feel safe for women.

“[Our] members noted that women who are victims of abuse sometimes also require support to understand and recognise abusive behaviours (particularly non-physical abuse and coercive control).”

– Third Sector

“[Our organisation] agrees that victims of gender based violence should be encouraged to report to the police. [Our organisation] sees a potential role for Third Party Reporting Centres in this. However, [our] (2017) ‘Hate Crime and Third Party Reporting Centres: A mapping and scoping exercise’ highlighted that there were low levels of activity from Third Party Reporting Centres and low levels of public knowledge regarding, what Third Party Reporting (TPR) is, and their function. Although TPRC’s could possibly play a role in supporting victims of domestic violence or abuse to report, the challenges in reporting through these mechanisms would need to be addressed.”

– Third Sector

“We welcome the goal of encouraging victims to report violence to the police. We would like to know what engagement, if any, would take place with partners working in communities and in local health services which may offer alternative means of supporting victims to disclose their experiences in a safe environment. A public health approach, with a focus on prevention, in collaboration with victim support and crime reduction, could offer a new means of identifying perpetrators of violence.”

- Third Sector

Priority 4 actions that aren’t supported

Q15. Please tell us about any priority 4 actions that you don’t agree with.

Some respondents said that there were no priority 4 actions that they disagreed with/that they agreed with them all. There were very few actions under priority 4 that respondents disagreed with (see table A11 in Annex 1). Where there was disagreement it was most commonly expressed as a feeling that actions needed to be clearer, go further, be more strongly worded or required more details on how they will be achieved, as opposed to actually disagreeing with the intention of the action.

There was some disagreement around the action to “encourage victims of gender based violence to report it to the Police”, as this was linked to a “domestic abuse communications plan”. Whilst respondents were generally supportive of the principle of encouraging women to report violence, it was felt that this action needed to be wider than reporting domestic abuse and extend to other forms of violence against women and gender based violence.

“While we are supportive of the action to 'encourage victims of gender based violence to report it to the Police' we are unclear how this will be achieved by a communication plan focused on the DA bill. We suggest the plan needs to expand beyond domestic abuse to ensure that all forms of VAWG are recognised when aiming to encourage survivors to disclose.”

- Third Sector

There were also some suggestions that this action should be reworded, from “encouraging victims to report” to make it about reducing barriers to reporting, and another suggestion to change it from “encouraging” to “supporting” women to report violence, as it was emphasised that it needs to be the woman’s choice to report violence when she is ready and able to do so.

“While we recognise and support the need to encourage victims of gender-based violence to report it to the Police, the wording of the first action could be improved reflect the need to identify, understand and mitigate the barriers which some victims face when reporting acts of GBV thus removing the onus from the victim, which the action in its current form implies.”

- Third Sector

“The wording in the first action feels as though it is urging agencies to facilitate reporting. [We] would like to see this action use alternative terminology such as 'support victims of GBV to report it to the police when they choose to do so' . [We] wish for all individuals affected by GBV to have full information available to them in relation to reporting and the process of the Justice system. We fully support activities which offer survivors improved experiences of the reporting process. However, we do not feel that 'encouraging' is the correct terminology in this instance. It is crucial that reporting remains the survivor's choice entirely.”

- Third Sector

As with other priorities, there was a request for more details and clarity and for certain actions to go further. These included:

- More detail need on the action “Continue to look at perpetrator programmes”
- More clarity around how victims of gender based violence will be encouraged to report it to the police
- More clarity around what is meant by “trauma informed practice”

“[We] agree with the objectives however we feel that the actions are limited in scope and consequentially impact;”

- Third Sector

“[Our organisation] welcomes actions aimed at ensuring men desist from all forms of violence against women and girls and perpetrators of such violence receive a robust and effective response, but we believe that overall in this section there are too few actions; those stated require strengthening; and whilst not wishing for the actions focused on the response to perpetrators to be reduced, there is a need for more actions to ensure all men desist from all forms of violence.”

– Third Sector

Actions that are missing/should be added to priority 4

Q16. Are there any actions that you think are missing under priority 4?

Some respondents said that they could not identify any gaps under priority 4. Others identified a range of actions that they thought were missing and suggestions for additional things to be added in under priority 4, as can be seen in table A12 in Annex 1. Some of the gaps related to identified actions, but where respondents felt that these actions could go further or that more clarity was required around them.

Tackling Perpetrators suggestions

A number of respondents felt that there were gaps around the action to “continue to look at perpetrator programmes”. It was suggested that there was a need for such programmes to be extended beyond those that are court mandated, allowing for an early intervention approach, before perpetrators are “high risk” and their actions have become ingrained. It was also felt that there is a need to increase provision of and funding for perpetrator programmes, so that there are enough of them to meet demand across Scotland. Some respondents specifically mentioned the “Caledonian system” and that it is not currently available in all local authorities. Some felt that the action needed more detail, and there were suggestions that there should be a review of current provision and that there should be indicators relating to this action – “(e.g. do we have sufficient availability of programmes? Are waiting times reasonable?)” – Third Sector

“There is a need to ensure that effective perpetrator programmes are put in place (and resourced) that engage with the people they need to. In particular, there is a need to ensure that non-court mandated perpetrator interventions are in place to ensure that people don’t need to be ‘high risk’ perpetrators before we begin to engage with them and change their behaviours. At that stage it is often too late and considerable harm has already been caused. Additionally, these programmes are only accessible to a tiny group of people, with the vast majority falling through the cracks.”

- Violence Against Women / Gender Based Violence Partnership

“An affordable national programme is required to avoid the current postcode lottery of access to interventions.”

- Violence Against Women / Gender Based Violence Partnership

Some respondents had suggestions for things they would like to see included in such programmes: e.g. reducing the demand for buying sex; use of pornography; education about equality and rights of women and children, and alternative ways of communicating without violence. It was also queried whether the perpetrator programmes were specifically about domestic abuse or if they were wider and would cover issues, such as child abuse, FGM, rent for sex & sexual exploitation issues.

There were also suggestions that programmes needed to be targeted in a way that made them accessible to certain specific groups who may be perpetrators, including: children and young people; women; perpetrators who may themselves have been victims and/or have complex additional needs, such as mental health issues or substance misuse issues; BME men, LGBT people, where violence occurs within a same sex partnership; and people with learning disabilities.

“In terms of interventions with perpetrators of other forms of gender based violence, we note that children and young people can also be perpetrators of child sexual abuse, and that these children require specialist responses.”

- Third Sector

“We would suggest a greater emphasis on children and young people is required in this section, for example considering whether young men would benefit more from specific, targeted programmes rather than those more generally available... A ‘one size fits all’ approach is unlikely to succeed here, which is why many third sector services are able to meet the individual needs more effectively.”

- Third Sector

“While [our organisation] fully understands the particular need to protect women and girls from male violence, in only focusing on men as perpetrators we are concerned that there is a risk of obscuring equally harmful violence against women and girls that is enacted by other women... By only and repeatedly referring to men as perpetrators of violence against women, the strategy becomes overwhelmingly heteronormative and does not seek to represent and protect the interests of women who may be victims of violence within same sex relationships.”

– Representative Body for Professionals/Trade Union

It was felt that the training for professionals around the new offence of domestic abuse, needed to be wider than the Domestic Abuse Bill. It was also felt that specific training around the effects of domestic abuse on children and young people was required, and that children’s services and children’s panel members should receive this as well as justice professionals. It was also felt that there was a need for such training to link to existing local and national plans, such as those developed by Community Justice Scotland and local Community Justice Outcome Improvement Plans.

“We welcome the commitment to provide training for professionals working within the Justice System, but believe the focus of this training should be extended to increasing their understanding of all forms of VAWG rather than only domestic abuse.”

- Violence Against Women / Gender Based Violence Partnership

“We would also note the importance in relation to this action of justice professionals understanding that children experience domestic abuse with the non-abusing parent and that this should be a crucial element for training for justice professionals.”

- Third Sector

“We believe that there needs to be a specific focus on training on the impact of domestic abuse on children for children’s panel members, as in our experience panel members often are not fully aware of the continuing effects of historical abuse or how that abuse can be continued through contact with the perpetrating parent.”

- Third Sector

It was felt that more was required within the Delivery Plan about the early identification of and early intervention with perpetrators.

It was felt that a specific children and young people approach, prioritising the rights of the child was required in relation to the action around case management in family actions, including in relation to child welfare hearings.

In relation to the action around encouraging victims of gender based violence to report it to the police, it was suggested that more needed to be done to build women's confidence in the police, to ensure that the police will respond appropriately and take appropriate action, including keeping women informed about what is happening and explaining the reasons why action is or isn't being taken.

It was suggested that NHS staff should be involved in multi-agency domestic homicide reviews.

Other suggestions

A number of additional actions were suggested relating to the justice/courts/prison system. These included suggestions that training was required for juries involved in domestic abuse or violence against women cases; integration between civil and criminal processes where domestic abuse is a factor; survivors of violence being provided with reliable and up-to date information about the justice process; identifying perpetrators of violence against women at an earlier stage, e.g. by all perpetrators going through a screening process to identify any signs of VAWG behaviour, that this information is shared with relevant professionals and the offender then receives appropriate interventions; a review of sentencing and impact on prison programmes / parole conditions; and work within the prison system, including taking a holistic approach.

A comment was made about women's ability to access justice, including legal aid. The impact of employment tribunal fees on women was also mentioned , with a Trade Union respondent saying that this had resulted in an 80% decrease in applications to employment tribunals on the grounds of sexual harassment.

“[Our organisation] is concerned that women are discriminated against when accessing justice and in particular when accessing the legal aid system. Women are disproportionately impacted by issues that have a high level of legal aid work such as child custody, divorce or protective orders. This would mean that any cuts to the legal aid system are likely to impact greater on women.

– Representative Body for Professionals/Trade Union

Again the need for early education to tackle attitudes and violence against women was mentioned, along with a zero-tolerance approach to gender-based bullying from a young age.

There were suggestions that more support was required for young people affected by domestic abuse and violence against women. Again the need for strong multi-agency interventions to tackle violence against women was mentioned. It was suggested that the priority 4 actions could be linked with policies in the workplace, around workplace culture and disciplinary proceedings, so that there were responses available at levels other than the criminal justice level.

It was mentioned that NHS staff policy makes specific reference to staff who are perpetrators and how that is addressed within the employment context, and that this might be helpful for other organisations too.

Cross Cutting Actions

In addition to the four priority areas, the Equally Safe Delivery Plan laid out a set of cross-cutting actions, organised under the 6 headings of “a human rights framework”, “all forms”, “all women”, “all children”, “accountability”, and “participation”.

As with the priorities, respondents were asked if they agreed that these were the correct cross-cutting actions, any that they particularly supported, any they did not support and anything that they thought was missing/should be added to the cross-cutting actions.

Q17. Do you agree or disagree that the actions listed as cross cutting are the right actions to help meet the overall objectives of the delivery plan?

Sixty-one respondents answered Q17. Around two thirds (67%) agreed that these were the correct cross-cutting actions, (12%) disagreed and a fifth (20%) neither agreed nor disagreed (see table 6 below).

Table 6: Q17. Do you agree or disagree that the actions listed as cross cutting are the right actions to help meet the overall objectives of the delivery plan?

	%	No.
Agree	67%	41
Disagree	11%	7
Neither Agree nor Disagree	20%	12

N = 61

Totals may not sum due to rounding

Support for the cross cutting actions

Q18. Please tell us about any of the cross cutting actions that you are particularly supportive of.

Table A13 in Annex 1 lists the cross cutting actions that respondents said that they were particularly supportive of. Some respondents stated that they were supportive off all the cross cutting actions listed.

Of actions that were singled out by respondents as being ones that they were particularly supportive of, the most popular actions were:

- Build the gendered analysis into the implementation of Scotland’s first Human Trafficking Strategy, ensuring that interventions recognise the particular inequalities women who are trafficked experience (9)
- Publish a report setting out what we are doing to implement the Istanbul Convention in Scotland (7)

- Commission a mapping of exit routes, to inform guidance to public and third sector organisations on how to support women experiencing commercial sexual exploitation including prostitution (7)
- Ask black and minority ethnic representatives to help us to identify specific steps to tackle violence against BME women and girls (7)

A human rights framework

A common response was for respondents to say that they were generally supportive of taking a human rights approach, rather than to single out particular actions relating to human rights that they were particularly supportive of.

“We fully support the explicit recognition of violence against women and girls as a fundamental violation of human rights, and the placing of human rights at the centre of the draft Delivery Plan.”

- Academic/research

There was support for the two actions around the Istanbul Conventions, supporting its ratification, and setting out what Scotland is doing to implement it.

“Implementation of the Istanbul Convention in a Scottish context illustrates the SG continuing priority of a zero tolerance approach to VAWG.”

- Third Sector

All Forms

There was support for actions under all forms, which covered a range of different types of VAW.

“We welcome the actions to address online hate and misogyny, human trafficking, female genital mutilation and forced marriage. We welcome the actions in relation to mapping exit routes to support women experiencing commercial sexual exploitation including prostitution and engagement with stakeholders on the findings of research into the evidence to the impact of criminalising the purchase of sex.”

- Violence Against Women / Gender Based Violence Partnership

“In our recent Scottish LGBTI hate crime survey, online abuse was the fourth most prevalent type of hate crime experienced by LGBTI people, particularly LBT women who reported consistently higher levels of online abuse compared to male respondents. We support the commitment of the Scottish Government to review the prevalence and nature of online abuse, and identify any measures needed to tackle it.”

- Third Sector

All Women

There was support for recognising that certain groups of women might be particularly vulnerable due to a range of other protected characteristics.

“The inclusion of minorities within these in order to understand particular obstacles these women face is also welcomed. Cross cutting actions that reference the likes of BME and LGBT women are illustrative of the SG’s commitment to eliminate abuse against women of all backgrounds.”

- Third Sector

“We are pleased to see that groups who are particularly vulnerable have been identified, such as black and ethnic minorities, lesbian, bisexual and transsexual women and girls, disabled women and refugees.”

- Other Public Body, including Executive Agencies, NDPBs, NHS etc.

All Children

Respondents indicated their support for actions contained under the “all children” heading.

“We are supportive of actions to ensure the impact of domestic abuse on children is recognised and that children are effectively supported.”

- Third Sector

“In particular, we welcome plans for a refreshed child internet safety action plan as our young members have highlighted this as an area where they would like more education and support.”

- Third Sector

Accountability

Under accountability, there was only one action that respondents specifically stated that they were supportive of, the action to “embed the Sustainable Development Goals – including Goal 5, which calls for gender equality and the true empowerment of women and girls – in Scotland Performs”.

Participation

There was support for a pilot programme of participation with affected groups of women, children and young people, and to capture learning from this. There was also a feeling that participation needed to be supported in the longer term beyond a pilot.

“[Our] members warmly welcomed the action to improve participation of those with lived experience of gender-based violence and were also keen to see a commitment to ongoing participation work, beyond the pilot period, built in to the Plan.”

- Third Sector

Cross cutting actions that aren't supported

Q19. Please tell us about any cross cutting actions that you don't agree with.

Some respondents said that there were no cross cutting actions that they disagreed with/that they agreed with them all.

As can be seen in table A14 in Annex 1, respondents were unlikely to disagree with any of the specific cross cutting actions. The most common criticism of the cross cutting actions was that it was unhelpful and disjointed to have them separate from the priority actions. In particular there was a strong feeling that “all forms” of violence needed to be better integrated into the priorities, and it was felt that by having actions relating to commercial sexual exploitation, female genital mutilation and forced marriage in the cross cutting actions but not specifically mentioned in the priority actions, they were being presented as less important than other forms of violence, such as domestic abuse, which is specifically referred to in the priority actions.

“Overall, we would echo the VAW Network's response that it is unhelpful to have some forms of VAWG (most notably Domestic Abuse) under Equally Safe's key priorities and then others (including CSE, FGM and Forced Marriage) under 'cross-cutting actions' as this creates the impression that these are of lesser priority. [Our organisation] works to raise awareness of the continuum of VAWG and to raise awareness of the connections between all forms of violence. The superficial divide created by the different treatment in this plan is unhelpful in taking this work forward.”

– Third Sector

“The layout of this section is somewhat confusing as it's unclear as to why it sits separately from the Equally Safe key priorities. It would be clearer if all actions were outlined in the same section, giving equal gravitas to VAWG issues beyond domestic abuse.”

- Violence Against Women / Gender Based Violence Partnership

There was a feeling that some of the actions needed to be strengthened and go further, particularly those relating to commercial sexual exploitation (discussed more under missing cross cutting actions). It was also noted that more clarity and details were required around certain actions and how they would be delivered.

Actions that are missing/should be added to the cross cutting actions

Q20. Are there any cross cutting actions that you think are missing?

Respondents who answered this question, identified a range of actions that they felt were missing, and highlighted where they felt that existing actions should be strengthened and go further, as shown in table A16 in Annex 1.

Key issues respondents raised included; the need for stronger actions relating to tackling commercial sexual exploitation, the need to align Equally Safe with other SG policies and relevant UN conventions, and particular concerns around the potential impact of Brexit on human rights and the need to mitigate against this.

Human Rights Framework

As mentioned elsewhere, it was felt that responsibility for delivering the Human Rights actions was wider than the Scottish Government, and that all public sector agencies have a duty to incorporate a human rights approach into their services, and therefore relevant agencies should be being encouraged to include this in their Equality Outcomes,

Concerns were raised about the potential impact of Brexit on human rights, and the desire to ensure that the certain EU laws and protections, and the European Convention on Human Rights would still be adhered to in a post-Brexit Scotland. Human rights in general, women's rights, the rights of children, and LGBTI rights were felt to be potentially at risk. One organisation spoke of "fear" among women about their rights.

"We believe that the impact of Brexit on human and children's rights must be taken into account, and every effort must be made to ensure that the best bits of EU law become enshrined in Scottish law. The EU has certain built-in protections (for example for victims of trafficking or child abduction) but what will be the future of those here in Scotland after Brexit?"

- Representative Body for Professionals/Trade Union

Another issue that it was felt could get worse in relation to Brexit, was the plight of women with no recourse to public funds due to their immigration status. It was felt that they were particularly vulnerable to being unable to escape from violent situations due to their economic circumstances, and that the delivery plan should address this.

"We believe this should include looking at those women who are affected by 'no recourse to public funds.' Women from the EU as well as non EU women are being denied safe ways to end domestic abuse due to their immigration status. This problem is only going to get worse with Brexit. Many women who cannot access public funds or services either do not leave abusive relationships or end up going back because their situation is so difficult."

- Representative Body for Professionals/Trade Union

It was noted that the delivery plan should be more explicit about the rights of the child and aligning the actions in Equally Safe with the SG's commitment to the United Nation Convention on the Rights of the Child (UNCRC).

All Forms of Violence

There was a strong feeling that the actions relating to commercial sexual exploitation (CSE) needed to be strengthened.

Specific suggestions included:

- Criminalise the purchase of sex/ Adopt the "Nordic model"(going further than the current action to engage with stakeholder on research around this)
- Decriminalise the women who are engaged in prostitution

- Provide and fund specialist services to help women exiting prostitution, provide support and advocacy, and ensure women have alternatives to prostitution
- Improve the ability of mainstream services to identify those who are involved in CSE and signpost them to appropriate services
- Address the vulnerability and needs of people who may have been sexually exploited as young people and then end up in prostitution as adults
- Challenge public attitudes which condone commercial sexual exploitation and views it as less harmful than other forms of VAW
- Work with COSLA and local authorities to close down lap dancing venues

“The actions in relation to CSE, particularly prostitution are weak. They do not reflect the stance in Equally Safe which considers prostitution to be a form of VAW which contributes to women’s inequality and that a ‘challenging demand’ approach is supported by international research evidence”

- Academic/research

“The broader response to CSE should be strengthened. For example, there should be actions to decriminalise women engaged in prostitution and other forms of CSE, and there should be clear actions (that go beyond 'mapping') about developing and focusing on a routes out of CSE approach. Equally, there should be clear actions to reflect a 'tackling demand to CSE' approach through criminalising perpetrators.”

- Violence Against Women / Gender Based Violence Partnership

“Women exploited in prostitution are no longer criminalised for the selling of sex and prostitution is recognised as survival behaviour.”

- Violence Against Women / Gender Based Violence Partnership

“Challenging attitudes which condone and perpetuate CSE and raising public and professional awareness of the links between different forms of VAWG, the harm caused by CSE and the need to tackle demand.”

- Violence Against Women / Gender Based Violence Partnership

It was also felt that actions were required to tackle harm caused by the internet, including online pornography, as pornography can fuel unhealthy attitudes to women and contribute to other forms of VAW. There was a suggestion that the Scottish Government should press the Westminster Government to extend the definition of “extreme pornography” under part 3 of the Digital Economy Act 2017 so that more pornography can be caught and regulated under that definition. There was another suggestion that the action plan on child internet safety should be extended to vulnerable adults, as they may be particularly at risk of online harm.

It was felt that some agencies and professionals lacked confidence in their technical skills to support women facing online abuse, and that this should be addressed.

As well as access to online pornography, it was noted that the internet is used as a tool to facilitate other forms of VAW, such as advertising women for prostitution, “sex for rent” adverts (where accommodation is offered to a woman on the basis of her providing sex), facilitating trafficking of women, and inappropriate sexting.

It was also noted that technology could be helpful in keeping women safe, for example by allowing them to record instances of abuse, and it was felt that professionals should do more to support women who use technology in this way.

“Our 2017 joint report with CYCJ, Over the internet, under the radar, suggested a lack of confidence among professionals in dealing with online behaviour, and a lack of consistency in responses. We would suggest that throughout the delivery plan there may need to be greater consideration of whether actions effectively address online forms of and context for gender based violence.”

- Third Sector

“Our research found that almost 1 in 5 women surveyed had used technology to capture evidence about their abuse, and when asked “How do you think technology can be improved to help survivors?” the second most popular answer (13.3%) was to be able to safely record abuse. We believe statutory services have a role to play in building victims' confidence in using technology to help build evidence as well as to contact the Police and other support services”

- Third Sector

It was felt that stalking should be included. In particular a national campaign to raise awareness, and encourage women to report it to the police was suggested.

It was also mentioned that whilst there was an action looking at online hate and misogyny, it would perhaps be more useful to have an action that looked at misogyny and gender based hate “across all spheres of contact (online, face to face, schools etc.).”

It was suggested that the action around FGM “develop multi-agency national guidelines for tackling female genital mutilation” should go further and be about implementation and monitoring of the guidelines. There was also a suggestion that education and awareness raising were required around FGM, rather than focussing solely on the perpetrators of FGM.

It was suggested that the three actions around forced marriage be grouped together as one objective and then be sub-divided into specific actions for identified agencies, currently they all sit with the SG.

All Women

It was felt that more needed to be said around “all women”, and in particular, making specific reference to a wider range of women across all protected characteristics, rather than only referring to LBT women, disabled women and BME women. Specific mention was made of Muslim women, in relation to Islamophobic violence they might face. In addition to the protected characteristics, other women may also be additionally vulnerable, such as those living in poverty, those with insecure immigration status, those living in remote and rural communities, those involved with the criminal justice system, and a recognition that women’s needs will vary across the course of their life. More needed to be done to address additional barriers which women with protected characteristics and/or additional vulnerabilities might face.

“ALL women section – there are already legal duties around the protected characteristics – all should be considered here.”

- Violence Against Women / Gender Based Violence Partnership

“We would like to see the list expanded to include other vulnerabilities, such as those with learning disabilities, older women, pregnant women etc.”

- Other Public Body, including Executive Agencies, NDPBs, NHS etc.

“While sometimes referred to as ‘hidden victims’ [our organisation] believes we’re just not looking in the right place, and could share learning with Scottish Government about how to remove barriers which prevent certain age groups or communities from accessing support.”

- Third Sector

It was felt that the actions around all women could be strengthened (e.g. around engaging with BME women), and also be broadened out, for example to do more to include those with learning disabilities. There was also a feeling that when engaging with stakeholders, it was important to involve the right organisations, and that these might not always be the most obvious. E.g. it was suggested that certain service providers would be aware of the difficulties they faced in making their services accessible and that this information needed to be included, as well as information for disabled people’s organisations.

“Disabled people exist throughout society and interact across all levels of organisations. Partners therefore believe that the consultative action listed under ‘All women’ should be wider than consulting with disabled people. For example, service providers (Women’s Aid, Homeless etc.) readily know of the difficulties faced by disabled people trying to access refuge accommodation due to a lack of disabled facilities, while disabled groups are often unaware of this information.”

- Violence Against Women / Gender Based Violence Partnership

All Children

One children’s charity was concerned that children were not well enough integrated throughout the delivery plan as a whole, and felt that for some actions it was unclear whether they related to children as well as women.

“A key concern with how the delivery plan is structured as a whole is that the various forms of gender based violence and considerations relating to children are not integrated throughout. Even within the cross cutting actions there is a lack of integration, for example the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child does not appear in the human rights framework, despite being identified in the Equally Safe Strategy. We have commented in other answers that we are not always clear whether actions in individual priority areas apply across all forms of gender based violence and include consideration of children.”

- Third Sector

It was felt that childhood sexual abuse needed to be mentioned within the delivery plan, and that a holistic approach to childhood sexual abuse was needed. In addition it was mentioned that there is a need for support and services for adult survivors of childhood sexual abuse.

“We note that there is no mention of Child Sexual Abuse in the delivery plan, though this is a form of gender based violence identified in the Equally Safe Strategy. We note that there is one single mention of Child Sexual Exploitation in the delivery plan, and this is a cross-reference to the existence of a national action plan. It is crucial that Child Sexual Abuse and Child Sexual Exploitation are integrated into the delivery plan for the Equally Safe Strategy to achieve its objectives. We would like to see greater clarity throughout the delivery plan about how children and the full range of forms of gender based violence are integrated into the priority areas.”

- Third Sector

In relation to the action to “continue to implement the National Action Plan to Prevent and Tackle Child Sexual Exploitation, published in March 2016” it was mentioned that the Care Inspectorate have collected information from Community Planning Partnerships on how they are responding to prevent and reduce risks to children and young people from child sexual exploitation. It was therefore suggested that the action include a commitment to taking this learning forward to support continuous improvement.

There were calls for legislative change that would address the issue of “justifiable assault”, where a parent slaps a child as punishment, and provide children and young people with “equal protection from assault”.

“Equal protection from assault is a right that all children and young people are entitled to, and is particularly relevant to Equally Safe with regards to evidence that indicates a link between physical punishment and adult aggression within intimate partner relationships... Evidence clearly links experience of abuse in childhood to perpetration in adulthood.”

- Third Sector

There was a feeling that the action to “ensure that children’s interests are better reflected in the justice system and that their voice is heard” should go further and include the civil courts, and in particular child contact hearings.

There was a feeling that the action to "ensure the Domestic Abuse Bill effectively acknowledges the impact that domestic abuse can have on children through the operation of a statutory aggravation to the new offence of domestic abuse" also needed to go further, and acknowledge that a child does not need to directly witness domestic abuse in order to be affected by it, and that the psychological abuse of and coercive control of a child also needed to be taken into account.

It was mentioned that looked after children should be explicitly mentioned as a particularly vulnerable group, and that the delivery plan should say something about the "responsibilities of corporate parents to safeguard their rights and promote their wellbeing". - Academic/research. It was highlighted that women and children continue to be at risk of abuse after they have left an abusive environment, and that agencies need to be aware of the risk of post-separation violence, e.g. when managing contact arrangements.

Accountability

A number of accountability mechanisms which exist within the public sector were mentioned, including NHS Board Annual Reviews, and the scrutiny of Single Outcome Agreements and Health and Social Care Partnerships' strategic priorities by the SG. It was suggested that these mechanisms could be included in the delivery plan. It was noted by one responded from within the NHS that as far as they were aware there had never been a question relating to Gender Based Violence within their NHS Board Annual Review.

"Without that level of scrutiny, issues within the NHS risk becoming "non-issues" and do not warrant much priority within the organisation. Without that legitimacy, then simple activities like access to training opportunities for staff, support from IT colleagues, endorsement of GBV-related policies by the organisation (including staff side organisations) all become a challenge."

- Other Public Body, including Executive Agencies, NDPBs, NHS etc.

Participation

There were fairly few comments around participation. The need for longer term participation (beyond the pilot period) and broadening out participation across VAW partners were mentioned.. It was seen as important that the voices of women and children with lived experience of gender based violence and domestic abuse are used to inform and influence the Equally Safe strategy. It was noted that all public sector agencies have a duty to ensure that communities have an opportunity to contribute to and shape services and it was suggested that existing structures which exist through community planning partnerships and health and social care partnerships could be used for community engagement around gender based violence. However, it was felt that in order for that to happen, the requirement would need to be specified within the delivery plan. The Community Empowerment Act was also seen as a potential vehicle for participation activity.

Other suggestions

Amongst the other suggestions provided for cross cutting actions that were missing, the need for a gendered approach to VAW/ gendered analysis of abuse was the most frequently mention.

“An additional action should include how to support the national agendas for adult survivors of child sexual abuse and child sexual exploitation to understand and reflect the gender analysis. Both approaches are currently gender neutral and this fails to recognise the differences in experiences of women/men girls/boys and the context in which abuse is experienced and perpetrated and can potentially undermine the work of Equally Safe or put the work streams at odds with each other.”

- Violence Against Women / Gender Based Violence Partnership

The need for effective training of professionals, possibly using a human rights based framework, in order to support the delivery of Equally Safe was also mentioned.

Performance Framework

Q21. Do you agree or disagree that the draft performance framework is right to help ensure that we understand the progress we are making?

Sixty-one respondents answered Q21. Of those, more than half (56%) agreed, 16% disagreed, and 28% neither agreed nor disagreed (see table 7 below).

Table 7: Q21. Do you agree or disagree that the draft performance framework is right to help ensure that we understand the progress we are making?

	%	No.
Agree	56%	34
Disagree	16%	7
Neither Agree nor Disagree	28%	18

N = 61

Support for the performance framework

Please tell us about any sections of the draft performance framework that you are supportive of

Twelve respondents stated they were supportive of all of the performance framework, and an additional 17 respondents provided generally supportive comments, including:

- Support for the 'general thrust' or the 'overall focus and desired outcomes' of the framework
- Support for the use of a logic model approach, showing how short, medium and long term outcomes are linked
- Welcoming that the framework has been streamlined to a small number of indicators
- Recognising that it is very difficult to find performance measures, and that the ones identified seem appropriate
- Highlighting the benefits of collecting information at a national level that can be broken down at local authority level, so that local authorities can compare themselves to one another and to the national picture

Specific elements of the performance framework that respondents said they were particularly supportive of were:

- Primary prevention (9). These respondents particularly welcomed the focus on monitoring societal-level changes in understanding of, and attitudes towards, violence against women, and of wider measures of gender equality such as the earnings of male and female employees
- Services for women and children (6). These respondents supported the early identification of women and children affected by violence; welcomed the inclusion of indicators on referrals to specialist support services, and self-reported improvements in feelings of safety and wellbeing; and stated that it is positive that the impact of training is monitored in relation to behavioural as well as attitudinal change
- Perpetrators (2). The respondents welcomed the emphasis on perpetrators being identified early, and on supporting perpetrators and sanctioning them to reduce the violence

Suggestions for changes to the performance framework

Is there anything you think is missing? / Do you have any suggestions for additions to the draft performance framework?

Society

The following suggestions were made in relation to the 'society' elements of the performance framework:

- Changing "gender norms and expectations are reduced" to something more specific e.g. "fewer people adhere to gender stereotypes"
- Indicator on percentage of women in senior roles other than elected member roles e.g. judiciary, senior police officers, public body chief executives
- The use of the % of women who are the highest paid 5 % of council employee as an indicator should be carefully considered. Recent work undertaken through the Local Government Benchmarking Framework supported by the Improvement Service; confirms this is not considered to be a sufficiently robust indicator due to the impact of ongoing organisational re-structuring and rationalisation on this
- Extend the indicators that refer directly to pay and vertical segregation within local authorities to all public sector bodies (and perhaps all sectors of the economy), and disaggregate by disability and ethnicity
- Demographic breakdown of attitudinal data
- Report data on public awareness, myths and stereotypical views at a local level
- Outcome along the lines of "Men in Scottish society feel supported to have a positive mind-set towards women and children and are empowered to reject all violent and misogynist thinking"

- Indicator relating to the amount of internet pornography consumed
- Indicator(s) on incidents of misogyny or sexism
- Indicator(s) on young people's experience of sexual harassment (to assess girls' and young women's sense of safety and well-being and provide an early indicator of societal change)
- Indicator on how safe women feel in their communities

Perpetrators

The following suggestions were made in relation to the 'perpetrators' elements of the performance framework:

- Extend 'Men desist...' to 'Men and Boys desist.....'
- Monitor availability of, and waiting times for, perpetrator programmes
- The no and % of perpetrators of VAWG who are referred to perpetrator interventions nationally is not included – is it intended this can be obtained by aggregating local data?
- Monitor number and percentage of perpetrators who successfully complete perpetrator intervention programmes, and how many do/do not go on re-offend.
- Number of men convicted of VAWG related crimes – provide a breakdown of what convictions are for.

Women and children affected by violence

The following suggestions were made in relation to the 'women and children affected by violence' elements of the performance framework:

- Number (both nationally and locally) of Independent Domestic Abuse Advocates (Idaas), outreach workers, health-based specialists and refuge spaces available
- Percentage of local authority Housing Options Hubs trained in gender based violence/gendered approaches to homelessness prevention
- Recognition that many women never report, or report only when it becomes unbearable, and so would not be counted in the measure 'proportion reporting to the police within 12 months of experiencing a type of gender based violence'. Support services will often have contact with women who do not report and will be safety planning and providing support should they decide to leave
- Need clarity on whether 'number of women and children identified as being affected by VAWG who are referred to a specialist support service' will include self-referrals
- Number of referrals from one public agency to another public agency for vulnerable women, young people and children as a result of domestic violence, gender based violence or hate crime

- Number of women rehomed temporarily and permanently as a result of domestic violence
- Record victims' perception of 1) their risk, 2) their safety before and after the intervention, 3) the response of services 4) attitudinal change of responders
- Safety and wellbeing outcomes of survivors accessing public sector services, not specialist services
- Proportion of children experiencing domestic abuse
- Proportion of girls and children who have experienced sexual abuse in last 12 months

Other

A number of respondents felt that more information needed to be provided in relation to the measurement framework, including:

- More detailed definitions of the indicators
- Evidence sources, who will gather the data, and where and when the data will be reported
- What the baseline will be
- A clearer link between the actions in the delivery plan and the outcomes/indicators in the performance framework – including what outcomes we might reasonably expect in the 5 year timeframe of the action plan

It was also suggested that the performance framework should identify where there are gaps in what it is currently possible to monitor, with specific commitments in the delivery plan as to when and how these gaps will be addressed. One respondent proposed:

“An additional action for Equally Safe might be the development for Scotland of a rigorous framework for measuring violence against women and children, along the lines of recently published work by Professor Sylvia Walby and colleagues.”

- Third Sector

Three respondents highlighted the need to integrate or align the Equally Safe performance framework with existing frameworks and measures, including the National Performance Framework for Scotland, the National Health and Social Care Standards, the Missing Children strategy, the Commercial Sexual Exploitation strategy, the Internet Safety Strategy, the Trafficking and Exploitation Strategy, Community Justice Outcomes, Performance and Improvement Framework, and the guide to self-evaluation for Community Justice in Scotland. And two respondents queried why service providers / professionals were not explicitly included as a target group.

One respondent sought clarity on whether the ‘funding invested in preventing and eradicating VAWG at a local level’ indicator included not only direct spend, but wider human resources or other assets utilised to progress this agenda. This respondent also cautioned that percentage of expenditure should not be an

indicator, as the focus should be on the quality and sustainable of outcomes delivered and best value for action.

Some respondents raised challenges that data collection and performance monitoring posed, and some suggestions for how to resolve them:

- All services gather data differently, which makes identifying the prevalence of VAWG locally challenging
- Need to develop common data points and harmonise the approach to collation of equalities data
- A strong driver is needed from both the Scottish Government and COSLA that collecting and reporting data on the indicators is expected from all organisations who contribute to Equally Safe
- Actual results 'on the ground' are preferable to statistical best performance figures which really do not address the problem
- A more qualitative approach to the collection of information e.g. case studies in order to fully understanding the complexity of individual experiences and related outcomes
- There is a focus on Local Authorities and a similar set of objectives and outcomes could be considered for other public services
- Measuring societal attitudes to monitor the difference made / change in attitudes or beliefs held is an ongoing challenge
- At a local level, consideration will have to be given to additional performance measures, based on local priorities and action plans

Many respondents raised issues that have already been described in the 'recurring themes raised throughout the consultation' section of this report, and will therefore not be described in detail here. Specific suggestions for the performance framework relating to these recurring themes included:

- Disaggregation of data by age / including data on children and young people
- Including indicators measuring prevalence and quality of Relationships, Sexual Health and Parenthood (RSHP) education in all types of schools
- Including indicators relating to prevalence of Child Sexual Abuse and Exploitation
- Indicators to measure online gender abuse, honour based violence, number of people paying for sexual services and number of people in prostitution
- Disaggregation of data by protected characteristic – such as ethnicity, disability and sexuality (LGBT).
- Monitoring provision of accessible information and appropriate communication tools to both victims and perpetrators
- Monitoring actions to challenge negative attitudes regarding the sexuality of people with learning disabilities.

How organisations can contribute

Q25. What role could your organisation have in contributing to this delivery plan?

Respondents identified a number of ways in which they could contribute to Equally Safe, as detailed in table A16 in Annex 1. These ranged from the direct provision of services to those affected by VAW, to being willing to engage with the SG on the matter, to providing training, or contributing to the knowledge base around VAW. The most commonly suggested roles included:

- Providing training /guidance (20)
- That co-ordinating/contributing to work on VAW/GBV at a local level is a key part of what they do (18)
- Awareness raising/Promoting key messages from Equally Safe to members and wider society (16)
- Developing the evidence base /knowledge base, sharing good practice, improving practice (15)
- Providing support/delivering services to women, children, families affected by VAW (14)
- Willing to engage with SG/Participate in stakeholder discussion (12)

How respondents said they could contribute

A wide range of organisations who responded to this consultation have areas of specialist expertise. A number mentioned providing training and guidance across a wide range of professions, service providers and individuals on a variety of issues. Respondents spoke of providing training in relation to: stalking; internet safety; housing rights; “gender and domestic abuse competent employer and employability policy and practice”; LGBTI inclusive and transgender inclusive training; professional guidance for nurses, including around domestic abuse, FGM, child protection and modern slavery; domestic abuse within BME communities and honour based violence; identifying and responding to gender based violence; gender based bullying and learning disability awareness training.

A number of responses, particularly those from Local Authority Violence Against Women or Gender Based Violence Partnerships noted that co-ordinating and contributing to work around violence against women was a core part of their role, and as such they would be central to delivering Equally Safe at a local level. A number also said that within this capacity they would also be involved in local level measurement frameworks.

“As a local GBV partnership, we should have a pivotal role in achieving Equally Safe’s priorities through the development of a local action plan which appropriately reflects the activities required to achieve the actions listed in the national Delivery Plan.”

- Violence Against Women / Gender Based Violence Partnership

“Additionally, our Gender-Based Violence Partnership will play a key role in collecting performance data to help measure, understand and demonstrate whether the actions in the delivery plan are achieving their intended outcomes, and identifying where improvements may be required.”

- Violence Against Women / Gender Based Violence Partnership

A number of organisations saw a role for themselves in raising awareness and promoting the key messages from Equally Safe, both to their own members and to wider society. Specific awareness raising targeted at professionals such as teachers, social workers, fire fighters and early learning and childcare workers was mentioned. As was awareness raising amongst children and young people, school pupils, students, women, workers and trade union members, and members of the general public. Key elements of awareness raising mentioned were, professionals would be better able to spot violence against women, women and young people would have a greater awareness of their rights and feel empowered to speak up and that negative societal attitudes would be challenged, with an aim to improving society’s attitudes to gender equality and violence against women.

“Last year we ran a successful campaign (WOWwoman) to help girls identify positive female role models. This year we will be promoting the WAGGGS Voices Against Violence Resource... This resource helps children and young people learn how to talk about violence, understand its root causes, identify different forms of violence, recognise their rights and develop the skills and confidence to access those rights for themselves and others. It will have empowered girls and boys, young women and young men to be leaders, to speak out and take action.”

– Third Sector

“[Our organisation] has recently run a number of workshops/events for Children and Families social workers. Our event 'The Social Work Role in Domestic Abuse' in Edinburgh - which came 2 days after the publication of the Domestic Abuse Bill - was very well attended,... [Our organisation] will contribute to this delivery plan by utilising events like these to disseminate information, promote awareness and facilitate reflection and learning.”

- Representative Body for Professionals/Trade Union

“The SFRS, and firefighters in particular, have a reputation as community role models and this is particularly effective amongst young people. The reinforcement of positive attitudes towards all community groups and the intolerance of gender-based violence can contribute to the ongoing improvements in social attitudes.”

- Other Public Body, including Executive Agencies, NDPBs, NHS etc.

“Our work will specifically be focused on the following outcomes: Public understanding of men’s violence against women is increased and tolerance of it is decreased.”

– Third Sector

A number of organisations felt that they contributed to the knowledge base and evidence base around certain aspects of violence against women. Others spoke of developing and sharing good practice, and improving practice around violence against women. Organisations felt that they could add to the knowledge base around their specific areas of expertise such as: stalking; internet pornography; childhood abuse and trauma; and commercial sexual exploitation, as well as in relation to the intersectionality with specific groups of women, such as those who are from a minority ethnic background, identify as LGBTI or have a learning disability. This knowledge base was seen as a platform for sharing and expanding on good practice.

“[Our organisation] has a highly skilled workforce delivering innovative services across the VAW spectrum... This innovative approach, which is common in all [our] services, provides greater insight to different forms of VAW which are not as well understood in mainstream service provision. [Our organisation] is therefore well placed to contribute to the delivery of Equally Safe, especially in relation to different forms of violence against women beyond domestic abuse.”

- Third Sector

“As an intermediary body, [we] would be happy to assist with collating and sharing evidence, information and examples of good practice from and to our member organisations and contributing to research and reviews.”

- Third Sector

“we are producing lessons learned around best practice for gender and domestic abuse competent employer and employability policy and practice that could be incorporated to inform actions in the Equally Safe delivery plan.”

- Third Sector

A number of organisations are involved in providing support and services to women, children and families affected by violence against women, and a smaller number said that they provide services to perpetrators. Respondents spoke of a large variety of services that they provided, these included: legal services; advocacy services; refuge accommodation; support services, including one to one support, crisis support, group support, and helplines; services for children and families, including for children affected by childhood sexual exploitation; support for women at risk of honour based violence; support for women involved in or at risk of prostitution; services for women who are LGBTI, and services for ethnic minority women.

Some respondents said that they would like more opportunity to engage with the SG around Equally Safe, feeling that they could contribute their specialist knowledge on particular issues.

“We are concerned that there is a lack of detail as to how the needs of women who are LGBTI, disabled, Black or minority ethnic or practice a religion will be affected under the actions of this strategy. [We] would urge the Scottish Government to ensure that all elements of this strategy are equality impact assessed with the support of relevant stakeholders... [We] would be happy to contribute their expertise whenever appropriate.”

- Third Sector

“In response to the goal 'Hold an event comprising key stakeholder to look how we better tackle online hate and misogyny' [we] would appreciate an opportunity to participate in the discussion. Within our specialist area we have a range of powerful ideas which could contribute materially to tackling online hate and misogyny.”

- Third Sector

Some organisations facilitate their members having a voice to contribute to the discussion around Equally Safe. This includes: the voices of women; children and young people; survivors of violence against women; workers, through the Trade Union movement; those from ethnic minorities; those who are LGBTI; those who have learning disabilities, and providing a “national homelessness perspective”. It was seen as important that these different voices and perspectives are fed into and can influence Equally Safe.

“We will continue to strengthen the partnerships we have across Perth & Kinross whilst representing the views and experiences of survivors at both strategic and operational forms across P&K.”

- Third Sector

“[Our organisation] is funded to engage with women throughout Scotland in order that their views might influence public policy. [Our organisation] uses the views of women to respond to a variety of Parliamentary, Governmental and organisational consultation papers at both a Scottish and UK level.”

- Third Sector

A small number of respondents spoke of how they were involved in campaigning for certain legislation and policies, for example, the introduction of the ‘Offence of Stalking’ sec 39 Criminal Justice & Licensing (Scotland) Act 2010). Some spoke of their role in ensuring that local violence against women policies are integrated with wider policies. Others spoke of capacity building, of engagement work, of their role in funding projects, or their role as an employer to promote gender equality.

What organisations need from the SG in order to be able to contribute

A small number of respondents indicated that in order to be able to fully contribute they needed certain things from the SG to facilitate their contribution. These included: comments that what an organisation could do would be dependent on the funding it receives; the need for a commitment from the SG to recognise and work more closely in partnerships with local organisations to deliver; a call for the SG to be more explicit about the role of certain organisations within the Delivery Plan (e.g.

Higher Education Institutes), and an ask for the SG to provide guidance on what is required at a local level. A couple of respondents again requested more focus on equalities and intersectionality within the Delivery Plan.

“Local VAW partnerships need to be more visible within the Delivery Plan and the Government should work more closely with us, respecting the considerable knowledge and expertise held within local areas.”

- Violence Against Women / Gender Based Violence Partnership

How the experiences and views of the women, children and young people were included in organisations' consultation responses

Q26. In responding to this consultation, how are you drawing on the experiences and views of the women, children and young people who access your organisation?

Respondents were asked how they had drawn on the experience and views of the women, children and young people who access their organisation in their consultation response. By far the most common response was to say that their response was based on their expertise in the field and reflected the views of those they worked with, which included service users, service providers, workers and partnership organisations (39). Others had used research, evaluation, case studies, information on evidence based practice, and professional learning to inform their answers (11). A small number of respondents, who were all trade union/representative bodies for professionals, mentioned that the work of their equalities committee had informed their response, and one respondent said that the person completing the consultation had received training on gender equality and violence against women (see table A17 in Annex 1).

A number of respondents said that their direct experience of working with women and children on a daily basis, and what the women and children told them, informed their response to the consultation. Some organisations stated that they did not have capacity to do engagement work with women and children around this consultation, however they had a wealth of knowledge based on their front line experience of working with women and children. Some organisations said that regular feedback from clients and workers informed the development of their services and that the views of users was being taken into account on an ongoing basis.

Organisations who did not offer front line services, tended to say that feedback from partners and organisations who did provide such services was fed into their response.

Some examples of how the voices of women and children influenced organisations' consultation responses are given below.

“Our response is informed by our experience of working with women survivors of gender based violence, based on the issues they raise with us and the feedback they provide and by partnership working with other agencies working in this field.”

- Third Sector

“In responding to this consultation, we held a discussion session for [our] members. They were able to draw on the experiences, stories and views of the women, children and young people that they are working with (and have worked with in the past). Staff were able to share anonymised examples of where women, children and young people are currently being failed and where actions could be undertaken to help address some of the issues.”

- Third Sector

“Our policy positions are informed by LGBT young people through consultation, direct service delivery, and research. After initial research with LGBT young people, we consulted with them on their policy priorities for the current government to create our current manifesto: Improving the Lives of LGBTI Young People in Scotland: LGBT Youth Scotland’s Manifesto 2016-2021.”

- Third Sector

“[Our organisation] draws on the expertise and experience of staff working directly with individuals affected by violence against women. Regular service-user feedback and involvement ensures that our services and staff are always informed by the needs and views of service-users.”

- Third Sector

“[Our organisation] has established an advisory panel, made up of people who have personal experiences of domestic abuse who meet regularly to provide focused and specialist input to our strategy and development.”

- Third Sector

Some respondents used research, either that they had carried out themselves, or published research to inform their response. Research, including evaluations, and case studies, evidence based practice, including international best practice and professional learning fed into some responses. In some cases a combination of lived experience and more formal research were presented together within consultation responses.

“Additionally we have drawn on our annual Girls’ Attitudes Survey which collects the views of girls across the UK aged 7-21 who are both members and non-members.”

– Third Sector

“Our large hate crime project was developed with self-advocacy organisations, disabled people’s organisations and people with learning disabilities themselves. We have generated evidence in participation with people with learning disabilities.”

- Academic/research

“We have also based our consultation response on SCLD publications and a range of existing evidence and research.”

- Third Sector

“In responding to this consultation have drawn on evaluations of the specific services we have funded which support women, children and young people survivors of domestic abuse. These evaluations draw on the lived experience of Women, Children, Young People and families.”

- Third Sector

“We have also drawn on evidence based best practice from national and international sources.”
- Third Sector

Annex 1 – Tables

Table A1: Q2: Please tell us about any of the priority 1 actions that you are particularly supportive of.

Priority 1 Action	No.
Raising awareness and changing attitudes	31
Engage with the newly established Advisory Council on women and girls to explore issues around gender inequality and violence against women	3
Support initiatives to raise awareness amongst the wider population of violence against women and girls, including what causes it and how to challenge it	16
Through the Mentors in Violence Prevention programme, ensure that boys and men understand about positive healthy respectful relationships, are encouraged to stand up to violence, challenge attitudes and behaviours and tackle toxic masculinity	11
Raising awareness and changing attitudes – other comments	1
Childhood	55
Work with the education system and key stakeholders to develop a holistic approach towards addressing gender stereotypes and norms in schools and education settings	17
Develop a Skills Investment Plan for the Early Learning and Childcare sector which sets out the broad skills set within the workforce, identifies opportunities to widen the skill set and actions which will help tackle gender stereotypes within the sector.	4
Provide more support for teachers on equality issues, following the outcomes of the General Teaching Council Scotland review	4
Publish a refreshed approach to addressing bullying in schools, including bullying based on sexism and gender	9
Work with further and higher education institutions to contribute to this agenda both through learning and on campus, using the insights from ongoing work in Scottish Universities tackling gender based violence on campus, recommendations from the Universities UK Task Force on violence against women, and the University of Strathclyde “Equally Safe in Higher Education” Project	7
Childhood – other comments	14
Workplace	12
Refresh the Scottish Government’s corporate policy on violence against women, using the Zero Tolerance PACT Resource as a guide	4
Gather examples of best practice and develop support, guidance and incentives for employers	1
Workplace – other comments	7
Support all the actions	20
Other comments	14
	N= 63

Table A2: Q3. Please tell us about any priority 1 actions that you don't agree with

Priority 1 Action/Area	No.
None/support all	23
Raising awareness and changing attitudes	14
Engage with the newly established Advisory Council on women and girls to explore issues around gender inequality and violence against women	3
(Support initiatives to raise awareness amongst the wider population of violence against women and girls, including what causes it and how to challenge it	1
Through the Mentors in Violence Prevention programme, ensure that boys and men understand about positive healthy respectful relationships, are encouraged to stand up to violence, challenge attitudes and behaviours and tackle toxic masculinity	7
Develop a Skills Investment Plan for the Early Learning and Childcare sector which sets out the broad skills set within the workforce, identifies opportunities to widen the skill set and actions which will help tackle gender stereotypes within the sector.	2
Provide more support for teachers on equality issues, following the outcomes of the General Teaching Council Scotland review	1
Childhood	5
Publish a refreshed approach to addressing bullying in schools, including bullying based on sexism and gender	2
Childhood other comments	3
Workplace other comments	2
General comments	16
	N= 63

Table A3: Q4. Are there any actions that you think are missing under priority 1? - Do you have any suggestions for additional actions to focus on?¹

	Identified as missing	No.
No gaps		6
Raising awareness and changing attitudes suggestions		20
Say more on prevention/ Include wider prevention programmes beyond MVP, and roll MPV out further /fund for longer		14
More information needed on Advisory Council on Women and Girls		2
Childhood suggestions		57
Importance of Relationships, Sexual Health and Parenthood Education (RSHPE)		16
Bullying		6
Strengthen focus on early years		4
Whole school approach		3
More focus on trauma/impact of adverse childhood experiences		3
No mention of National Sexual Violence Prevention Programme		2
Standardised approach - not left to discretion of individual head teachers		2
Reword to “children and young people” or “children and adolescents”		2
Positive male role models		2
Higher education institutions need to do more to tackle VAW		6
Say more about FE/HE as training providers in relevant areas		3
Include non-school youth settings		3
Workplace suggestions		17
Widen out to include more employers in these actions		5
Health and safety concerns		2
Other suggestions of actions to include		15
The role of the media, including social media, online and advertising		6
Include consent		4
Who it should cover		15
Specific forms of violence to be addressed		17
Engagement and partnership working		44
Delivery		38
Wording of plan		26
		N =61

¹ Only comments made by more than one respondent have been included in the table.

Table A4: Q6. Please tell us about any of the priority 2 actions that you are particularly supportive of

Priority 2 Action	No.
Understanding gender	25
Improve strategic consideration of equality implications of spend for gender and other protected characteristics within the annual Equality Budgeting process	8
Develop a programme of engagement with key parts of Government to improve understanding of gender in policy making	7
Promote use of the Equality Impact Assessment tool at the national and local level to tackle inequality and discrimination across Scotland	10
Parenting and childcare	22
Create a new Best Start Grant that provides effective support at key transitions in the early years and ensures qualifying parents or carers receive more joined up support from pregnancy through to children starting school	5
Take forward a transformative programme to expand free Early Learning and Childcare entitlement to 1,140 hours per year by 2020, including piloting a deposit guarantee scheme for childcare places	8
Establish a "Returners" project so that parents who have had a career break can get help updating skills and knowledge	7
Parenting and childcare - other	2
Women's economic inequality	41
Ensure that the Developing the Young Workforce programme addresses issues of occupational segregation by gender, including addressing significant under representation in the take up of certain college courses and modern apprenticeships by women	5
Through the development of a strategy, address gender stereotyping and improve gender balance in science, technology, engineering and maths (STEM) at school to ensure greater uptake of courses and apprenticeships by women and girls that are traditionally seen as male-dominated like engineering, construction and digital	5
Develop proposals for delivering split payments under Universal Credit, working with stakeholders to scope out timescales	14
Under the Labour Market Strategy, work with key stakeholders to understand issues of occupational segregation and how to ensure greater equality within the labour market	2
Take action to tackle pay inequality, including funding to Close the Gap, and a reduction in the listed threshold of listed public authorities required to report from 150 employees to 20 employees	2
Tackle pregnancy and maternity discrimination in partnership with the Equality and Human Rights Commission by establishing a working group whose remit includes creating guidelines for employers to ensure best practice, as well as improving access to guidance for pregnancy women and new mothers	2
Ensure the successful bidder(s) to deliver devolved employment services demonstrate clearly how they will deliver a service that is gendered in terms of understanding the needs of women seeking employment; and use levers at their disposal to encourage employers to consider flexible working approaches which enable more women to take up a broader range of opportunities	3
Identify and promote practice that works in reducing employment inequality for minority ethnic women, including in career paths, recruitment, progression and retention	4
Women's economic inequality - other	4
Women's civic and social inequality	12
Establish an Equality in Sport and Physical Activity Forum and develop a £300K Gender Equality in Sport fund to address the barriers to women's participation	2
Introduce legislation to redress gender imbalances and improve women's representation on public boards in Scotland, using the new powers transferred to the Scottish Parliament through the Scotland Act	4
Champion our Partnership for Change campaign, encouraging private and third sector	2

organisations to work towards gender balance on their boards by 2020	2
Support the Women 50:50 campaign and the improvement of women's access to public office by encouraging partnership working to break down barriers to participation	2
Women's civic and social inequality - other	2
Support all of them	17
Other comments	18
	N=57

Table A5: Q7. Please tell us about any priority 2 actions that you don't agree with

Priority 2 Action/area	No.
None/support all	26
Understanding gender	2
Promote use of the Equality Impact Assessment tool at the national and local level to tackle inequality and discrimination across Scotland	2
Parenting and childcare	2
Take forward a transformative programme to expand free Early Learning and Childcare entitlement to 1,140 hours per year by 2020, including piloting a deposit guarantee scheme for childcare places	1
Establish a „Returners“ project so that parents who have had a career break can get help updating skills and knowledge	1
Women's economic inequality	6
Through the development of a strategy, address gender stereotyping and improve gender balance in science, technology, engineering and maths (STEM) at school to ensure greater uptake of courses and apprenticeships by women and girls that are traditionally seen as male-dominated like engineering, construction and digital	1
Ensure the successful bidder(s) to deliver devolved employment services demonstrate clearly how they will deliver a service that is gendered in terms of understanding the needs of women seeking employment; and use levers at their disposal to encourage employers to consider flexible working approaches which enable more women to take up a broader range of opportunities	1
Identify and promote practice that works in reducing employment inequality for minority ethnic women, including in career paths, recruitment, progression and retention	1
Women's economic inequality - other	3
Women's civic and social inequality	5
Establish an Equality in Sport and Physical Activity Forum and develop a £300K Gender Equality in Sport fund to address the barriers to women's participation	1
Introduce legislation to redress gender imbalances and improve women's representation on public boards in Scotland, using the new powers transferred to the Scottish Parliament through the Scotland Act	1
Champion our Partnership for Change campaign, encouraging private and third sector organisations to work towards gender balance on their boards by 2020	1
Support the Women 50:50 campaign and the improvement of women's access to public office by encouraging partnership working to break down barriers to participation	2
Other	19
Actions not specific enough don't go far enough /not sure they will meet the objectives	7
Don't see an immediate link between certain actions and tackling VAW	6
	N = 43

Table A6: Q8 Are there any actions that you think are missing under priority 2? - Do you have any suggestions for additional actions to focus on?²

	Identified as missing	No.
Nothing/ no gaps		3
Understanding gender		12
Improve strategic consideration of equality implications of spend for gender and other protected characteristics within the annual Equality Budgeting process		2
Develop a programme of engagement with key parts of Government to improve understanding of gender in policy making		3
Promote use of the Equality Impact Assessment tool at the national and local level to tackle inequality and discrimination across Scotland		4
Understanding gender - other		3
Parenting and childcare		9
Actions around fathers being more involved in unpaid labour and care		4
Establish a "Returners" project so that parents who have had a career break can get help updating skills and knowledge		2
Actions relating to pregnancy - such as young mums staying on at school		2
Women's economic inequality		46
Change work place culture, attitudes and challenge stereotypes - under-representation of either gender in work force, value traditionally female roles and encourage men into traditionally female roles		9
Wider structural changes - Improve wages, promote living wage, improve terms and conditions job security, increase women's purchasing power		6
Scrap DWP "rape clause" 2 child cap on child benefit		4
Tackle pregnancy and maternity discrimination in partnership with the Equality and Human Rights Commission by establishing a working group whose remit includes creating guidelines for employers to ensure best practice, as well as improving access to guidance for pregnancy women and new mothers		4
Promote flexible working for both men and women, including uptake of shared parental leave		4
Women with no recourse to public funds (NRPF)		3
Action on sexual harassment in the work place		2
Be more explicit about the barriers women face in engaging in the workplace		2
Inequalities/barriers in education can lead to barriers and inequalities in the workplace		2
Introduce an "Equally Safe Kite Mark / Charter Mark" for employers		2
Women's civic and social inequality		15
Establish an Equality in Sport and Physical Activity Forum and develop a £300K Gender Equality in Sport fund to address the barriers to women's participation		7
Widen out to include charity and community boards and participation in volunteering		5
Actions to keep women safe, including in public spaces		6
Cultural shift in attitudes		6
The role of the media, including social media, online and advertising		2
Legislation change		2
Who it should cover		28
Engagement and partnership working		15

² Only comments made by more than one respondent have been included in the table

Delivery	12
Wording of plan	22
	N=51

Table A7: Q10 Please tell us about any of the priority 3 actions that you are particularly supportive of.

Priority 3 Action	No.
Public Services	104
Ensure court waiting times for domestic abuse cases and sexual offences cases in solemn proceedings are in line with agreed targets	10
Agree with the Scottish Courts and Tribunals Service opportunities for managing how domestic abuse cases are progressed within Scotland, including the consideration of Domestic Abuse courts and case management solutions where a Domestic Abuse Court is not considered appropriate	6
Improve the experience of vulnerable witnesses, initially focusing on child complainers and witnesses through the greater use of pre-recorded evidence	15
Expand the Medics Against Violence Ask, Support, Care programme to train more healthcare students, NHS staff and non-health care professions to spot, document and respond to the signs of potential abuse	3
Improve the provision of services for all victims of sexual assault who require a forensic examination as part of an overall health focussed assessment - including considering the best models for delivery, consistency of approach and workforce planning issues to ensure that victims are provided with the examiner of the gender they prefer.	9
Work with Health Boards to ensure that they are ready for the implementation of National Standards in this area developed by Healthcare Improvement Scotland	3
Review the way forensic examinations are undertaken (including models of practice, consistency of approach and workforce planning) to ensure they are done appropriately and sensitively, with a view to better implementation of the National Minimum Standards in this area	4
Consider how learning from the National Trauma Training Framework can be incorporated to better inform the development of services, and identify leadership in the justice system to take this forward	7
Ensure that commissioned training resources of local authority housing and homelessness hubs incorporate domestic abuse competence	8
Develop options for funding supported housing, including domestic abuse refuge providers, to ensure that they continue to receive appropriate resources for their work	5
Develop draft violence against women quality standards for public services responding to victims and survivors	4
Identify and take forward approaches which will strengthen the social work response to domestic abuse	5
Reform the anonymous voter registration scheme, making it more accessible to survivors of domestic abuse	2
Share lessons from the "Safe and Together" model of child protection in a domestic abuse setting, encouraging a common understanding that perpetrators of abuse should be assessed and held accountable on their parenting choices which includes the perpetration of domestic abuse	13
Other Justice Comments	7
Other health comments	2
Other public Services Comments	1
Specialist Services	37
Initiate an independent review of how national and local specialist services for women and children experiencing gender based violence are commissioned, and how we can ensure quality and sustainability of service.	14
Commission the development of a sustainable model of training around gender based violence for public and third sector services	11
Consider the findings from the National Advocacy Scoping Exercise commissioned to help understand the provision of services in this area with the aim to determine where the provision of services could be extended and improved	7

Develop the Scottish Women’s Rights Centre as a model for legal services, consider the currently unmet need for victims of gender based violence and the appropriate model of support for women, children and young people experiencing violence	5
Integrated services	16
Consult on how to embed consistent and effective operation of multi-agency structures to support high risk victims of domestic abuse	9
Support local violence against women partnerships in their improvement journey, and work to ensure that every local authority in Scotland has a high performing partnership linked to other local structures	7
Supportive of all	11
Other Comments	17
	N =

Table A8: Q11 Please tell us about any priority 3 actions that you don't agree with

	Identified as missing	No.
No gaps		19
Public Services		13
Develop the health service response to preventing and tackling violence against women using the World Health Organisation's resolution on gender based violence as a framework		2
The 3 forensic examination actions		1
Expand the Medics Against Violence Ask, Support, Care programme to train more healthcare students, NHS staff and non-health care professions to spot, document and respond to the signs of potential abuse		4
Consider how learning from the National Trauma Training Framework can be incorporated to better inform the development of services, and identify leadership in the justice system to take this forward		1
Ensure that commissioned training resources of local authority housing and homelessness hubs incorporate domestic abuse competence		1
Reform the anonymous voter registration scheme, making it more accessible to survivors of domestic abuse		1
Share lessons from the „Safe and Together“ model of child protection in a domestic abuse setting, encouraging a common understanding that perpetrators of abuse should be assessed and held accountable on their parenting choices which includes the perpetration of domestic abuse		2
Health Other		1
Specialist Services		7
Initiate an independent review of how national and local specialist services for women and children experiencing gender based violence are commissioned, and how we can ensure quality and sustainability of service.		1
Commission the development of a sustainable model of training around gender based violence for public and third sector services		5
Develop the Scottish Women's Rights Centre as a model for legal services, consider the currently unmet need for victims of gender based violence and the appropriate model of support for women, children and young people experiencing violence"		1
All forms		2
Delivery		1
Who it should cover		6
Wording of plan		14
		N=48

Table A9: Q12 Are there any actions that you think are missing under priority 3?³

	Identified as missing	No.
Public Services		66
Ensure court waiting times for domestic abuse cases and sexual offences cases in solemn proceedings are in line with agreed targets		3
Improve the experience of vulnerable witnesses, initially focusing on child complainers and witnesses through the greater use of pre-recorded evidence		3
Develop the health service response to preventing and tackling violence against women using the World Health Organisation's resolution on gender based violence as a framework		3
Review the way forensic examinations are undertaken (including models of practice, consistency of approach and workforce planning) to ensure they are done appropriately and sensitively, with a view to better implementation of the National Minimum Standards in this area		3
Consider how learning from the National Trauma Training Framework can be incorporated to better inform the development of services, and identify leadership in the justice system to take this forward		3
Ensure that commissioned training resources of local authority housing and homelessness hubs incorporate domestic abuse competence		4
Develop options for funding supported housing, including domestic abuse refuge providers, to ensure that they continue to receive appropriate resources for their work		5
Identify and take forward approaches which will strengthen the social work response to domestic abuse		6
Develop draft violence against women quality standards for public services responding to victims and survivors		2
Share lessons from the „Safe and Together“ model of child protection in a domestic abuse setting, encouraging a common understanding that perpetrators of abuse should be assessed and held accountable on their parenting choices which includes the perpetration of domestic abuse		3
Other Justice suggestions		19
Other health suggestions		6
Other public services suggestions		3
Specialist Services		15
Initiate an independent review of how national and local specialist services for women and children experiencing gender based violence are commissioned, and how we can ensure quality and sustainability of service.		5
Advocacy		6
Other specialist services suggestions		2
Integrated services		16
Multi-Agency Risk Assessment Conferences (MARAC)		11
Improve multi-agency working for other types of VAW, not just domestic abuse		3
Other integrated services suggestions		2
Other Suggestions		43
Training for professionals		28
Education		6
The role of the internet in exploiting women		2
Changing legislation around women's equality/ and around domestic abuse		2

³ Only comments made by more than one respondent have been included in the table

Who it should cover	22
What it should cover - Include all forms of VAW (including honour based violence, FGM, forced marriage, rape, child sexual abuse, human trafficking and CSE, stalking)	23
Engagement and partnership working	18
Delivery	15
Wording of plan	11
	N= 66

Table A10: Q14. Please tell us about any of the priority 4 actions that you are particularly supportive of.

Priority 4 Action	No.
Tackling Perpetrators	60
Encourage victims of gender based violence to report it to the Police	8
Introduce a Domestic Abuse Bill to Parliament which seeks to criminalise coercive control	11
Review training provided for all professionals within the Justice System to ensure that there is an understanding of the new offence for those investigating domestic abuse cases including trauma informed practice for all people who work with women and children	12
Work with the Scottish Civil Justice Council on case management in family actions, including in relation to child welfare hearings - recognising that these types of hearings and contact cases require careful consideration to ensure that victims of domestic abuse are protected from further abuse	10
Commence the Abusive Behaviour and Sexual Harm (Scotland) Act	5
Continue to look at perpetrator programmes and consider where further efforts are required to identify and tackle behaviour with a view to rehabilitation and change	13
Develop multi agency domestic homicide reviews with Police Scotland and partners learning from practice in other jurisdictions which have allowed for improvement in practice	1
Supportive of all	18
	N =53

Table A11: Q15. Please tell us about any priority 4 actions that you don't agree with.

Priority 4 actions that aren't supported	No.
None/Support all	21
Encourage victims of gender based violence to report it to the Police	6
Other - Actions need to be clarified/ go further /stronger wording /more details on how they will be achieved	9
	N= 36

Table A12: Q16. Are there any actions that you think are missing under priority 4?⁴

Identified as missing	No.
Tackling Perpetrators suggestions	49
Encourage victims of gender based violence to report it to the Police	4
Review training provided for all professionals within the Justice System to ensure that there is an understanding of the new offence for those investigating domestic abuse cases including trauma informed practice for all people who work with women and children	14
Work with the Scottish Civil Justice Council on case management in family actions, including in relation to child welfare hearings - recognising that these types of hearings and contact cases require careful consideration to ensure that victims of domestic abuse are protected from further abuse	4
Continue to look at perpetrator programmes and consider where further efforts are required to identify and tackle behaviour with a view to rehabilitation and change	20
The need for early intervention with perpetrators	5
Include sexual offenders	2
Other suggestions	35
Actions relating to justice/ courts/prisons	11
Early education to tackle attitudes / zero tolerance approach to bullying	8
More support for children and young people as victims	4
Cross reference with workplace policies	3
Multi-agency interventions	3
Support for different types of perpetrators	14
Actions for women as perpetrators	7
Support for children and young people as perpetrators	5
Need to focus on all violence against women, not just domestic abuse	33
Who it should cover	4
Engagement and partnership working	7
Delivery	3
	N =59

⁴ Only comments made by more than one respondent have been included in the table

Table A13: Q18. Please tell us about any of the cross cutting actions that you are particularly supportive of

Cross Cutting Action	No
A human rights framework	41
Supportive of human rights approach generally (rather than mentioning a specific human rights action)	15
Support Eilidh Whiteford MP's Private Members Bill on ratification of the Istanbul Convention and press the UK Government to set out a clear timetable for ratification	6
Publish a report setting out what we are doing to implement the Istanbul Convention in Scotland	7
Continue to put human rights right at the heart of our approach to government, and work with civil society to safeguard both the Human Rights Act and the human rights and equality protections set out in EU law	6
Align with Scotland's National Action Plan for Human Rights, and reflect concluding observations from international human rights treaty bodies and reviews undertaken by the UN Human Rights Council, as they are brought forward	3
Tackle violence against women and girls through our International Development work in sub-Saharan African countries through project work and by contributing to UN conventions to ensure that women are empowered politically, economically, socially and culturally	2
Based on the principles of UN Security Council Resolution 13252, we will fund training and capacity building for at least fifty women annually from conflict affected regions, ensuring they have the skills and confidence to maximise their contribution to building a safer world	2
All Forms	50
Hold an event comprising key stakeholder to look how we better tackle online hate and misogyny	6
Build the gendered analysis into the implementation of Scotland's first Human Trafficking Strategy, ensuring that interventions recognise the particular inequalities women who are trafficked experience	9
Engage with stakeholders on the findings of research into the evidence as to the impact of criminalising the purchase of sex	3
Commission a mapping of exit routes, to inform guidance to public and third sector organisations on how to support women experiencing commercial sexual exploitation including prostitution	7
Implement Scotland's National Action Plan on preventing and eradicating female genital mutilation	5
Develop multi-agency national guidelines for tackling female genital mutilation	5
Engage with stakeholders on the recommendations of the research into Forced Marriage in Scotland published at the end of January 2017.	5
Hold a forced marriage case study workshop for public and third sector organisations to raise awareness of good practice and challenges	5
Improve the process of applying for a Forced Marriage Protection Order	6
All Women	21
Include a requirement for lesbian, bisexual and transgender women and girls inclusion plans in our funded services, to ensure they can access support	5
Ask the disabled people's panel within Scotland's Disability Delivery Plan to help us identify steps to tackle violence against disabled women and girls	5
Ask black and minority ethnic representatives to help us to identify specific steps to tackle violence against BME women and girls	7
Ensure that our objectives in Equally Safe are aligned with our future approach to refugee integration in Scotland	4
All Children	35
Supportive of the "All Children" approach generally (rather than mentioning a specific "all children" action)	3

Take forward a programme of action to ensure that vulnerable children (including those who have experienced domestic abuse) get access to the right help at the right time	5
Continue to implement the National Action Plan to Prevent and Tackle Child Sexual Exploitation, published in March 2016	4
Publish a refreshed action plan on child internet safety to ensure appropriate training, support and information is in place for professionals, children, young people and their families	3
Ensure the Domestic Abuse Bill effectively acknowledges the impact that domestic abuse can have on children through the operation of a statutory aggravation to the new offence of domestic abuse	5
Consult on the terms of the child cruelty and neglect offence contained in the Children and Young Persons Act 1937, including whether the offence requires to be modernised to include emotional and psychological abuse and archaic language removed	3
Develop understanding of the experience of domestic abuse by children in poverty, using this to inform the approach to tackling child poverty	3
Ensure that children's interests are better reflected in the justice system and that their voice is heard	5
Consider the application of lessons from various international examples of the "Barnahus" concept for child victims and how these could potentially apply within the Scottish context	4
Accountability	3
Embed the Sustainable Development Goals – including Goal 5, which calls for gender equality and the true empowerment of women and girls – in Scotland Performs	3
Participation	6
Support a pilot programme of participation with affected groups of women, children and young people	5
Capture the learning from participation approaches to inform future work in this area	1
Supportive of all	8
	N = 47

Table A14: Q19. Please tell us about any cross cutting actions that you don't agree with.

Cross cutting actions that aren't supported	No.
None/support all	21
Unhelpful to have cross cutting actions separate from the priority actions / these actions should be integrated into the priorities	13
Actions need to be strengthened / go further	5
More clarity/detail needed on certain actions and how they will be delivered	2
Actions relating to Human Rights Actions and legal duties don't belong here	1
	N = 35

Table A15:Q20. Are there any cross cutting actions that you think are missing?

	Identified as missing	No.
Human Rights Framework		18
Impact of Brexit - on Human rights and those with no recourse to public funds		11
Be more explicit about children and the rights of the child/incorporate UNCRC		6
All Forms of Violence		30
Stronger actions on commercial sexual exploitation (CSE)		15
Internet harm/ pornography		8
Stalking		3
All Women		23
Inclusion of intersectionality with all protected characteristics and other vulnerabilities / Remove the barriers around "hard to reach" women		9
Different life stages, including Older women		3
LGBTI		2
Learning Disabilities		3
Ask black and minority ethnic representatives to help us to identify specific steps to tackle violence against BME women and girls		2
All Children		31
Need holistic approach to childhood sexual abuse		9
Support for adult survivors of childhood sexual abuse		4
Ensure that children's interests are better reflected in the justice system and that their voice is heard - go further include civil courts and wider policy		4
Ensure the Domestic Abuse Bill effectively acknowledges the impact that domestic abuse can have on children through the operation of a statutory aggravation to the new offence of domestic abuse		3
Consider the application of lessons from various international examples of the "Barnahus" concept for child victims and how these could potentially apply within the Scottish context		3
Look at link between domestic abuse and neglect, not domestic abuse and poverty		2
Take action on "justifiable assault" (children being slapped in the home)		2
Include looked after children		2
Participation		4
Support a pilot programme of participation with affected groups of women, children and young people		3
Other Suggestions		13
Gendered approach to VAW/ Gendered analysis of abuse needed		7
Training for professionals		2
Engagement and Partnership working		11
Involve third sector/ women's and children's sector		4
Involve those with lived experience / those with particular protected characteristics		2
Local level partnership working		2
Delivery		22
Wording of plan		17
		N = 50

Table A16: Q25. What role could your organisation have in contributing to this delivery plan?

Role organisation could play	No.
Provide training /guidance	20
Co-ordinating/contributing to work on VAW/GBV at a local level as key part of what they do	18
Awareness raising/Promoting key messages from Equally Safe to members and wider society	16
Developing the evidence base /knowledge base, sharing good practice, improving practice	15
Providing support/delivering services to women, children, families affected by VAW	14
Willing to engage with SG/Participate in stakeholder discussion	13
Accountability and performance measurement /evaluation and review	10
Provides a voice to their members to contribute to the discussion	10
Campaigning for/working towards the implementation of policies and legislation	3
Co-ordinating VAW work with other work streams	3
Delivering services aimed at perpetrators	3
Capacity building work	2
Part of the Equally Safe Workstreams/responsible for some of the actions	1
Funding organisations to deliver work	1
Role of organisation as employer	1
Through engagement work	1
Providing support for men affected by DA	1
Suggestions for what organisations need from the SG in order to be able to contribute	9
	N= 59

Table A17: Q26. In responding to this consultation, how are you drawing on the experiences and views of the women, children and young people who access your organisation?

How the experiences and views of the women, children and young people were drawn upon in consultation responses	No.
Based on expertise in the field and reflecting the views of those with work with (service users, service providers, workers and partnership organisations)	39
Used research/evaluation/case studies information on evidence based practice, and professional learning	11
Through an equalities committee	3
Through gender based training	1
	N= 49

Annex 2 – List of organisations who responded

Aberlour
Abused Men In Scotland
Action Against Stalking
Angus Women's Aid
ASSIST
Barnardo's Scotland
Befriending Networks
Building Equality Project
Care Inspectorate
CEDAR Scottish Advisory Partnership
CELCIS (Centre for Excellence for looked after children in Scotland)
Central Advocacy Partners
Children 1st
Children in Scotland
Christian Action Research and Education (CARE)
Close the Gap
Coalition for Racial Equality and Rights with support from Sikh Sanjog
Criminal Justice Voluntary Sector Forum (CJVSF)
Dumfries and Galloway Domestic Abuse and Violence Against Women Partnership (D&GDAVAWP)
Dumfries and Galloway Health and Wellbeing, NHS Dumfries and Galloway
Dundee VAW Partnership
East Ayrshire Violence Against Women Partnership (EAVAWP)
East Lothian and Midlothian Violence Against Women Partnership (part of the East Lothian and Midlothian Public Protection Committee)

East Renfrewshire Violence Against Women and Girls Partnership
Engender
Equality Network
Equally Safe in Higher Education - University of Strathclyde
Falkirk Council
Fife Violence Against Women Partnership
Girlguiding Scotland
Glasgow Violence Against Women Partnership
Highland Violence Against Women Partnership
Homeless Action Scotland
Includem
Joint response, being made on behalf of - The Clackmannanshire VAW Partnership, The Stirling GBV Partnership, The Clackmannanshire/Stirling Child Protection Committee, The Clackmannanshire/Stirling Adult Support & Protection Committee, The Clackmannanshire/Stirling Alcohol & Drug Partnership

JustRight Scotland
LGBT Youth Scotland
National Day Nurseries Association
National Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Children (NSPCC)
National VAW Network
NHS Ayrshire & Arran Gender Based Violence Group
NHS Education for Scotland (NES)
NHS Health Scotland
North Lanarkshire Violence Against Women Working Group
Rape and Sexual Abuse Centre, Perth & Kinross (RASAC P&K)
Rape Crisis Scotland
Relationships Scotland
Renfrewshire Gender Based Violence Strategy Group
respectme, Scotland's Anti-Bullying Service
Royal College of Nursing Scotland

Sacro
SafeLives
SAY Women
Scottish Association of Social Work (part of BASW UK)
Scottish Borders Council
Scottish Commission for Learning Disability
Scottish Courts and Tribunal Service
Scottish Fire and Rescue Service
Scottish Trade Union Congress (STUC)
Scottish Women's Rights Centre
Scottish Women's Convention
SEStran
Shakti Women's Aid
Social Work Scotland
South Ayrshire Multi Agency Partnership To Tackle Violence Against Women and Children
South Lanarkshire Gender-Based Violence Partnership
Stirling Council
Stirling Gender Based Violence Partnership
The Big Lottery Fund
The Educational Institute of Scotland
The Reward Foundation
The Scottish Learning Disabilities Observatory
Together (Scottish Alliance for Children's Rights)
Unite
Wellbeing Scotland (Formerly Open Secret)
Women's Support Project
Zero Tolerance

Separate submissions were also received from Scottish Human Rights Commission and Scottish Women's Aid. Although these have not been incorporated into this consultation analysis, they have been considered along with the points raised by the individual consultation responses.



Scottish Government
Riaghaltas na h-Alba
gov.scot

© Crown copyright 2017

OGL

This publication is licensed under the terms of the Open Government Licence v3.0 except where otherwise stated. To view this licence, visit nationalarchives.gov.uk/doc/open-government-licence/version/3 or write to the Information Policy Team, The National Archives, Kew, London TW9 4DU, or email: psi@nationalarchives.gsi.gov.uk.

Where we have identified any third party copyright information you will need to obtain permission from the copyright holders concerned.

This publication is available at www.gov.scot

Any enquiries regarding this publication should be sent to us at
The Scottish Government
St Andrew's House
Edinburgh
EH1 3DG

ISBN: 978-1-78851-391-3 (web only)

Published by The Scottish Government, November 2017

Produced for The Scottish Government by APS Group Scotland, 21 Tennant Street, Edinburgh EH6 5NA
PPDAS321086 (11/17)

W W W . G O V . S C O T